ABSTRACT

Laura C. Bethea, CHANGE AGENTS IN A MULTICULTURAL WORLD: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CULTURAL COMPETENCE TRAINING FOR TITLE IX COORDINATORS (Under the direction of Dr. David Siegel). Department of Educational Leadership, May 2022.

With our increasingly diverse college communities, the impact of racial and gender-based sexuality stereotypes and stigmas in decision-making, and societal perceptions regarding Title IX-related issues, it is an opportune time for higher education to explore the cultural competence of Title IX Coordinators. This study aims to address ways in which three cultural competence training programs converge and diverge on various dynamic aspects, advance the cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators, and impact the evolution of professional development. Method triangulation was used in this qualitative study to support data collection through semi-interviews, supporting documentation, and observation. The findings revealed that the COVID-19 pandemic, in addition to racial and social justice cases and movements in 2020, informed the development, implementation, evaluation, and evolution of the organizations' cultural competence training. Additionally, study participants expressed the importance of utilizing formalized processes to guide their processes, inclusive of equity-driven data, internal reviews, support from partnering organizations, and integration of technology and virtual learning. Recommendations included devising a benchmarking strategy to examine other training organizations' metrics and performance indicators, incorporating strategic planning measures to support long-term direction, reinforcing Title IX Coordinators' learning experiences beyond the training, and investigating the long-term impact of training.

CHANGE AGENTS IN A MULTICULTURAL WORLD: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CULTURAL COMPETENCE TRAINING FOR TITLE IX COORDINATORS

A Dissertation

Presented to

The Faculty of the Department of Educational Leadership

East Carolina University

In Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree

Doctor of Education in Educational Leadership

by

Laura C. Bethea

May 2022

©Copyright 2022
Laura C. Bethea

CHANGE AGENTS IN A MULTICULTURAL WORLD: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CULTURAL COMPETENCE TRAINING FOR TITLE IX COORDINATORS

by

Laura C. Bethea

APPROVED BY:

DIRECTOR OF DISSERTATION:_____
David Siegel, PhD

COMMITTEE MEMBER:_____
Crystal Chambers, PhD

COMMITTEE MEMBER:_____
Karen Jones, PhD

COMMITTEE MEMBER:_____
Regina Williams, PhD

CHAIR OF THE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP:

_____
Marjorie Ringler, EdD

DEAN OF THE GRADUATE SCHOOL:

_____
Paul Gemperline, PhD

DEDICATION

I thank and praise you, God of my ancestors: You have given me wisdom and power, you have made known to me what we asked of you, you have made known to us the dream of the king.

Daniel 2:23

This body of work is a tribute to my ancestors paving the way for this destined journey. It serves as the conduit to all that is yet to be achieved as I stand poised upon their shoulders. I specifically salute and pay homage to the matriarchs and patriarchs of my beloved Bethea, Stephens, Campbell, McRae, and Lewis families as you have led with courageous hearts and kindred spirits. My research expedition is dedicated especially to you!

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

With a grateful heart, I send heartfelt appreciation to East Carolina University for granting me memorable opportunities to illuminate my light. As I reflect upon my academic journey, the scripture “To whom much is given, much is required” (Luke 12:48) resonates in such a compelling, powerful way! I lean on these words of wisdom to acknowledge from whence my support comes from to embrace the road less travelled.

To the Betheas, my parents (Ken and Katherine), thank you for serving as my unwavering support system and foundation from which all has prevailed. Because of you, I am. To my brother and sister-in-law (Keith and Chowan), thank you for embracing me with your spirit of resiliency and relentless encouragement; they have sustained me along this journey. Gregory, thank you for serving as the rock that kept me anchored and rooted in the mission. For these selfless acts and beyond, I’m eternally grateful. Thank you!

To my “Dream Team” Dissertation Committee, you set the bar on promoting student success. I appreciate you for leading this journey, Dr. Siegel. Your wisdom has guided me along a path of enhanced self-awareness and understanding. Dr. Chambers, Dr. Jones, and Dr. Williams, your devoted time and insight applied to this process are cherished beyond measure. Thank you!

To my devoted extended families, my hometown, Lumberton (Southside/41), and Robeson County communities, powerhouse mentor and friends, your endless support and prayers have been received and wholeheartedly embraced. Thank you!

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
TITLE……	i
COPYRIGHT……	ii
SIGNATURE……	iii
DEDICATION……...	iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS……...	v
LIST OF TABLES…….	x
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION……..	1
Background…….…….	5
Race and Ethnicity…….	6
Gender and Sexual Orientation……..	9
Religion……..	10
Abilities/Disabilities……..	11
Age…….	12
Socioeconomic Status……	12
Context of the Study……	13
Statement of the Problem……	16
Guiding Questions……...	18
Overview of Inquiry……	18
Theoretical Framework Overview……...	19
Definition of Key Terms……..	20
Assumptions……	23

Scope and Delimitations…….. 25

Limitations……... 26

Significance of the Research Study……. 27

Organization of the Study…… 30

Summary…….. 31

CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF LITERATURE……. 32

Theoretical Framework…… 32

Historical Context of the Development of Cultural Competence…… 39

Alignment of Multiculturalism and Social Justice…… 42

Advocacy Competencies……... 45

Infusion of Multicultural Competencies into Student Affairs……... 51

Overview of Title IX Legislation…… 55

Role of Title IX Professional Associations and Organizations……... 65

The Impact of Racial and Gender-Based Sexuality Stereotypes and Perceptions……... 68

Summary…….. 70

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY……. 73

Guiding Questions……... 73

Inquiry Design and Rationale…….. 74

Case Selection…… 77

Structure for Comparative Analysis…….. 77

Ethical Considerations……... 78

Inquiry Procedures……... 78

Description of the Participants and Recruitment Strategies…….. 79

Instrumentation…….. 80

Data Analysis……. 81

Inquiry Design and Rigor…… 81

Summary…….. 82

CHAPTER 4: DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS…… 84

Demographic Data……... 85

Training Content…….. 86

Data Collection Process…….……. 93

The Coding Process……. 93

Findings……... 104

The Connectivity of Cultural Competence Training with DEI……. 107

Innovation in Teaching and Learning Practices…… 115

The Influence of an Evaluative Process……. 121

Summary…….. 126

CHAPTER 5: SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS……. 130

Study Approach……... 133

Study Sites……... 135

Study Participants…… 136

Results of the Study……. 136

The Connectivity of Cultural Competence Training with DEI……. 137

Innovation in Teaching and Learning Practices…… 138

The Influence of an Evaluative Process……. 139

Strategic Planning…….. 140

Competition……... 140

Limitations of the Study…….. 141

Implications for Higher Education…….. 143

Implications for Theory……... 144

Recommendations for Future Research……... 145

Conclusion……... 151

REFERENCES…….. 155

APPENDIX A: INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD APPROVAL……. 185

APPENDIX B: INTERVIEW PROTOCOL……. 186

APPENDIX C: STUDY INFORMATION GUIDE FOR INTERVIEWS…… 188

LIST OF TABLES

1. Participant Profile Summary……... 87

2. Training Program Description……...…….. 89

3. Training Program Profile Summary …… 98

4. Themes, Subthemes, Research Questions, and Descriptors……. 105

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

With the ever-increasing diversity in the U.S. population, cultural pluralism, and the impact of its changing demographics, it is prime time for the field of higher education to explore cultural competence training as a mandate for Title IX Coordinators. Significant factors such as individualized beliefs and attitudes as well as societal perceptions may influence professional practice and connections with various cultural groups (Lee, 2012). This notion can be generalized to Title IX Coordinators in their culturally competent service delivery within the realm of overseeing investigations, case decisions, hearing procedures, and appeal processes.

According to the Department of Education's Final Title IX Rule, all institutions receiving federal funding must designate at least one employee to coordinate Title IX compliance efforts, and this employee must be referred to as the "Title IX Coordinator" (U.S. Department of Education, 2020c). From the inception of an allegation to a case's final decision, the Title IX Coordinator is responsible for overseeing the entire investigation process to address allegations of sex discrimination (including sexual harassment and pregnancy issues) (Federal Register, 2020). According to the U.S. Department of Education (2020d), higher education institutions must ensure that their Title IX personnel (inclusive of Title IX Coordinators) gain training as follows:

- Title IX's definition of "sexual harassment" in higher education;
- the scope of the school's education program or activity;
- how to conduct an investigation and grievance process;
- how to serve impartially, including by avoiding prejudgment of the facts at issue; and
- how to avoid conflicts of interest and bias. (U.S. Department of Education, 2020c)

Eells and Rockland-Miller (2011) also recognize that mental health concerns, violence, and the need for risk assessment on higher education campuses are growing. Increasingly, research notes that college campuses have been placed at significant risk for violent attacks; therefore, it is vital to train professionals to assess situations and evaluate students in crisis through both ethical and legal methods (Davenport, 2010). Repeated incidents of sexual violence occurring at higher education institutions require teams of professionals to work collaboratively to effectively and efficiently assess individuals who present disturbing behavior on college campuses (Keller et al., 2011).

Within this scope of cultural competence, it is significant that Critical Whiteness Studies (CWS) are explored to examine the delineations of whiteness as a discourse and how systems of power and oppression influence these processes with People of Color. W. E. B. DuBois has been credited with conducting the first CWS analysis in his 1920 essay “The Souls of White Folk” complemented by commentary devised by James Baldwin including “White Guilt” and “On Being White and Other Lies” in the mid to late 1900s (Cabrera et al., 2017; Foste & Irwin, 2020). Within the realm of higher education, conceptual components of CWS identify whiteness in five dimensions: colorblindness, epistemologies of ignorance, ontological expansiveness, property, and assumed racial comfort (or racial “safety”) (Cabrera et al., 2017). James Baldwin outlined the problematic dynamics of CWS being misidentified in terms of racial marginalization his quote as follows:

> Therefore, a vast amount of the energy that goes into what we call the Negro problem is produced by the white man's profound desire not to be judged by those who are not white, not to be seen as he is, and at the same time a vast amount of the white anguish is

> rooted in the white man's equally profound need to be seen as he is, to be released from the tyranny of his mirror. (Baldwin, 1963, p. 109)

In considering application of this notion to higher education, a parallel dynamic exists for underrepresented minorities due to concurrently overrepresented majority students. Similarly to Baldwin's ideology, Harper (2012) highlights that higher education scholars have analyzed racism without considering racism and racial inequities without origin. It is suggested that White people are restrained to framing racial inequality as White privilege to avoid implication in the process and place the onus on personal responsibility (Unzueta & Lowery, 2008).

With such complicated racial dynamics at the table, the task of exploring interpersonal Whiteness in higher education is challenging, with denial of racism being one of the most persistent reason (Bonilla-Silva, 2006). Such research reveals the concept of systematic levels defining and guiding individual interactions within college communities while unintentionally recreating the existing racial paradigm (Cabrera et al., 2017; Foste & Irwin, 2020). The racial mirror that is presented in these concepts is reflective of the state of racial realities and identified as a contributing factor to culturally competent service delivery to diverse college communities by Title IX Coordinators.

Feminism has been traditionally viewed as a social movement with the goal to eliminate all forms of oppression experienced by women, primarily within the context of political rights for middle- and upper-class women as outlined by first wave feminism (Kesselman et al., 2012). The impact of second and third wave feminism upon diverse college communities is of value to the cultural competence of Title IX Coordinators. Second wave feminism is perceived as a feminist ideology primarily focused on the liberation of women and structural disparities of women living in a patriarchic setting while third wave feminism explores personal

empowerment, varied experiences of gendered oppression, and the contingency of privileges (Schuster, 2017; Gray & Boddy, 2010; Holmes, 2000). Although second wave feminism campaigns for legal and social equality for women and advocating for civil rights and the end of violence against women (Kesselman et al., 2012; Srivastava et al., 2017), it is significant to avoid labeling this wave of feminism as “racist or anti-men” in its entirety (Evans & Chamberlain, 2015). Additionally, as third wave feminism promotes sex-positive feminism or sexually liberal feminism (Kesselman et al., 2012; Srivastava et al., 2017), it does not seek to classify this wave as “naive and retrogressive” in totality (Evans & Chamberlain, 2015).

It is noted that the first and second feminism waves did not offer the intersectionality of gender, race, class, and sexual orientation within its focus; however, out of this exclusion, third wave feminism was derived and became inclusive of these aspects with marginalized populations (Kesselman et al., 2012; Taylor, 1998). It is suggested that the unification of the varied waves of feminism taps into a defining purpose of intellectual obligation and political actions which eradicate all aspects of sexism and violence toward women (Evans & Chamberlain, 2015). It is noted that inclusivity has become an integral component of the feminist agenda wherein there is significant discourse of privilege (Evans & Chamberlain, 2015). Such an agenda aligns with aspects in CWS which frame racial inequality as White privilege. In considering feminism perspectives, it is imperative to apply the notion of inclusivity in Title IX practices and service delivery.

Title IX Coordinators are challenged to recognize the components of diversity within a culturally competent framework. The professionals renderoning these services must integrate culture-specific strategies which include enhancing awareness, gaining knowledge, and incorporating skills among diversified populations, experiences and perspectives, among other

factors (Castellanos & Gloria, 2007). Various contributing factors to these outcomes include professionals' biases and stereotypes, time commitments to address and resolve issues, and limited knowledge in supporting diverse populations. Professional development focused on cultural competence has been considered challenging in higher education as it requires vision and a commitment to advance cultural proficiency (Calvillo et al., 2009).

It was observed that the terms cultural competence and multicultural competence have been used interchangeably in the research review (Dickson et al., 2016; Spanierman et al., 2011). Bradford et al. (2000) synthesized existing descriptions and definitions of intercultural competence and concluded that intercultural communication competence and intercultural effectiveness have also been used interchangeably in literature; however, cultural competence has been most often used in the medical and related fields. For the purpose of this research study, the term cultural competence will be primarily used; however, references to the other terms will be made to accurately reflect the research.

Background

There is a general consensus in the literature that a definition of cultural competence is vague (Pecci et al., 2020) and presents more than 300 interconnected concepts (Leung et al., 2014). Even so, the definition most widely cited in scholarship is provided by Cross et al. (1989, p. 5) who define cultural competence as "a set of congruent behaviors, attitudes, and policies that come together in a system, agency, or among professionals and enables that system, agency, or those professionals to work effectively in cross-cultural situations" (Frawley et al., 2020). This framework emphasizes that a culturally competent organization values diversity, presents the capacity for self-assessment and institutionalized cultural knowledge, and adapts to diversity (Cross et al., 1989).

It is noted that within this domain, professionals successfully function cross-culturally with others of varied backgrounds and demographics inclusive of "race, ethnicity, culture, class, gender, sexual orientation, religion, physical or mental ability, age, and national origin" (Kohli et al., 2010, p. 3). Various views on the theoretical and practical terms of cultural competence are presented in the literature. Frisby and O'Donohue (2018) suggest that cultural competence be viewed with reason and judgment rather than in a rigid, thoughtless manner. Similarly, Palmer and Carter (2014) highlight that cultural competence is an ongoing process requiring lifelong dedication to self-evaluation and reflection. Cultural competence education and training programs seek to promote fundamental viewpoints of theoretical and educational frameworks to stimulate interest in one's own cultural background for assessment National Education Association (2022). Additionally, such education and training endorse the incorporation of care for diverse populations (Frawley et al., 2020).

Although it is important to note that the racial/ethnic makeup of the U.S. is becoming more diversified, it is noteworthy to highlight other contributing aspects and dimensions of change are being recognized when examining cultural competence. As previously outlined in the cross-cultural reference of demographics for professionals (Kohli et al., 2010), the following dimensions will be specifically outlined in this study' background: race and ethnicity, gender and sexual orientation, religion, abilities/disabilities, age, and socioeconomic status. With these aspects factored into Title IX service delivery, it opens the opportunity for Title IX Coordinators to have an impact on diverse college communities grounded in culturally competent context.

Race and Ethnicity

As noted by the National Center for Cultural Competence,

> The makeup of the American population is changing as a result of immigration patterns and significant increases among racially, ethnically, culturally and linguistically diverse populations already residing in the United States. Health care organizations and programs, and federal, state and local governments must implement systematic change in order to meet the health needs of this diverse population. (At Health, 2013, p. 1)

According to the U.S. Census Bureau (2019), the United States is estimated to grow by nearly 79 million people in the next 40 years, from approximately 326 million to 404 million people. The population is expected to grow by approximately 1.8 million people per year during this time frame (U.S. Census Bureau, 2019). By 2060, the fastest growing racial or ethnic group is predicted to be Two or More Races, increasing by 200%, followed by Asians (100% increase) and Hispanics (94% increase) (Vespa et al., 2020). In contrast, the only group projected to shrink is the non-Hispanic White population, declining by approximately 19 million people, from 198 million to 179 million (Vespa et al., 2020).

From 2017 to 2060, the U.S. Census Bureau (2019) projects the U.S. race population evolve as follows:

- White population from approximately 77% to 68%;
- Hispanic population from approximately 18% to 28%;
- Black or African American population from approximately 13% to 15%;
- Asian population from approximately 6% to 9%; and
- American Indian and Alaska Native population at approximately 1%, with no change.

In direct reflection of the U.S. population, higher education institutions embody a globally heterogeneous student body consisting of varied belief systems, ethnicities, races, cultures, practices, and norms. Based on the demographic data provided by the National Center

for Educational Statistics (NCES, 2020a), approximately 16.6 million undergraduate students were enrolled at degree-granting post-secondary institutions during the 2018 fall semester. The NCES reports the racial/ethnic group breakdown as 8.7 million White students, 3.4 million Hispanic students, 2.1 million Black students, 1.1 million Asian students, 647,000 identified as two or more races, 120,000 American Indian/Alaska Native students, and 45,000 Pacific Islander students (NCES, 2020a). NCES (2020a) also highlights that Hispanic enrollment increased yearly between 2000 and 2018, a 148% increase, from 1.4 million to 3.4 million students; however, enrollment trends for other racial/ethnic groups varied during this time period.

It is important to note that although a culturally diverse student population exists, the faculty make-up is not reflective of this demographic shift. These projections reflect the need for Title IX Coordinators to apply a culturally competent lens to their practices with a diverse college community. In fall 2018, full-time faculty in degree-granting postsecondary institutions was comprised of 40% White males; 35% White females; 7% Asian/Pacific Islander males; 5% Asian/Pacific Islander females; and 3% each Black males, Black females, Hispanic males, and Hispanic females. American Indian/Alaska Native and those who were of two or more races each made up 1% or less of full-time faculty (NCES, 2020b). During this same time period, it is noted that the racial/ethnic and sex distribution of faculty varied across the academic ranks for professors and assistant professors; however, White males (53% and 34% respectively) and White females (27% and 39% respectively) still lead other groups that remain close to the overall percentages (NCES, 2020b).

In direct reflection of the U.S. population, higher education institutions embody a globally heterogeneous college community. Based on the demographic data provided by the National Center for Education Statistics (NCES, 2020a), approximately 16.6 million

undergraduate students were enrolled at degree-granting post-secondary institutions during the 2018 fall semester. The NCES reports the racial/ethnic group breakdown as 8.7 million White students, 3.4 million Hispanic students, 2.1 million Black students, 1.1 million Asian students, 647,000 identified as two or more races, 120,000 American Indian/Alaska Native students, and 45,000 Pacific Islander students (NCES, 2020a). NCES also highlights that Hispanic enrollment increased yearly between 2000 and 2018, a 148% increase, from 1.4 million to 3.4 million students; however, enrollment trends for other racial/ethnic groups varied during this time period (NCES, 2020a).

Gender and Sexual Orientation

It is important to note that female students made up 56% of the total undergraduate enrollment while male students made up 44% in fall 2018 which is reflective of an enrollment pattern that has produced similar trends from 2000-2018 (NCES, 2020a). It is predicted that between 2018 and 2029, female and male enrollments are projected to increase by 2%, respectively (from 9.4 to 9.6 million students and from 7.2 to 7.4 million students, respectively) (NCES, 2020a). Although sexual orientation data have not previously been collected in the U.S. Census, 2020 marks the first time that categories of same-sex spouses and partners will options available to census completers (Sage, 2020).

Related information provided by a Gallup poll reveals about 4.5% of American adults identify themselves as lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender (LGBT) (Newport, 2018). This poll also highlights the rise in LGBT identification primarily among the millennial generation while lower rates were prevalent among older generations (Newport, 2018). Additionally, approximately 5.1% of the women polled identify as LGBT, compared to that of 3.9% men (Newport, 2018). It is also important to recognize that although a culturally diverse student

population exists, the faculty make-up is not reflective of this demographic shift. A recent study finds that despite concerted efforts to diversify faculty rank, higher education institutions have made very little progress on faculty diversity (Hazelrigg, 2019). Relevant projections reflect the need for Title IX Coordinators to apply a culturally competent lens to their practices with a diverse college community.

In fall 2018, full-time faculty in degree-granting postsecondary institutions was comprised of 40% White males; 35% White females; 7% Asian/Pacific Islander males; 5% Asian/Pacific Islander females; and 3% each Black males, Black females, Hispanic males, and Hispanic females. American Indian/Alaska Native and those who were of Two or more races each made up 1% or less of full-time faculty (NCES, 2020b). During this same time period, it is noted that the racial/ethnic and sex distribution of faculty varied across the academic ranks for professors and assistant professors; however, White males (53% and 34% respectively) and White females (27% and 39% respectively) still lead other groups that remain close to the overall percentages (NCES, 2020b).

Religion

It is reported that national levels of religiosity vary greatly across measures such as age, race, ethnicity, and religious affiliation in the US (Norman, 2018). According to research by the Pew Research Center (2017), approximately 71% of Americans identify themselves as Christians while about 6% of the U.S. population is comprised of non-Christian religions. This research also reveals that 23% of Americans indicate they had no religious affiliation at all which an expected decrease from 16% in 2015 to a drop of 13% in 2060 (Pew Research Center, 2017). It is noted that Mormons (73%) report being the most religious followed by Protestants (50%), Muslims (45%), Catholics (40%) and Jews (18%). Norman (2018) also, in reference to racial

data on being very religious, Blacks (48%) have higher levels than Whites and Hispanics at 36% each.

Gallup poll data shows that approximately 70% of Americans state that religion is losing its influence in the U.S. society; however, a majority indicate religion remains of great importance in their lives (Newport, 2016). It is important to note that demographics with age groups could broadly influence the role of religion and its patterns in American society over time (Newport, 2016). With this data collection in mind, baby boomers as well as millennials are aging into ranges that traditionally have higher reported religious associations (Newport, 2016). Similarly, it is also suggested that religiosity levels rise over time with age, considering approximately only 28% of Americans 30 and younger indicate they are very religious, in comparison to 47% of those aged 65 and older (Norman, 2018).

Abilities/Disabilities

According to the U.S. Census Bureau (2020), the American Community Survey offers a demographic view of the U.S. population living with disabilities and examines available resources to support them. Highlights from this survey regarding the civilian noninstitutionalized population are as follows:

- Approximately 40.6 million (12.6%) of the total population reportedly lived with a disability in the United States in 2018.
- Approximately 7.6 million of the total population ages 18 to 64 with a disability were employed in 2018.
- The median earnings in the past 12 months (in 2018 inflation adjusted dollars) of the civilian noninstitutionalized population age 16 and over with earnings and a disability in 2018 was $23,848.

As noted by the Centers for Disease Control, the Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report reports mobility disability as the most common disability as reported by 1 in 7 adults followed by cognition, independent living, hearing, vision, and self-care (Okoro et al., 2016). Cognitive disability was most common among young adults while mobility was prevalent for middle-aged and older adults (Okoro et al., 2016). It is important to note that as poverty increased, disability rates among adults also increased with mobility disability being about 5 times more common among middle-aged adults living below poverty level in comparison to adults in this age group whose income was reportedly twice that of the poverty level (Okoro et al., 2016).

Age

According to Colby and Ortman (2015), changing demographics in the U.S. population include increased life expectancy, decreased mortality, and shift from a "youth dependency ratio" of those under 18 years old to an "old-age dependency ratio" with those 65 years (Colby & Ortman, 2015, p. 7). According to the U.S. Census Bureau (2019), is projected that the 65-and-older population will nearly double from 49 million in 2016 to approximately 95 million people by 2060. The 85 years and older population is expected to increase from 6.5 million to 19 million people (U.S. Census Bureau, 2019).

Socioeconomic Status

The U.S. Census Bureau (2019) reports a record low number of Americans were living in poverty with rates falling from 12.7% in 2016 to approximately 10.5%, the lowest since data were initially published in the 1959. It is noted that minority groups reached the largest poverty declines in 2019 with rates dropping from 1.8 to 2.8 percentage points for Hispanics and Blacks, respectively (U.S. Census Bureau, 2019). In alignment with these rates, the U.S. Census Bureau (2019) data reports that household income rates rose in 2019, the highest reported rates since

1967. This data also notes that median household incomes for White, Black, Asian, and Hispanic groups all experienced increases in 2019 (U.S. Census Bureau, 2019). Even so, income inequalities remained unchanged and the gap continued to exist and widen among socioeconomic and racial groups (Smialek et al., 2020). It is noted that some economics have cautioned that this data have been disrupted by 2020's pandemic and its negative impact upon the workforce, with minority groups facing devastating layoffs and job loss (Smialek et al., 2020).

As noted by a Federal Reserve survey, unemployment was at approximately 3.5% prior to the 2020 pandemic, the lowest rate in the past 50 years (Smialek, 2020). Even with wages steadily on the rise, this survey revealed that Americans were not prepared for financial challenges with approximately three in ten stating they were unable to support expenses over the course of three months with their personal savings or borrowed funds (Smialek, 2020).

The data points and projections presented reflect the need for Title IX Coordinators to apply a culturally competent lens to their practices as they serve diverse college communities.

Context of Study

The focus of cultural competence has evolved from a segment within the Civil Rights Act of 1964 to legislation allocating funds supporting related education programs. The National Center for Cultural Competence (NCCC) acknowledges, "the Federal Government has a pivotal role in insuring culturally competent health care services" (NCCC, 2010, p. 3). Federally funded programs have been regulated by mandates as defined in United States policy and the Civil Rights Act of 1964 to address cultural competence as follows:

> Prohibition against exclusion from participation in, denial of benefits of, and discrimination under federally assisted programs on ground of race, color or national origin. No person in the United States shall, on the ground of race, color or national

> origin, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of or be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance. (Pub. L. 88- 352, Title VI, Sec. 601, July 2, 1964, 78 Stat. 252.)

Researchers echo that the rise in diversity related issues has propelled the development of multicultural competence for use by current and future Title IX Coordinators (Pope & Pope, 2014). In examining such development, competencies must be identified as intentional and clearly expressed within professional development training (Pope & Pope, 2014).

Early definitions of cultural competence commonly shared among professionals in the diversity and inclusion field of work stem from the healthcare system. Researchers have supported cultural competence in an effective cross-cultural environment via systematic and congruent set of behaviors, values, and principles (Cross et al., 1989) while requiring these defined elements to demonstrate their impact (Taylor, 2007). Moreover, the cultural competence definition has extended to providing patients of a specified ethnic or racial group effective clinical care (Denboba & U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Health Services and Resources Administration, 1993) which evolves along the cultural competence continuum (Betancourt et al., 2002).

Early commentary presents expanded view of cultural competence in the counseling literature consisting of the exploration of an individual's awareness, knowledge, and skills (Pederson, 1988). Within this realm, researchers have elected to separate the attitudinal element from the awareness element to highlight the contrasts among the training emphasis (Martin & Vaughan, 2007). On one hand, it is noted that training exists to transport an individual's cultural bias and beliefs into the consciousness, and contrastingly on the other hand, training exists to support an individual in the exploration of beliefs and values about cultural variances (Martin &

Vaughan, 2007). Pope and Reynolds (1997) extend the definition of multicultural competence through a higher education lens as "the awareness, knowledge, and skills necessary to work effectively and ethically across cultural difference… a necessary prerequisite to effective, affirming, and ethical work in student affairs" (p. 270). This definition directly connects to the value of continuous cultural competence development.

The modern-day lens on cultural competence extends beyond enhancing one's knowledge base to its application in practice. Current perceptions of cultural competence recognize its complexity in advancing knowledge and integrating such knowledge into practice (Azzopardi & McNeill, 2016). Additionally, the conceptualization of cultural competence in its contemporary role "can be understood as an ongoing process whereby one gains awareness of, and appreciation for, cultural diversity and an ability to work sensitively, respectfully, and proficiently with those from diverse backgrounds" (Azzopardi & McNeill, 2016, p. 283). Similarly, Simon and Kawamura note that cultural competence is advanced through learning and practice through the elements of cross-cultural awareness, skills, values, and practices (Azzopardi & McNeill, 2016, p. 3).

Similarly, Courtland Lee (2012) outlines the conceptual framework of cultural competence in three categories inclusive of the foundational dimension, the multicultural dimension, and multicultural counseling competency. It is noted that the foundation of cultural competence is self-awareness wherein a counselor must evaluate how his or her individualized attitudes and beliefs regarding those from varied cultural groups may support or hinder effective counseling practices (Lee, 2012). Such evaluation must be taken into consideration as professionals plan, develop, implement, and evaluate their service delivery and its impact using a cross-cultural context. It is suggested that the development of cultural competency serves as an

integral role in the personal and professional growth of counseling professionals as well as attaining the skills for necessary for effective multicultural intervention (Lee, 2012). Such a process can serve as a reference to the proposed cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators.

The Health Policy Institute highlights that the process of cultural competence is developed through various stages based on prior knowledge and experience and is often developed in stages by building upon previous knowledge and experience" (Georgetown University, 2005) and is reflective of the commentary in the aforementioned research studies. Lastly, the National Education Association (2022) cultural competence training promotes the increase in the necessity of intentional engagement, self-reflection, and emphasizes the attainment of knowledge.

With an increasingly diverse U.S. population and higher education community, focus must be geared toward enhancing the cultural competence of Title IX Coordinators that are assigned the responsibility of creating supportive, unbiased environments within their processes and procedures. Although Title IX Coordinators are required to participate in training regarding policy and procedures, they are not required to gain professional development specifically in cultural competence. With the evolution of cultural competence in equity-minded thought and practice, Title IX Coordinators must also advance their knowledge base and application to meet the diverse needs for their college communities.

Statement of the Problem

Despite our increasingly diverse culture and the importance of cultural competence at the forefront of higher education commentary, a review of the empirical literature offers limited research and context-specific studies on cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators. The

existing literature makes an appeal for restorative justice which aligns with the need for cultural competence training (Karp & Sacks, 2014; Koss et al., 2014; Vail, 2019).

Moswela and Mukhopadhayay (2011) reveal that the student affairs professionals lacked multicultural competence to adequately address the needs of students with special needs. Such limitations may lead to ethical implications and result in deficits in the awareness, knowledge, and skill sets to engage with other cultures. The core components of Title IX practices in higher education lie in social justice and advocacy which highlight the respect for human diversity and quality of life (Koss et al., 2014). As noted by the U.S. Department of Education (2020c), Title IX Coordinators are tasked with overseeing the entire investigative process to address allegations of sex discrimination and are trained to address bias in decision-making. With this critical role in mind, cultural competency must be integrated in the Title IX Coordinators' role in service delivery and equitable outcomes for a diverse college community. These practices are applicable to students, staff, faculty, and organizations within the educational community, regardless of aspects of race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, religion, ability, or age.

Research suggests that the racial and gender-based stereotypes and perception generate a cultural framework in racial factors influence the perceptions and decision-making about rape informally within disclosures and formally within adjudication (George & Martinez, 2002; Smiley & Fakunle, 2016). Research shows that in rapes involving a Black person as either a complainant or respondent, race-based patterns have emerged in the form of stereotypes which ultimately affect societal and individual insights of and responses to rape (George & Martinez, 2002). Ultimately, there is emphasis on the resilience of racial stereotypes about rape in society and their effect on discriminatory judgement outcomes (Bastian et al., 2013; George & Martinez, 2002; Smiley & Fakunle, 2016).

By examining the professional development for Title IX Coordinators, it is projected that the impact cultural competence training plays will be significant. Ideally, this research's theoretical framework, the Transformational Learning Theory, will support the growth and evolution of cultural competence through several lens including demographic data, the culture of rape, racial and gender-based stereotypes, and stigmas. Such progression may lead to practical application and enhanced delivery and development of services, policies, and procedures.

Guiding Questions

The guiding questions will be addressed through an examination of qualitative data provided through the comparative review. The following overarching research question was established with the noted sub questions: What are the similarities and differences in cultural competence training programs designed for Title IX Coordinators by the Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), the College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)?

1. What steps are taken in the program development process?
2. What are the main factors contributing to training implementation?
3. What measures are considered when assessing and tracking performance and/or training effectiveness?
4. What factors have impacted the evolution of the training?

Overview of Inquiry

Through an examination of qualitative data, the guiding questions will be addressed through the comparative review. It is expected that these questions will contribute to the research on the formulation, implementation, assessment, and evolution of cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators. Additionally, data will be collected via observation and available

documentation. Participants will be company affiliated representatives of the three selected cultural competence training programs. The homogeneity of the professional development will allow the space to compare various elements and contribute to the analysis. A thematic approach will be supported through identifying, coding and categorizing emerging themes. This framework is constructed to provide a visual presentation of my approach and how factors identified within the research study may parallel theory (Grant & Osanloo, 2014). Details of how this study addresses the research questions are further explained in Chapter 3.

Theoretical Framework Overview

In considering the fundamental process of cultural competence and its progression over time, identifying clearly defined cultural awareness, knowledge, and skills are at the forefront in higher education. The Transformative Learning Theory, originally developed by Jack Mezirow in the 1970s, has been selected as the theoretical framework to guide the course of this research study. As outlined in the framework of the Transformative Learning Theory, one's learning is gained through the assessment of his or her developmental knowledge as reflected through a perspective based upon individualized experiences (Mezirow, 1978). Such reflection involves three types of reflection to include content reflection, process reflection, and premise reflection (Mezirow, 1991). In the alignment of Title IX Coordinators' duties and ethical guidelines in servicing the higher education community, approaches in also promote professional development reflective upon individualized learning experiences that facilitate decision-making.

Creswell (2013) notes that this framework seeks to advance consciousness and "should contain an action agenda for reform that may change the lives of participants, the institutions in which they live and work, or even the researchers' lives" (p. 26). Lee and Greene (2004) note that within this approach, one must assess his or her own pathway of cross-cultural learning

continually and incorporate reflective practices. In doing so, understanding of one's own perspective is gained to effectively apply the theory into actual practice (Lee & Greene, 2004).

Research findings suggest that basic ethics learned are "submerged as horizons of significance over the adult life course. Restoring these learnings grounded the participants so they could withstand the disorienting aspects of transformation" (Lange, 2004, p. 135). Such immersed knowledge potentially evolves into rediscovered frames of reference which alter their perspectives, beliefs, and social interactions which culminate into an ethical act or process, an integral component of transformative learning.

Similarly, the Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity (DMIS) outlines a continuum of increasing sensitivity to cultural differences, understanding, and adjustment and the ways in which these differences are organized into experiences (Bennett, 1993). It is noted that as one's developmental position becomes more complex, one's experience of culture expands and the potential for presenting intercultural competence also expands (Bennett, 2014). This framework aligns with the Transformative Learning Theory's notion that individualized perspectives evolve into collective, meaningful experiences and may inform the guiding questions related specifically to cultural competence and cultural competence practices. It is anticipated that use of the Transformative Learning Theory and the Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity may serve as guiding structures for the inquiry approach and guiding questions. A more detailed discussion regarding this theoretical approach will be conducted in Chapter 2.

Definitions of Key Terms

This section outlines the theoretical definitions utilized throughout this study:

Culture - Comprised of the languages, customs, beliefs, rules, arts, knowledge, and collective identities and memories developed by members of all social groups that make their social environments meaningful (American Sociology Association, 2018).

Cultural competence - The "ability of professionals to function successfully with people from different cultural backgrounds, including, but not limited to, race, ethnicity, culture, class, gender, sexual orientation, religion, physical or mental ability, age, and national origin" (Kohli et al., 2010, p. 3).

Discrimination - Prohibited under the laws enforced by the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) as illegal acts which retaliate against an applicant or employee because of that individual's race, color, religion, sex (including gender identity, sexual orientation, and pregnancy), national origin, age (40 or older), disability or genetic information (U.S. Equal Opportunity Commission, 2020).

Ethics - An employee or professional adhering to his/her responsibilities in an honest manner and with integrity by presenting sound judgment and progressing equitable measures in the best interests of their institution and professional community (ATIXA, 2017).

Federal Laws - These laws are passed by Congress and signed by the President of the United States. They prohibit workplace discrimination and are enforced by the EEOC (U.S. Equal Opportunity Commission, 2020).

Higher Education - the process of teaching or acquiring knowledge, skills, and values (American Psychological Association, 2020).

Learning - A process based on experience that results in a relatively permanent change in behavior or behavioral potential (American Psychological Association, 2020).

Perception - The processes by which information is organized in sensory formats and interpreted as being having been created by external factors three-dimensionally (American Psychological Association, 2020).

Professional Development - the continuing education or training that is often expected or required of people employed in a profession. Professional organizations often assist the professional development of their members by providing courses, conferences, literature, and other services (American Psychological Association, 2020).

Regulations - These regulations are voted on by the EEOC after the public has a formal opportunity to provide comments. They implement federal workplace discrimination laws in the United States (U.S. Equal Opportunity Commission, 2020).

Sex discrimination - Treatment of an individual, including an employee or applicant, in an unfavorable manner because of that person's sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, and/or transgender status (U.S. Equal Opportunity Commission, 2020).

Sexual violence - An act committed against an individual without given consent including unwanted sexual contact and non-contact unwanted sexual experiences. Sexual violence is divided into various types as identified by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention to include completed or attempted acts: penetration of a victim, alcohol/drug-facilitated penetration of a victim, wherein a victim is made to penetrate a perpetrator or someone else (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2020).

Student Affairs - Area of higher education which assist students with lifelong journey of growth, development, and self-discovery via teaching opportunities and promoting positive interactions outside of the classroom (National Association of Student Personnel Administrators, 2018).

Title IX - The Office of Civil Rights (OCR) enforces the Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 which protects people from discrimination based on sex in education programs or activities that receive Federal financial assistance (U.S. Department of Education, 2020b).

Title IX Coordinator - at least one official designated by the recipient to ensure compliance with Title IX and the Recipient's Title IX program and responsible for overseeing the entire investigation process to address allegations of sex discrimination (including sexual harassment and pregnancy issues) (Federal Register, 2020).

Training - Systematic instruction and practice by which an individual acquires competence in a specific discipline, talent, or vocational or recreational skill or activity (American Psychological Association, 2020).

Assumptions

Assumptions of one's understanding of cultural competence is often centered on self-knowledge in addition to one's own cultural values, set of beliefs, and cultural experiences. It is primarily through personal and professional experiences in which the development and implementation of culturally responsive approaches in Title IX practices are present. Beyond the differences that may exist, it is assumed that Title IX Coordinators share commonalities which influence behavior and bring forth varied levels of culturally responsive approaches to meet the needs of the college community (Martin, 2015).

As noted previously, training required for Title IX Coordinators does not explicitly present cultural competence modules but rather focuses on the definition of sexual harassment, the scope of investigations and hearings and the avoidance of conflicts of interests and bias, among other related areas (U.S. Department of Education, 2020c). Previous educational training

may not have specifically focused on cultural competence awareness, development, and/or application into professional practice. Such training may be gained via personal interest and/or institutional optional or mandated measures. It must also be noted that professional development is not consistent for Title IX Coordinators and may vary among institutions (Paul, 2016); therefore, this training may not have provided extensive education on cultural competence issues. Professional development training may have been offered in a segmented or time limited manner, but not equate to sufficient understanding and practice of cultural competence practices. For those higher education institutions driven by policies and procedures that support cultural competence, value in the development and implementation of cultural practices subsequently permeates within the working environment (Frawley et al., 2020).

As noted by Block (2017a), Title IX related positions are among the fastest growing areas in student affairs departments at higher education institutions; however, about half of the total number of Title IX Coordinators work within human resources departments (Paul, 2016). Title IX Coordinators may be employed in other primary roles within their respective institutions, particularly community colleges; therefore, Title IX responsibilities may be viewed as secondary assignments or roles (Block, 2017b). Roles may include those within student affairs (such as student conduct officers and academic deans) and within human resources (such as benefits and employee relations managers). Within the realm of duality of roles, there may be a lack of intersectionality in these roles, responsibilities, interaction, and campus perception (Paul, 2016).

Dependent upon the nature of their current and past roles, Title IX Coordinators may have had limited exposure to diverse populations (Paul, 2016). It is viewed as unreasonable that culturally competent Title IX Coordinators know in entirety the culturally differences among their college communities. Within this reality, understanding the cultural context of those in our

working environment lends to supporting those that do not have a cultural context and use of these skills to gain further awareness and understanding. The development of cultural competence along a continuum is viewed as a personal experience that is dependent upon trust, interaction with diverse populations, and self-reflection including past experiences (Gies, 2010). Cultural competence training plays a role in clarifying these uncertainties and serves to reduce barriers in awareness and understanding which ultimately affect its development.

Considering these assumptions for Title IX Coordinators, three overarching themes emerge. Firstly, cultural difference serves as a positive factor and has been embraced by the Title IX community. Promotion of cultural competence training is linked to numerous Title IX training modules including those presented in this research study. Secondly, higher education institutions must be responsive to the cultural needs of its community members. As student, faculty, and staff populations become increasingly diverse, Title IX Coordinators should possess the awareness, knowledge, and skills necessary to serve their needs as culturally competent leaders. Lastly, Gay (2010) highlights that service delivery should be presented in ways in which culturally diverse people gain validation of their cultures within the larger environment. Through cultural competence training, the opportunity presents itself to gain the tools to empower and promote success both professionally and academically.

Scope and Delimitations

The scope of this study will focus on the comparison and contrast cultural competence training programs designed for Title IX Coordinators. The focus of Title IX Coordinators resonates with me based on my personal experiences in the Title IX profession as an Investigator for four years and as a Coordinator for the past 1-1/2 years. This body of research will serve as added value to the industry's advancements in professional knowledge and application of

cultural competence. Due to the specificity of the study's population, findings cannot be generalized to the larger population. The literature review will present relevance of this training in connection to Title IX's historical and current roles as well as its evolution in higher education. Three training programs will be selected to offer richness in perspectives on development, implementation, and evolution of training. Through a qualitative approach, representatives from the selected organizations will be interviewed individually. Such data, along with observations and review of training documents from each organization, will provide insight on educational implications for Title IX Coordinators. This data will also serve as beneficial in addressing training reform and supporting sustainability of cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators.

Limitations

A few limitations to this research study should be considered. First, the potential for bias on the part of this researcher may exist as there are a number of unconscious assumptions about cultural competence and Title IX practices that may have the potential to impact the course of the literature review, guide the study's research questions, and/or influence the analysis and interpretation of the results. Secondly, when considering my direct involvement as an employee within the Title IX profession, the nature of self-reporting comes into focus. Such conditions place influence upon the study's methodology and conclusions. Next, the topic of cultural competence within higher education is continually evolving with its modes of training and delivery. This study will offer data reflective of the current protocol in the training industry. Lastly, there is a limited sample size consisting of solely three training programs. The study would be strengthened with interviews with representatives from additional cultural competence training programs.

Significance of the Research Study

Although there is significant research readily available to broadly address the cultural competence of Student Affairs professionals, there are gaps in the literature regarding the examination of the cultural competence of Title IX Coordinators. Even though non-discriminatory practices are outlined in Title IX regulations issued by the U.S. Department of Education's Office of Civil Rights, there is limited data on the exploration of cultural competence in reference to professionals responsible in the review, implementation, and enforcement of these policies in higher education. This transition offers the means to effectively understand both the overarching questions as well as specified components of cultural competence via models which support the dialog of varied perspectives.

This study will offer contributions to the literature on cultural competencies, specifically for the Title IX profession. Due to the variations in the structure of collegiate organizations, professionals in the field may have varied educational and training backgrounds, knowledge base, and expertise from other disciplines (Dungy, 2003). Unlike the traditional design of standalone service delivery, the current operation usually encompasses the need to address students in a holistic manner to include student activities, support services, and campus protection and safety (Kuk & Banning, 2009). The effectiveness of this shift into multi-operational functioning has been questioned when addressing Title IX responsibilities, particularly in addressing the safety of the institution's stakeholders (Kuk & Banning, 2009).

According to the American College Personnel Association (2010) (ACPA) and the National Association of Student Personnel Administrators (2018) (NASPA), the competencies outlined by the Professional Competencies Task Force the knowledge and skill sets for Student Affairs professionals should not only identify the awareness and understanding of diversity and

social justice, but also the evidence of actively processing and practicing these key components (ACPA & NASPA, 2015). Such actions which potentially serve to meet the needs of all groups affected directly and indirectly must be present. The active integration of the constructs of equity, diversity, and inclusion build a multidimensional framework for social justice (ACPA & NASPA, 2015). Thus, the need for cultural competence is relevant to fill gaps necessary to operate ethically and responsibly in the field of Title IX as mandated by the Office of Civil Rights and recommended by professional organizations.

It is worth the exploration of a mandate for Title IX Coordinators to be well-trained in cultural competence as outlined by ACPA and NASPA. Without this time and investment in relevant training, the field risks college communities being misguided in the Title IX investigative and hearing processes. Equitable access and outcomes are at stake for all involved in these processes. The complainants and respondents may not be provided the opportunities to gain the full scope of resources and services to remedy reported allegations.

Ultimately, higher education institutions with practices that fail to advocate for the college community through culturally competent practices could potentially result in a broken system of care, offering less than favorable service delivery and outcomes. Distrust in the process by may affect the institutional culture and climate for all stakeholders. Cultural incompetence may lead to ominous consequences resulting in threats or acts of lawsuits and expenses to the negligent institution rendered by the parties and/or the federal government. As our nation's demographics are becoming increasingly diverse, the opportunities to build valuable relationships in the field of Title IX may be limited, if cultural competence is not promoted. Conversely, Title IX Coordinators may co-exist with college communities they do not

understand, creating higher risks for misunderstandings and biased decision-making. With exposure, understanding, and application of cultural competence, these issues may be avoidable.

Tentatively, I expect to find that each organization utilizes a theoretical approach to guide the overall design and development of their training programs. The differences I anticipate include the frameworks from which these training programs are developed. They be rooted in a cultural competence-focused perspective; however, they may also incorporate adult learning and evaluation of their training. Inconsistencies in these results may reveal a misalignment of training objectives, outcomes, and future developments for training designed specifically for Title IX Coordinators. Title IX Coordinators would not gain full benefit of an equitable learning experience. While the goal is to address the floor of cultural competence training needs of Title IX Coordinators, this research study seeks to reach the ceiling for best practices in creating practical frameworks for building and maintaining inclusive college communities.

The following three organizations were selected as the unit of analysis for this research study: the Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), the College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM). Based on my professional experience and ongoing professional development as a Title IX Coordinator, ATIXA, CUPA-HR, and SHRM are highly regarded as experts in the field and influential in shaping the narrative for training for Title IX Coordinators. For these reasons, it is perceived that these organizations set the standard and the terms in which cultural competence is promoted and evolves in their respective professional development offerings.

Organization of the Study

With an increased awareness of cultural competence in higher education, providing optimal professional development training to Title IX Coordinators is at the forefront. An overview of the content of each of the six chapters is as follows. Chapter 1 introduces the problem, makes the case for the significance of this study and its objectives, and conceptualizes the study. This background information references the evolution of diversity and factors influencing cultural competence.

Chapter 2 offers the literature review of scholarly bodies of work which synthesize findings across studies to reveal comparable and differing research outcomes and perspectives by cultural theorists and resources. This chapter also incorporates a theoretical framework which examines the association among concepts and ideas that support the comparison of three cultural competence training programs.

Chapter 3 explains the details of the selected methodology in which the study is situated, describes the rationale behind using this process as well as the data collection and analysis methods. Discussion of three cultural competence training programs will be highlighted.

Chapter 4 organizes and reports the research findings. This section will make a comparison and evaluation of three cultural competence training programs. Evidence related to cultural competence training and outcomes will be further discussed.

Chapter 5 presents a detailed interpretation, analysis, and synthesis of the results. The chapter identifies themes and patterns that arise from these findings and results. Chapter 6 provides concluding statements which integrate the findings, interpretation, analysis, and synthesis and offers recommendations for future works to improve upon the study.

Summary

Cultural competence is considered essential for all professionals including those in the Title IX field, due to changing demographics and the escalating awareness of the importance of culturally responsive professional practices. Due to the intricate scope of work with an extensive range of clientele, the mere essence of cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators may present complications in the comprehensive conceptualization and application of theory to actual practice. These professionals are not solely confined to the singular elements of identities, including sexual orientation, socioeconomic status, culture, and tradition, but also may be exposed to intersecting infinite identities which require the discernment of best practices. This is a massive endeavor, involving the dissection of backgrounds, group dynamics, and classifications, and may not serve as effective in addressing individual needs; therefore, may lend to perpetuating stereotypical views and blanketed standards that hinder progression (Johnson & Munch, 2009; Yan & Wong, 2005). Sander et al. (2016) highlights that with the rapidly evolving issues impacting services to culturally diverse populations, it is of importance for practitioners to learn more about cultural competence and build upon past experiences to develop future perspectives and processes.

This study advances the goal of achieving cultural competence in the Title IX profession by examining professional development experienced by its Coordinators. Revelation of the noted areas may offer insight into some underlining issues faced by Title IX Coordinators in their duties and responsibilities in their roles. These findings will be brought to the forefront to also address concerns at a systemic level, potentially leading to improved delivery and development of services, policies, and procedures.

CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The purpose of this study is to examine professional development focused on cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators. Such data will be retrieved through a comparative study of three cultural competence training programs. Additionally, a review of theory supporting cultural competence will be incorporated into this research to provide a guide for comparison of the training programs described in Chapter 3.

Title IX Coordinators typically oversee all facets of the Title IX process which take on the responsibility in enforcing compliance, promoting prevention education, and supporting training at their respective campuses. The previous chapter outlined several relevant concerns and challenges facing higher education institutions, including the necessity and support of the cultural competence training needs of Title IX Coordinators. This chapter offers a context for this present study by expounding upon the noted themes through a comprehensive literature review.

The literature review is organized into seven sections as follows: (1) theoretical framework; (2) historical perspective of cultural competence; (3) alignment between multiculturalism and social justice; (4) overview of Title IX professional training organizations; (5) infusion of cultural competence into Student Affairs; (6) development and enforcement of Title IX legislation; and (7) Title IX research and resources provided by professional associations and organizations.

Theoretical Framework

Cultural competence and its impact upon society have been underscored with the changing demographics and expressions of cultural differences. The emphasis of cultural competence professional development was recognized by theorists as early as the 1960s. Prior to

the inception of the Transformative Learning Theory, a comprehensive adult education theory to steer educational practice was non-existent (Mezirow, 1991). With such an observation, Mezirow (1991) highlights the notion that "neither of these sets of assumptions provides a sound basis that can help adult educators work towards the broad social and political goals envisioned by many of the leaders in the field" (p. 12). As a result, the emphasis on transformative learning has represented an integrated theory reflective in guided practices of educational professionals (Merriam et al., 2007). Based on Mezirow's suggestions, three types of reflection are prevalent in adult learning as follows:

- content reflection (exploration of the problem description);
- process reflection (examining the problem-solving strategies); and
- premise reflection (probing the problem). (Owen, 2016)

Over the next few decades, theorists have developed conceptual frameworks to support rationales for cultural competence education. Tortumluoglu (2006) highlights cultural frameworks to identify cultural factors and their effect upon one's own behavior in order to provide culturally appropriate care and avoid bias. Similarly, the Leininger's Sunrise Model seeks to evaluate and acknowledge cultural differences in views and societal structures in order to provide holistic and sensitive services (Reynolds et al., 1993).

There have been a few emerging concepts which align with transformative learning practices within the adult education system. Based on a comprehensive analysis of transformative learning by Clark and Wilson (1991) and "transformational characteristics that transcend contexts" (Taylor, 2007, p. 184), the following phase model has been explained and used as a foundation to further explore this perspective of adult learning. This process is initiated with the non-determining start which then links to a period of experimental and undirected

exploration, and flows into a phase of social analysis and reflection (Taylor, 2007). The final phases of this process are heightened during a period of relevance shifting which ultimately leads to a social merging and the clarification or interpretation of the initial thoughts (Taylor, 2007).

Taylor (2008) outlines there is an intrinsic motivation that all humans possess that forms meanings within their daily living. As change is considered a continuous cycle and presents open-ended learning opportunities, it is of utmost importance that "a more critical worldview must be considered as we seek ways to better understand our world" which entails learning methods in which we "negotiate and act upon our own purposes, values, feelings and meanings rather than those we have uncritically assimilated from others" (Mezirow, 2000, p. 8).

The Campinha-Bacote Model of Cultural Competence supports the notion that one gradually builds upon cultural awareness, skills, and knowledge resulting in attitudinal change toward the ultimate goal of cultural competence (Campinha-Bacote, 2001). In support of the evolution of cultural competence, Tortumluoglu (2006) states "… in reality we all belong to the same race-the human race, with all the same basic needs" (p. 8). Similarly, the Health Resources and Services Administration describes the Campinha-Bacote Theory as an intersection of the noted constructs with expansion of one's cultural competence (Campinha-Bacote, 2001).

In defining adult learning processes, the Transformative Learning Theory outlines how beliefs are fundamentally explored, validated, and connected to an informed decision-making process. Through such a process, the fundamental construction of potentially new interpretations of experiences within the world is at the forefront. This concept of transformative learning has evolved over time. Its development was initially defined as the process by which the "meaning perspective," including "thought, feeling and will" (Mezirow, 1978, p. 105), comprised of foundational changes. Mezirow (1978) also highlights that transformative learning supports how

these processes emerge over time through both formal and informal learning educational experiences.

It is emphasized that Transformative Learning Theory is deeply rooted in human communication aspects wherein "learning is understood as the process of using a prior interpretation to construe a new or revised interpretation of the meaning of one's experience in order to guide future action" (Mezirow, 1996, p. 162). This transformative learning process has been developed and confined to assumptions, expectations, and frames of reference which impact thoughts, core beliefs, and actions within varied circumstances (Mezirow, 1996). It is noted that an introspective transformation most often occurs in a sequence of several altered moments which evoke meaning or the outcome of chaotic circumstances which may question the essence of reality (Mezirow, 1996).

The stages of Mezirow's (2000) transformative learning are outlined as follows:

- a disorienting dilemma;
- self-examination with feelings of fear, anger, guilt, or shame;
- a critical assessment of assumptions;
- recognition that one's discontent and the process of transformation are shared;
- exploration of options for new roles, relationships, and actions;
- planning a course of action;
- acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans;
- provisional trying of new roles;
- building competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships;
- a reintegration into one's life on the basis of conditions dictated by one's new perspective. (p. 22)

Merriam (2004) asserts that the "notion of development as change over time or with age is fundamental to adult learning theory and practice: furthermore, the direction of this change is almost always presented as positive and growth oriented" (p. 60). Through this evolving process, the interaction occurring in the learning situation must be considered to include structural elements of ethnicity, race, culture, and gender. Additionally, this interaction places ethical demands upon transference of knowledge. Ettling (2006) highlights Freire's contentions that an individual alters "his or her understanding and consciousness to the extent that she or he is illuminated in real historical conflicts" (p. 3).

Briton's (1996) perspective of the pedagogy of engagement challenges adult educators to address existing dilemmas associated with the application of democratic and equitable ideals. References to O'Sullivan's conceptualization of development within adult education outline such formulation as an integral component of human development (Briton, 1996). This notion offers support for the commonality of humanistic need for growth and understanding that ethically fulfills the needs of all affected in a collective manner (Briton, 1996).

With transformative learning being characterized as "evolving habits of mind as well as by new structures for engaging one's identity that recognize the interconnected web within the universe," the acceptance or denial of such shared responsibility comes into play when addressing dilemmas (Lange, 2004). Additionally, references to Lange (2004) offers a perspective on how transformative learning has the potential to stimulate citizen action for the overall good of preserving societal gain and evoking change. The current lens of transformative learning is centered on autonomous thought and ways in which aides in critiquing one's thought processes, perspectives, and the elements that have shaped them (Christie et al., 2015; Cohen & Heinecke, 2018). This process serves as a reexamination of the legitimacy of learning

experiences and allows individuals to apply what has been learned in unanticipated situations (Christie et al., 2015; Cohen & Heinecke, 2018).

Transformational Learning Theory has been viewed as viable cultural competence framework in higher education. It is noted that a strong connection exists between one's learning environment and the level of fulfillment of cultural competence (Fay & Kim, 2017). Within this perspective, it is suggested that transformative learning has substantial consequences for the practice of cultural design education and the learning environments it impacts (Fay & Kim, 2017). Similarly, it is highlighted that transformative learning has been promoted and lead towards tangible changes toward cultural competence within clinical practices (Garneau, 2016). In such, it is suggested that the context for critical reflection has been developed for undergraduate nursing students (Garneau, 2016).

Zanchetta et al. (2017) note that mentoring relationships in higher education offered transformative learning experiences which expounded upon the foundation of cultural competence understanding for both the student mentees and faculty mentors. Brown and Schmidt (2016) also highlight that self-reflection, as outlined by transformative learning, serves as an integral component in nursing education as students gain understanding of varied cultures and people globally. Within this process, students develop and enhance critical thinking and social consciousness which support culturally competent care (Brown & Schmidt, 2016). Lastly, a study focused on study abroad programs found use of Transformative Learning Theory offered educational benefits in promoting of cultural awareness and understanding as well as in acknowledging the differences within the scope in healthcare's practices and policies settings (Brown et al., 2016).

To supplement the Transformative Learning Theory, the Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity (DMIS) offers the notion of a continuum of experiences over a lifetime. It is noted that the DMIS is a widely utilized framework within assessment and training (Deardorff & Arasaratnam-Smith, 2017). It is noted that Milton Bennett collected data across a 20-year span regarding individuals' understanding, responses, and adjustments to cultural differences from which the DMIS was developed (Greenholtz, 2000). The initial observations were purposed to apply a theoretical approach in addressing next steps and describing a developmental process in intercultural training programs (Bennett, 2017). Within this framework, the primary goals of intercultural competence professional development serve to permit more competent-based communication within the context of alternative cultural settings while the secondary goals focus on the application of intercultural communication competence to activities (Bennett, 2017).

Based on the DMIS framework, each individual or group presents a distinctive set of experiences of cultural differences that are characterized by various developmental positions as follows:

- ethnocentric (viewing one's own culture is the central focus of reality);
- denial (living in isolation within one's own homogeneous group, and intentionally separate oneself from cultural differences to protect own worldview);
- defense (organizing one's world into "us and them" perspective with one's own culture being superior);
- minimization (all cultures have basic characteristics and no major difference exist);
- ethnorelative (viewing one's own experience, in connection with other cultures, is considered relative to a specific situation);

- acceptance (acknowledging a number of equally complex worldviews across cultures);
- adaptation (making conscious, empathetic shifts and acting in culturally appropriate ways in other cultures); and
- integration (consciously choosing alternatives when evaluating situations and creating one's own reality). (Bennett, 2014)

As suggested by Bhawuk and Brislin (1992) "to be effective in another culture, people must be interested in other cultures, be sensitive enough to notice cultural differences, and then also be willing to modify their behavior as an indication of respect for the people of other cultures" (p. 416). It is argued that the greater intercultural sensitivity, the greater the potential for applying intercultural competence (Hammer et al., 2003).

Historical Context of the Development of Cultural Competence

According to National Education Association's C.A.R.E. Strategies for Closing the Achievement Gaps:

> Culture is the sum total of experiences, knowledge, skills, beliefs, values, and interests represented by the diversity of students and adults in our schools. While culture is often defined and perceived by schools as the celebration of important people, religions, traditions, and holidays, as well as an appreciation of the customs of different groups, it is also more than that. Culture is as much, or as little, as the everyday experiences, people, events, smells, sounds, and habits of behavior that characterize students' and educators' lives. Culture shapes a person's sense of who he or she is and where he or she fits in the family, community, and society. (National Education Association, 2007, p. 16)

Literature highlights that cultural competence materialized as one of the structures in addressing issues of diversity and equality nationwide in the 1980s and in understanding how culture and competence have become constructed over time (Kirmayer, 2012). The framework of culture in the United States has been categorized by the U.S. Census Bureau as five main ethnoracial associations to include the following: African American, Asian American and Pacific Islanders, Latino, American Indian and Alaska Native, and White (Kirmayer, 2012).

The ethnoracial definitions of these identified blocs serve to combine language, geographic origins, ethnicity, and race and identify those with related social issues and inequities. It is noted that categories may not capture the full picture of those identifying with several categories or those avoiding such identification completely (Hollinger, 1995). Cultural competence in the United States has been streamlined through the lines of sensitivity of professionals to the actual social injustices faced by the noted ethnoracial blocs or through intentional efforts in professional-client ethnic matching (DelVecchio-Good et al., 2011).

Earlier anthropology views referencing cultural competence literature have addressed culture as a direct link to group membership both self-assigned and endorsed by others (DelVecchio-Good et al., 2011). Such an approach makes assumptions that the group members share commonalities which influence behavior regardless of the one's own experiences and the social context in which one has identified with. Contemporary anthropology references that culture should not be considered as a "fixed, homogeneous, intrinsic characteristic of individuals or groups," (Guarnaccia & Rodriguez, 1996) but as an entity that involves "flexible, ongoing process of transmitting and using knowledge that depends on dynamics both within communities and at the interface between ethnocultural communities and institutions of the larger society, like the health care system, as well as global networks" (Kirmayer, 2012).

As one of the pioneering efforts in social justice, the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) (1948) developed the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), a document outlining recommended standards communities should strive towards in regard to "humanity's inherently inalienable and indivisible basic human rights" on a global level (p. 1). Additionally, it was noted that social justice issues that include prejudices and discriminatory practices towards subgroups were embedded within societies and groups and highlighted UNGA (1948) offered the following declaration:

> Everyone is entitled to all the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration, without distinction of any kind, such as race, color, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status. Furthermore, no distinction shall be made on the basis of the political, jurisdictional or international status of the country or territory to which a person belongs, whether it be independent, trust, non-self-governing or under any other limitation of sovereignty. (p. 2)

The issue of boundaries between individual social justice and basic human rights issues was brought to the forefront.

The National Association of Social Workers (2015) also notes the historical notions of cultural competence being solely defined in terms of ethnicity and race factors, but have expanded to embrace the group identities as well as the diversity of all humans. Johnson and Munch (2009) also note that the intersection of the infinite combinations of identities within both singular categories poses varying results when addressing cultural constructs. Based on this school of thought, it is noted there has been misunderstanding of the true meaning of cultural competence which denotes the dynamics of solely race and ethnicity (Johnson & Munch, 2009).

Based on these dynamics, cultures undergo constant change, but continue to provide constructs to interpret the world in which individuals and their communities intersect.

Culture is linked with the micro to the macro views of interaction (Modood, 2007). While the individual understands culture within multiple associations and community affiliations, the culture of a community must be considered in terms of its overall connection with the larger society as it defines it position and constraints within and abroad. Such a view of culture predicates notions of perceived power and the politics of individuality and separatism (Modood, 2007).

Alignment of Multiculturalism and Social Justice

Ethnography studies conducted by Duntley-Matos (2014) in higher education settings reflected the following notion:

> Through the paradigms of transformative complicity, cultural humility, and empowerment, an analysis of the hidden curriculum (Hafferty & Franks, 1994) is recommended to promote a true alignment between the explicit and implicit expectations and practices in academia: one that is invested in ethical modeling and the ongoing evaluation of our protocols and human resource support systems. Equity cannot be sustained or inclusive diversity promoted through token representations that silence the voices of those we profess to include in "our academic homes." (p. 463)

Through these ethnography studies, it is suggested that a systemic overhaul of higher education is necessary to address the effects of "oppressive socio-economic disparities and veiled exclusionary institutional discourses and administrative protocols" that open the lines of communication and understanding (Duntley-Matos, 2014). Based on these findings, it is likely that a stronger alignment would develop among "the representations of inclusive diversity, the

implementation of transformative practices, and an atmosphere that is conducive to university capacity building and systemic empowerment" (Duntley-Matos, 2014).

Duntley-Matos (2014) notes that transformative complicity acknowledgment within institutional settings endorse acts of social justice in which there must be a willingness to enhance awareness and address policies and procedures that open the doors for the masses of leaders and not just a few chosen administrators. Through this process, it is suggested that institutions are able "to intervene upon the systemic inequalities perpetuated by policies that cannot be overturned in the short run, but which can be addressed through the gray areas of institutional practice" (Duntley-Matos, 2014). The conflicts of transformative complicity arise when contradictions are manifested in the variances between what is designated as important and actually done to promote acts of social justice (Duntley-Matos, 2014).

Through critical reflections about privilege and power, cultural humility is highly operational at the interpersonal levels between mentors and mentees, but reports of institutional biases intervene and strongly infuse the relationships and their development (Duntley-Matos, 2014). It is highlighted that in order for power inequity to be addressed thoroughly at the institutional and political levels, the processes of tracking concerns, intended risk sharing, and sacrificial actions, must be associated directly with cultural humility development (Duntley-Matos, 2014). Critical feminist paradigms, emphasizing individuation as a political domain, lead us from a negotiated sharing-of-risk to a strategically managed complicity that involves sacrifice (Duntley-Matos, 2014). Duntley-Matos (2014) suggests that using the feminist paradigms of managing complicity via sacrificial action and reflection has the propensity to positively transform institutional policies and practices.

Various viewpoints emphasize there has been a continuous link between multiculturalism and social justice in the field of counseling and helping professions. Perspectives recognize the significance of diversity and oppressive actions that have limiting effects on one's mental stability as well as promote the necessity of culturally competent individuals in the helping professionals. As an example, it is noted that the cultural counseling perspective has transformed from minimizing sociopolitical factors to embracing cultural variables which may affect relationships (Ponterotto et al., 2010). Paralleling this notion is the relevance of advocacy in addressing issues of social justice and systematic barriers to well-being (Constantine et al., 2007; Toporek et al., 2006).

The continuous link between multiculturalism and social justice has been brought to the forefront and echoed in the American Counseling Association's (2014) Code of Ethics in which social justice is defined as a mechanism by which cultural competence promotes "equity for all people and groups for the purpose of ending oppression and injustice affecting clients, students, counselors, families, communities, schools, workplaces, governments, and other social and institutional systems" (p. 21).

Within the developments of the multicultural counseling movement, Pederson (1991) designates this perspective as the "fourth force" among counseling models proceeded by the psychoanalytic, cognitive-behavioral, and humanistic paradigms. This cultural perspective emphasizes the importance of understanding cultural factors and the need to understand clients in the context of their own environment. Prior to the multicultural perspective, it was noted that the traditional counseling methods did not take into consideration sociopolitical factors to explore psychosocial development (Sue & Sue, 2008). By observing through a more extensive

viewpoint, a significant method arises to get to the core of client's outlooks and concerns (Sue & Sue, 2008).

The social justice counseling perspective has been labeled as the "fifth force" in the field of counseling (Ratts et al., 2004). This shift in counseling paradigms reportedly evolved in reaction to the need for alternative methods in addressing human development outside of the focus of repressive environmental circumstances that impede this development. Additionally, Ratts (2009) theorizes that the social justice paradigm shifted the helping and advocacy field in which the ways client issues are understood, what types of interventions are considered and utilized, and the role of the professional involved.

Advocacy Competencies

The establishment of cultural and advocacy competencies were birthed out of the rise of the multicultural and social justice movements. The creation of the Multicultural Counseling Competencies (MCCs) in 1991 by the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (AMCD) paved the way for the development of the American Counseling Association's (ACA) Advocacy Competencies which provided the foundation for implementing advocacy strategies and initiatives. To further connect the multicultural and social justice perspectives, the Multicultural and Advocacy Dimensions (MAD) model was formulated to emphasize the development of a therapeutic relationship (Ratts et al., 2016b).

Research labels multiculturalism and social justice as distinct entities coupled with the development of the Multicultural Counseling Competencies (MCCs) and Advocacy Competencies, elevates a need for clarification in the unification of these two paradigms and how they can be used in conjunction to complement each other. Lewis and Arnold (1998) emphasize the view of multiculturalism and social justice "as two sides of the same coin… It is a

short step from becoming aware of the impact of the cultural milieu to noticing the role of oppression in our clients' lives. Once we begin to notice systemic oppression, it is just one more short step to accepting our responsibility for social action" (Lewis & Arnold, 1998, p. 51).

With the assumption that multiculturalism and social justice are interrelated components in the process of multicultural competence development, the process of multiculturalism is then seen as a stimulus for social justice activism (Ratts et al., 2004); however, multicultural competence may have limitations when standing on its own. Vera and Speight (2003) highlight that multicultural competence may present limitations in addressing systemic barriers faced by clients while Rubel and Ratts (2007) emphasize that engaging in any form of social justice advocacy without the presence of the development of a sense of multicultural competence may offering services that exclude considerations for clients' cultural backgrounds. In turn, such limitations may impede competent multicultural practices and professional ethical standards are at risk.

Embracing the complimentary nature of multiculturalism and social justice through their respective competencies serves as a means to strengthen professionals' ability to connect with clients. It is important to note that the MCCs and Advocacy Competencies have been validated by the American Counseling Association which support the relevance of both multiculturalism and social justice to the field of counseling education (Hays, 2020). Additionally, Toporek et al. (2006) contended that the MCCs opened the pathway for the Advocacy Competencies and provide professionals more stable and comprehensive methods in effectively working with their clients.

The MCCs have been identified as useful in providing understanding the roles that bias, cultural factors, and oppressive elements play in clients' lives and their overall impact to the

services rendered. Equally, the Advocacy Competencies offer alternative methods by which community action is evoked through gaining awareness and knowledge of existing systemic barriers. It is noted that the theoretical foundation of both competencies can pose difficulty in implementing them simultaneously in practice; therefore, strategic methods should be further explored to bridge these professional platforms and execute meaningful interactions. The MCCs have been categorized into three distinctive areas as follows:

- the professional's awareness of their own cultural biases and value systems;
- the awareness of clients' worldview thought pattern; and,
- the use of culturally appropriate methods within the professional relationship. (Roysircar et al., 2003)

Inherent within each of the competence principle are the fundamental components of a professional's knowledge, belief system, and skills in relation to multicultural competence. At the initial level of awareness, the professional develops awareness of his/her own cultural background as well as that of his/her clientele, emphasizing the role of culture within the professional process. This process involves internal exploration and willingness to further expand upon one's current understanding, awareness, and skills (Arredondo et al., 1996).

The importance of the awareness of a client's worldview is emphasized in the second area of the MCCs. Sue and Sue (2008) suggest that one's worldview formulates the thought patterns, behaviors, and holistic view of the world. It is emphasized that understanding clients' worldviews is vital due to the diversity in views groups may potentially hold that differ from those of the dominant cultural groups. Lastly, the utilization of culturally appropriate methods and strategies are the third measure of MCCs which may incorporate unconventional means and practices to meet clients in their environment to better aid in their development (Sue & Sue, 2008).

With the emergence of the body of social justice scholarship and the state of society with reformative action at the helm, the MCCs also evolved to incorporate social justice within its competencies and now are formally known as the Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies (MSJCCs) (Ratts et al., 2016a). This update is reflective of the growing body of literature on the intersection of multicultural and social justice competence (NassarMcMillan, 2014; Singh & Salazar, 2010). Research suggests that the development of multicultural and social justice competence must be viewed as lifelong progression for the commitment to understanding and application into practice (Hook et al., 2013).

The intersectionality of identities has been introduced in the MSJCCs, offering a broader viewpoint than that of the MCCs which offered a single lens perspective on multicultural competence (Ratts et al., 2016a). Such an approach acknowledges the existence of several intersecting identities serves as an important forerunner to better understanding the complexities of well-being of individuals from marginalized groups (Bowleg, 2012). To take a step further, MSJCCs have incorporated action and advocacy into their competencies (Ratts et al., 2016a).

Various domains have been identified that contribute and intersect in multicultural and social justice practices as follows: (a) counselor self-awareness, (b) client worldview, (c) the counseling relationship, and (d) counseling and advocacy interventions (Ratts et al., 2016a). The MSJCCs suggest that attitudes and beliefs coupled with knowledge and skills lead to action (Ratts et al., 2016a). With the additions of advocacy and action, professionals are provided the foundation “to develop cultural and change-fostering, skill-based interventions… critical to achieving multicultural and social justice outcomes” (Ratts et al., 2016, p. 38). It is noted that multicultural and social justice competent professionals seek training opportunities to learn more

about how their power, privilege, and/or oppression influences the experiences of themselves and the clients they serve (Ratts et al., 2016a).

Comparable to Bronfenbrenner's (1981) ecological model of human development, the Advocacy Competencies present context for hypothesizing clients' concerns and issues from a perspective that encompasses the interconnectivity between client and environmental elements (Ratts et al., 2007). The premise of the Advocacy Competencies is reportedly related to the belief system that the client-centered approach to counseling is understood in terms of their personal environment (Ratts et al., 2007).

There are three levels noted within the Advocacy Competencies including advocacy for the following groups: (a) client/student, (b) school/community, and (c) the public (Bronfenbrenner, 1981). On each level, advocacy occurs along with and on behalf of individual clients/students and their community. The “microlevel” of advocacy is that of the client/student advocacy in which there is recognition of environmental factors that impact educational, career-related, and well-being (Bronfenbrenner, 1981). It is noted that empowerment methods support understanding of individuals’ lives in context and reduce external barriers that may be nonproductive in the process. At the “mesolevel” of advocacy, the collaborative efforts within the community are recognized and promoted to evoke social change (Bronfenbrenner, 1981). The value of networking is emphasized which increases access to community resources and services to remove environmental and systematic barriers which may affect client development. Within the public arena level, advocacy takes place at the “macrolevel” (Bronfenbrenner, 1981). Finally, the macrolevel of advocacy intertwines public data and social/political methods to promote action for the repeal of social injustice that exist systematically in various areas to include our public education and health care systems. It is noted that advocacy efforts are usually

strengthened when other levels are supportive and would present greater impact for the overall system versus isolated movement (Ratts et al., 2007).

The interconnection of the MCCs and Advocacy Competencies and the active expansion of multiculturalism and social justice advocacy have been illustrated through the development of the Multicultural and Advocacy Dimensions (MAD) model (Safran & Muran, 2000). As developed by Jones and McEwen (2000), the conceptual idea behind the MAD model's framework has been borrowed from the Multiple Dimensions of Identity (MDI) was identified as the foundation to the framework of the MAD model. The MDI model explores the various aspects of human diversity factors, including race, ethnicity, gender, and sexual orientation, and how they interact and the prominence of people's identities at specified time periods (Safran & Muran, 2000). This model raises questions to why people were more aware of some characteristics of identity than others during a specified time period. The big picture of MAD's framework offers the idea of fluidity within the three areas of the MCCs and the three distinctive levels of the Advocacy Competencies (Safran & Muran, 2000).

According to the works of Bordin (1979), the working alliance between the client and professional is a key component of the helping model. Within the MAD model, it is concluded that the core is centered on the task at hand, the bond, and goals of professional activity (Safran & Muran, 2000). The inclusion of the MCCs and Advocacy Competencies must be considered to incorporate multicultural and social justice factors within professional practices and interventions. These competencies are viewed as fluid and flowing throughout the course of the professional relationship. A number of reflective areas of the MAD model offer insight into competence level: the professionals' awareness of their own beliefs and values; the knowledge of

the client's worldview; culturally appropriate interventions and strategies; sociopolitical contexts and conditions; and self-reflection activities (Safran & Muran, 2000).

The National Sexual Violence Center (2012) facilitated focus groups to identify core skills and qualities of sexual violence prevention practitioners. There were three categories identified by the group members:

- personal qualities, including knowledge of community systems and resources, critical thinking skills, project management and leadership);
- community mobilization skills (crisis intervention, group discussion facilitation, and systems advocacy); and
- communication skills (public speaking skills, addressing goals, knowledge and ability to adapt to learning styles). (National Sexual Violence Center, 2012, p. 4)

Common themes were noted across the board to include prevention practitioners addressing "the root causes of sexual violence" and understanding "social justice activism" (National Sexual Violence Center, 2012, p. 2).

Infusion of Multicultural Competence into Student Affairs

It is emphasized that Student Affairs professionals play a major role in developing students holistically which may encompass social, intellectual, emotional, and spiritual factors (Major & Mangope, 2014). According to Love (2003) "student affairs professionals perform a varied mixture of leading, advising, counseling, educating, supervising, teaching, planning, and so forth" (p. 2), offering co-curricular activities intended to enhance lives outside of the classroom setting. With such a diversified body of work to manage, Student Affairs professionals ultimately are the decision-makers and their roles critical in addressing multicultural issues on

college campuses. There is a vital need for the “integration of multicultural awareness, knowledge and skills into practice” (Major & Mangope, 2014, p. 24).

Understanding the culture of higher education and Student Affairs has been at the forefront of addressing and shaping organizations (Kuk & Banning, 2009). It is emphasized that Student Affairs departments within colleges and universities are comprised of complexities to support the educational experiences and needs of both the students and institution (Kuh, 2003). The reasoning for such complexities is that many Student Affairs practitioners or professionals come from and have a variety of knowledge and expertise from other disciplines (Dungy, 2003).

The overall operation of Student Affairs is dependent upon the faculty, staff, and students and organizational culture structure. It is noted that most cultures have features of an organized entity with varying levels of formal structures which fit the mode of higher education (Strange, 2003). Strange (2003) emphasizes the combination of knowledge and expertise presents either dynamic environments that are flexible and tolerant of change or static environments that are resistant to change. Also, it is emphasized that in crisis management within institutions, Student Affairs must exhibit flexibility and adaptability when crisis episodes occur. Kuk and Banning (2009) also suggest that the organizational culture of Student Affairs should be able to change with the environment in order to effectively address the safety needs of its stakeholders.

Typically, Student Affairs’ divisions have been independent vessels which connect directly to various entities of the institution to include enrollment and student activities. However, there has been a shift in addressing the needs of students holistically which includes the need to address campus safety (Dungy, 2003). Even though campus safety was not connected to Student Affairs’ operations historically, the current shift indicates the need to embrace

adaptability in crisis management. Such needs may include the safety and protection of the student population, staff, and faculty as they arise in crisis situations.

As noted by Melody Werner, EdD, Title IX coordinator at Eastern Michigan University, Student Affairs' practitioners can play critical roles in the growth and development of their Title IX campus offices (McCarthy, 2017). Within these dynamics of managing institutional compliance, challenges of maintaining a balance between the various missions and viewpoints of associated with providing support and guidance for complainants and respondents, come into play (McCarthy, 2017).

Understanding the importance of diversity and multiculturalism at higher education institutions are mandatory to the state of Student Affairs professionals and ethical practice within the profession (Brown, 1991). The ability to develop professional programs that allow colleges and universities to cope with the increasing demands of constantly changing student bodies has also been prioritized (Brown, 1991). Nevertheless, Student Affairs practitioners have received minimal awareness training and professional development programs that prepare them to assume their roles as socializing agents in multicultural environments (McEwen & Ropper, 1994; Mueller & Pope, 2001). Such an issue is best described by Pope and Reynolds (1997) as multicultural incompetence. Similarly, Moore (2000) highlights the necessity of professional development in terms of "staff development is most effective when it is an ongoing process that includes appropriate, well thought-out training and individual follow-up through supportive observation and feedback, staff dialogues, study groups, mentoring, and peer coaching" (p. 14).

According to Pope and Reynolds (1997), multicultural competence is a heuristic tool that enables Student Affairs practitioners to deal with students who are culturally different. Additionally, it guides Student Affairs practitioners' ethical, affirmative, and professional

practices in establishing multicultural sensitive and affirming environments. Anderson (as cited in Bresciani, 2008) refers to multicultural competence as global competence wherein individuals learn how to express themselves without offending others' cultures, ideas, beliefs, and feelings. Bresciani (2008) argues that there is very little difference between global competence and multicultural competence if the notion of intellectual diversity is emphasized.

The lack of multicultural competence is problematic in the sense that it prevents Student Affairs practitioners from understanding themselves, which in turn obstructs their efforts in relating to culturally different others (Bresciani, 2008; Pope & Reynolds, 1997). Bresciani (2008) argues that Student Affairs practitioners cannot facilitate learning or even work with students of different cultures if they cannot distinguish their own culture, values, and beliefs. Therefore, Sue et al. (1982) developed a theoretical model that advances Student Affairs practitioners' multicultural skills in order to effectively handle multicultural issues and encourage the valuing of cultural differences. The tripartite model consists of multicultural awareness, multicultural knowledge, and multicultural skills (Pope & Reynolds, 1997). Pope and Reynolds (1997) explain that these three foundational constructs represent the scope of multicultural competence. According to Sue et al. (1982), multicultural awareness, knowledge, and skills are essential if Student Affairs practitioners are to work ethically and efficaciously across cultural differences.

Finally, Bresciani (2008) concludes that Student Affairs practitioners should not consider the development of multicultural competence as a sole indicator of success. Instead, they are required to incorporate outcome-based assessment strategies into their development activities in order to determine their institutional limitations and strengths. According to Pope and Reynolds (1997), the department of research and program evaluation needs to develop valid and reliable

assessment programs that help institutions in measuring the levels of multicultural competence that Student Affairs practitioners possess. The derived results will identify deficit areas and determine the main goals and objectives that multicultural development programs would address (Ebbers & Henry, 1990). Pope and Reynolds (1997) explain that the development of multicultural awareness, knowledge, and skills is an ongoing process that necessitates continuous learning and evaluation.

Overview of Title IX Legislation

Title IX legislation's trajectory has flowed and subsided over the past forty-five years throughout transitions in the political climate and within our society. The increased reporting of sexual assault on college campuses has gained widespread attention in recent years. Title IX legislation mandates that all educational programs and activities receiving such funding must function in a nondiscriminatory manner to include admissions and recruitment, athletics, counseling services, employment, sex-based harassment and discrimination (U.S. Department of Education, 2020b).

Landmark legislation policies have made major gains in the pursuit of equity in education and the workplace since the latter part of the 20th century. With the establishment of Commission on the Status of Women by President John F. Kennedy in 1961, issues of gender equity in education and the workplace were at the forefront; findings supported gender discrimination as systematic and widespread (Schubert-Madsen & Schubert, 1991). Based on these findings, Congress constituted laws to contest such discrimination including the Equal Pay Act of 1963 which demanded equal pay for equal work and Title VII (amended to the 1964 Civil Rights Act) which prohibited employment discrimination based on sex. Even with previous

legislation addressing various areas of discrimination, none specifically offered gender-based discrimination protection within educational institutions (Wade-Gravett, 1996).

Title IX was modeled in part after the Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 due to a federal case involving discriminatory employment practices in 1969 at the University of Maryland with the need to address these concerns in the educational setting (Smith, 2011). As a provision of the 1972 Educational Amendments Act, Title IX legislation came into existence to address these gaps in civil rights regulations, specifically gender discrimination in educational institutions (Passeggi, 2002). Title IX legislation was designed to restrict and rectify discriminatory acts and practices within federally funded programs, stating that "no person in the United States shall, on the basis of sex be excluded from participation in, or denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education or activity receiving federal aid" (Passeggi, 2002).

Legal cases have expanded over past four decades to cover both the definition of gender-based discrimination as well as the institution's responsibility to respond to reported allegations (U.S. Department of Education, 2020e; Wilson, 2014). In the 1980 federal case Alexander v. Yale University set the precedence in using Title IX to support allegations of sexual harassment by four female undergraduate students and a male professor against an educational institution (Alexander v. Yale University, 1977). The complainants indicated Yale was negligent in providing an effective grievance process to manage sexual harassment complaints and considered such action as a violation of the Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 (Alexander v. Yale University, 1977). Although Yale won this case, it instituted a grievance procedure based on the federal court's finding of quid pro quo dilemmas relating to academic advancement constituted sex discrimination (Alexander v. Yale University, 1977; Wilson, 2014).

In the 1999 Davis v. Monroe County Board of Education case, it was clarified that actions of gender-based discrimination, sexual harassment, and sexual violence student to student are also included in the range of Title IX (Davis v. Monroe County Board of Education, 1999; Wilson, 2014). In the 2003 Kelly v. Yale University case, it was ruled that universities must be responsive to students' reported allegations in a prompt and appropriate manner (Kelly v. Yale University, 2003; Wilson, 2014). These two federal cases set the tone for reviewing, defining, and gender-based discrimination and institutions' responsibilities in managing Title IX cases (U.S. Department of Education, 2020e; Wilson, 2014).

The Jeanne Clery Disclosure of Campus Security Policy and Campus Crime Statistics Act (Clery Act) of 1990 has become a significant part of the regulatory framework for developing and implementing campus safety measures and crime prevention policies and procedures at higher education institutions (Office of Postsecondary Education, 2020). The Clery Act was named after Jeanne Clery, a student raped and murdered in her dorm room by another student on April 5, 1986 (Know Your IX, 2020). The Clery Act mandates higher education institutions to provide timely warnings of crimes that present a threat to the campus safety of the college community and provide public access to their campus security policies (U.S. Department of Education, 2019). The Clery Act is comprised of the Campus Sexual Assault Victim's Bill of Rights that requires higher education institutions to release information their educational programming, campus disciplinary procedures, and victim rights (Know Your IX, 2020).

The Clery Act also requires that crime statistics be collection, reporting, and dissemination of sexual assault crimes, hate crimes, Violence Against Women Act offenses, and other criminal offenses that occurred on their campuses and specified adjacent areas on an annual basis (U.S. Department of Education, 2019). It is noted that the intent of the Clery Act is to

provide transparency to the college community with accurate information on campus safety issues in a timely manner in order to make informed decisions (Davis, 2020; Office of Postsecondary Education, 2020; U.S. Department of Education, 2019). In October 2020, the U.S. Department of Education on Friday rescinded its long-standing guidance within the 2016 Handbook for Campus Safety and Security Reporting regarding the Clery reporting procedures for higher education institutions (Office of Postsecondary Education, 2020). This guidance was replaced with a simplified appendix in the Federal Student Aid Handbook and intended to offer flexibility in tracking crimes and determining occurring on public property within a mile radius of the institution (Bauer-Wolf, 2020; Office of Postsecondary Education, 2020).

The Clery Act has played a significant role in two separate investigations by the Federal Student Aid (FSA) and the Office for Civil Rights (OCR) that resulted in the U.S. Department of Education issuing a historical $4.5 million fine and a mandate for revisions of sexual abuse reporting to the Michigan State University (U.S. Department of Education, 2019). Additionally, the U.S. Department of Education issued fines for Clery violations to the University of California, Berkeley at $2.4 million and Baylor University more than $461,000 (Bauer-Wolf, 2020).

The Violence Against Women Act of 1994 (VAWA) also serves as a federal law with influence on Title IX rulings. The VAWA Reauthorization is an amended section to the Clery Act which mandates all higher education institutions to educate the college community on the prevention of sexual violence (Office of Postsecondary Education, 2020). Such legalization increased the standards for institutions to respond, handle disciplinary proceedings, and educate on these issues (Lhamon, 2014).

Under the revised 2020 Title IX Rule, the Clery Act and VAWA have set the foundation in defining the four categories of sexual assault, domestic violence, stalking, and dating violence on the basis of sex (U.S. Department of Education, 2020e). Particularly, VAWA amended the Clery Act to mandate institutions to collect data for incidents of the previously noted four categories and to be inclusive of policies, procedures, and programs relating to these occurrences in their annual reporting (Federal Register, 2014). VAWA expanded the rights afforded to college campus survivors within the previously noted four categories (Clery Center, 2020). Three significant legal cases involved the federal courts upholding VAWA confidentiality protections and denying the disclosure of VAWA confidentiality protected information during the course of state court proceedings: Hawke v. United States Department of Homeland Security, Demaj v. Sakaj, and Romain v. Napolitano (Erickson & Orloff, 2014).

In 2011, the Dear Colleague Letter was issued by the Office for Civil Rights which mandated all institutions receiving federal funding to designate Title IX Coordinators to take on the responsibilities of proactive prevention, compliance, and training to address sexual misconduct (U.S. Department of Education, 2020e). This letter also provided direction on how schools receiving federal financial aid assistance were mandated to not only take proactive measures to prevent incidents, but also respond appropriately to gender-discrimination, sexual harassment, and sexual violence under Title IX legislation (U.S. Department of Education, 2020e). There were three clarifications to this Dear Colleague Letter relevant to the work of higher education professionals to include the following: (1) identifying sexual violence as a type of gender-based discrimination; (2) designating an institutional employee to monitor Title IX-related issues on each campus and to align them with an outlined grievance procedure, and (3)

training for those engaged in this grievance and reporting process (Ali, 2011; U.S. Department of Education, 2020e).

Title IX mandates that all educational programs and activities receiving federal funding must function in a nondiscriminatory manner to include processes and procedures with admissions and recruitment, athletics, counseling services, employment, sex-based harassment, and discrimination (U.S. Department of Education, 2020b). The noted Dear Colleague Letter notification outlined that schools were responsible for taking action on any reported allegations that were initiated by students, institutional employees, or third parties connected to these entities. This position also involved overseeing the entire investigative process and ensuring this process was fair and equitable for all parties involved (Sieben, 2011). As a national victims' rights advocate and Director of the National Campus Safety Initiative, Daniel Carter emphasizes in the Chronicle of Higher Education that "in the current environment, being a Title IX Coordinator can be a challenging assignment ... but it's an important challenge for higher education to take on." (June, 2014, p. 13).

In addition to designating specific employees to address Title IX concerns, the 2011 Dear Colleague Letter indicated revisions from the 1972 Title IX legislation to indicate "employees likely to witness or receive reports of sexual harassment and violence, including teachers, school law enforcement unit employees, school administrators, school counselors, general counsels, health personnel, and resident advisors," must also be trained in the appropriate reporting processes (Ali, 2011, p. 4). Ambiguousness existed in the letter as to which employees would be connected to the grievance and reporting processes as each institution was given leeway to determine its trainees (Tillman et al., 2014).

Ultimately, the institutions make the final decisions on who is designated as the mandated reporters, but must offer a specified, inclusive method in the selection of these employees. In 2014, the Office for Civil Rights outlined the significance of a mandated reporter as "any employee who has the authority to take action to redress sexual violence . . . or whom a student could reasonably believe has this authority or duty" (Lhamon, 2014, p. 17) and extended this guidance to identify all employees considered as mandated reporters. Additionally, the 2014 guidance reportedly placed a mandate upon institutions to "provide training to all employees likely to witness or receive reports of sexual violence, including teachers, professors, school law enforcement unit employees, school administrators, school counselors, general counsels, athletic coaches, health personnel, and resident advisors" to include "what should be included in a report and any consequences for the failure to report" (Lhamon, 2014, p. 38).

In 2016, federal guidance was released that applied specifically to students' rights whose "internal sense of gender" differed from the "sex designation recorded on an infant's birth certificate" (Lhamon & Gupta, 2016, p. 1). This update indicates that the student's gender identity is acknowledged regardless of any "medical diagnosis or treatment" and "requiring students to produce identification documents in order to treat them consistent with their gender identity may violate Title IX" (Lhamon & Gupta, 2016, p. 1).

The 2016 update also "requires schools to provide transgender students with equal access to educational programs and activities" regardless of the circumstances others may deny because "the desire to accommodate others' discomfort cannot justify a policy that singles out and disadvantages a particular class of students" (Lhamon & Gupta, 2016, p. 1). This updated 2016 letter was ultimately withdrawn by the Department of Education in February 2017 as officials emphasized the necessity to take into consideration all of the legal ramifications involved (Battle

& Wheeler, 2017). The legislation regarding transgender individuals is still under consideration. The Wall Street Journal's editorial board offers the prediction that the Dear Colleague letter on transgender students will ignite litigation for years to come (Pruitt, 2016).

An editorial in the New York Times by Yale law professor Peter Schuck emphasizes that the Department of Education does not have any authority to alter Title IX regulations as they are the responsibility of the U.S. Congress and the federal courts, not of government staff (Schuck, 2016). It is noted that the Administrative Procedure Act mandates that the government publishes "a proposed policy, explain its rationale, and solicit public comments before it enacts a new rule. By ignoring the notice and comment process in this case, the ED has aborted a much-needed public debate over whether identity-based bathroom use can and should be regulated as a legal right, or merely left as an option" (Schuck, 2016).

In recent years, the 2017(a) notification issued by U.S. Department of Education (2017a) indicated withdrawn statements of the guidance offered in the Dear Colleague Letter on Sexual Violence (issued in April, 2011) and the Questions and Answers on Title IX and Sexual Violence (issued in April, 2014) which mandated procedures that involved institutions receiving federal funding to conduct investigations, adjudications, and resolution of accusations. It is noted that the 2011 Letter and the 2014 Questions and Answers have placed "improper pressure upon universities to adopt procedures that do not afford fundamental fairness" and have resulted in institutions resolving allegations that "lack the most basic elements of fairness and due process, are overwhelmingly stacked against the accused, and are in no way required by Title IX law or regulation" (U.S. Department of Education, 2017b).

Under the noted circumstances, the U.S. Department of Education (2017a) has decided to withdraw the 2011 Letter and the 2014 Questions and Answers which address student sexual

misconduct to respond "to the concerns of stakeholders and that aligns with the purpose of Title IX to achieve fair access to educational benefits... intends to implement such a policy through a rulemaking process that responds to public comment." It is noted that this letter does not indicate any additional requirements to applicable law (U.S. Department of Education, 2017a).

In providing clarification on interim measures required by institutions, the U.S. Department of Education (2017b) noted that individualized services must be extended to both reporting and responding parties involved in a sexual misconduct case from the point of initiation throughout its duration and adjust as necessary throughout this process. It is also noted that an institution "may not rely on fixed rules or operating assumptions that favor one party over another, nor may a school make such measures available only to one party" (U.S. Department of Education, 2017b).

As noted by the Department of Education's proposed Title IX regulations, the rescinded 2011 Dear Colleague Letter on Sexual Violence reportedly opens the opportunity for institutions and students to gain more clarity on their options as rights while gaining due process protections through clear, formal rules (U.S. Department of Education, 2018). As noted by Betsy Devos, U.S. Secretary of Education, "our proposed rule recognizes that we can continue to combat sexual misconduct without abandoning due process… federal standards should align with Supreme Court precedent that set out when schools are liable for monetary damages under Title IX in private lawsuits" (Perez & Quilantan, 2020). Joel Levin, co-founder of the nonprofit Stop Sexual Assault in Schools organization, notes that "schools are not all prepared to handle these incidents as they occur right now… the new regulations will just create a more chaotic environment. The Department of Education has tried to bring some college or higher education-level Title IX rules into K-12, where they don't really work" (Perez & Quilantan, 2020).

In the long-awaited release, the U.S. Department of Education (2020a) announced its final regulations governing campus sexual assault under Title IX at federally funded institutions. As a result, it is a requirement for higher education institutions to comply with these regulations by August 14, 2020. As noted by an official press release rendered by the U.S. Department of Education (2020a), U.S. Secretary of Education Betsy DeVos outlined a framework which emphasized the following:

> Too many students have lost access to their education because their school inadequately responded when a student filed a complaint of sexual harassment or sexual assault," said Secretary DeVos. "This new regulation requires schools to act in meaningful ways to support survivors of sexual misconduct, without sacrificing important safeguards to ensure a fair and transparent process. We can and must continue to fight sexual misconduct in our nation's schools, and this rule makes certain that fight continues. (p. 1)

Although legal obligations also apply to K-12 schools, the U.S. Department of Education (2020a) outlines several key provisions for higher education institutions to address including the following: new definition of sexual harassment, options to report sexual harassment, supportive measures for both parties, and live hearing proceedings. Also, the U.S. Department of Education (2020a) notes that the final rule prohibits institutions from enforcing Title IX measures in ways which deny both students and faculty of their rights as guaranteed by the First Amendment to the U.S. Constitution. Within this context, “students, teachers, faculty, and others should enjoy free speech and academic freedom protections, even when speech or expression is offensive” within the educational environment (U.S. Department of Education, 2020f, p. 1). It is important to note that the final rule does not condone retaliation when exercising rights protected under the First Amendment (U.S. Department of Education, 2020f).

Role of Title IX Professional Associations and Organizations

In response to the U.S. Department of Education's revocation of the 2011 Dear Colleague Letter and the 2014 Questions and Answers on Title IX and Sexual Violence, a number of organizations have offered insight on next steps for consideration. ATIXA, CUPA-HR, and SHRM offer perspectives into the next phases in this undefined process and serve as resources as guidelines are further questioned and considered.

The Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA) (2017) has been recognized as the United States' only membership association focused solely on Title IX compliance and resources for those holding such responsibilities in higher education. The Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA) (2017) emphasizes that "gender equity remains an inherent good in education, and would be so even if Title IX had never been enacted... yet, Title IX was enacted 45 years ago, and the trajectory of Title IX has never been defined nor will it ever be solely by the four year term of any one administration" (p. 1). Based on Title IX's 2001 Guidance, the justice system still requires prompt action upon accusations. It is noted that any institution not prioritizing Title IX cases may be faced with criticism and backlash from federal judges and institutional stakeholders (ATIXA, 2017). Although the sub-regulatory guidance for Title IX legislation has made a shift, ATIXA (2017) notes that requirements to ensure freedom from any type of discrimination based on sex or gender on both legal and moral obligations are in existence. ATIXA's President, Brett Sokolow, predicts the proposed regulations produce a "systemic failure… I think the system potentially collapses under the weight of the litigation that comes from this" (Perez & Quilantan, 2020).

The NCHERM Group, a practice in higher education-specific law practices, offers risk management, consulting, and proactive prevention services in the field through its oversight of

the ATIXA and NaBITA membership organizations. In an open letter about sexual violence by Brett Sokolow and the NCHERM Group Partners, it was noted that the Dear Colleague Letter issued by the Office of Civil Rights in April 2011 has adjusted the landscape of higher education forever with implications to institutions pivoting to manage gender equity and quickly responding to these mandates to change existing policies and procedures. Such mandates led to the increase in reporting by students and college personnel nationwide (The NCHERM Group, 2014). The NCHERM Group (2014) recommends that definitive orders for prevention should be issued at the federal level to those entities handling campus sexual violence issues and also provides the necessary resources institutions need to accept such compliance and prevention orders.

CUPA-HR (2017), an association designated for human resources professionals, explores emerging trends and workforce development issues as well as partners with related associations on advocacy efforts to directly impact issues in higher education workplace issues. CUPA-HR (2017) notes that institutions should proceed with caution when considering alterations to the current Title IX practices. It is suggested that these changes have been outlined by the U.S. Department of Education may be of a temporary nature. Further changes in the federal guidelines have been expected to include differing standards of evidence as well as similar practices in mandating the position of a Title IX Coordinator on campuses received federal funding.

CUPA-HR (2017) has noted that there have been hundreds of modifications and elimination of higher education rules rendered by the Department of Education since 2000, but rarely any processes that directly affect Title IX with only three formal changes in discriminatory practices since its initiation in 1975. CUPA-HR (2017) contends that “replacing legally binding but unclear guidance with legally binding and clear regulations, and soliciting input from all

sides in doing so, is a very good idea that will result in clearer regulations and, we hope, greater protections for all students" (p. 1).

In response to the 2017 Dear Colleague letter and new guidance on Title IX issued by the Office of Civil Rights, ATIXA (2017) notes the following:

> It is about commitment, not compliance. Gender equity remains an inherent good in education, and would be so even if Title IX had never been enacted. Yet, Title IX was enacted 45 years ago, and the trajectory of Title IX has never been defined nor will it ever be solely by the four-year term of any one administration. Schools now have the opportunity to develop and enhance a commitment to Title IX from within and to envision what we should be doing, rather than what we must be doing. (p. 1)

The Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA, 2017) emphasizes that fundamentals in upholding protections against discrimination and harassment on the basis of sex and gender remain regardless of the relaxed timeframe and uncertainty of regulatory expectations issued. The Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA, 2017) affirms that "any school that deprioritizes Title IX may quickly find itself on the wrong side of a federal judge, campus activists, or both but certainly on the wrong side of history" as they may be subjected to challenges by these entities in the interim (p. 2). The Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIX, 2017) notes that it supports revisions to make Title IX policies and procedures more balanced but, emphasizes that "rulemaking should also not be used as an excuse to remove the moral, ethical, and legal obligation institutions have to address sex and gender-based harassment, which includes sexual violence" (p. 2). Emphasis has been placed on avoiding the compromise of the protection of all parties involved with the existing protections in place.

Since the May 6, 2020 release of the final rule of the Title IX regulations, the Department of Education has received responses from several professional organizations which have ignited controversy (Neelakantan, 2020). As Anderson (2020) notes, the responses present varying degrees of support of the modified due process protections as noted by the Foundation for Individual Rights in Education (FIRE). Additionally, there has been dissent due to a number of concerns including the timing of the release during the Coronavirus pandemic, new evidence processes, and cross-examination standards as issued by the Know Your IX, a national advocacy organization (Anderson, 2020). There are looming provisions as well as ramifications that are forthcoming as the final rule is established at higher education institutions.

The Impact of Racial and Gender-Based Sexuality Stereotypes and Perceptions

As previously noted, it important to acknowledge the role of racial marginalization in Title IX impacts service delivery and decision-making; however, inequities in gender and gender identification must also raise concern. Although the broader culture has embraced the notion of inclusivity, explicit dehumanizing attitudes and actions remain prevalent (Anderson et al., 2018). Stereotypes of Black sexuality include a generalized view that "Black or African-descended individuals are more sexually desirous, experienced, available, indiscriminate, and skilled than are White or Europe and descended individuals" (George & Martinez, 2002, p. 110).

Additionally, Black sexuality has been covertly associated with animalistic and mechanistic perceptions that are representative of forms of dehumanization (Goff et al., 2008). In alignment with this thought are stereotypes about Black sexuality and the premise that racism and racial factors such as have influence and upon rape victim blaming affecting the judgements involving Black individuals (Cowan & Campbell, 1994; George & Martinez, 2002; Sapp et al., 1999). Research suggests that the propensity to dehumanize minority groups is linked to

increased social exclusion (Viki et al., 2012) and more severe punishment and punitive actions (Bastian et al., 2013).

When the two aspects of race and gender intersect, the concept of the unrapability of Black women is brought to the forefront. Gender-specific stereotypes of Black women lean towards them "being promiscuous and unrapeable" as compared to White women (George & Martinez, 2002, p. 110), "are 'unrapeable' because of their wanton, chronically promiscuous nature" (White et al., 1998, p. 159) and their marginalized societal status (Royce, 2020). Black women have been more frequently shown in media in an animalistic manner and being objectified in a greater magnified than White women (Turner, 2011). Research suggests that Black women who conform to the ideal body shape (Gervais et al., 2013) and body size (Holland & Haslam, 2013) are comparatively more likely to attract the objectifying regard than White women. As emphasized by White and Sharpley-Whiting (1997), Black women have been subjected to an unrapability narrative throughout history that has functioned as "a code of silence, self-erasure, in the name of race solidarity" within and beyond Black communities to the point of worthlessness, unbelievability, and invisibility. It is suggested that acts of aggression and violence resulting from racist and sexist perceptions held within society may be viewed as continuous torment experienced by women of color (White & Sharpley-Whiting, 1997).

Gender-specific stereotypes of men also present important considerations for this research. Black men portray them as "being overendowed and prone to rape White women" (George & Martinez, 2002, p. 110). Similar to the animalistic connotations associated with Black women, the Black-ape metaphor has been associated with negative imagery of bestial tendencies of Black men (Goff et al., 2008). Smiley and Fakunle (2016) note that brute imagery was brought to mainstream media in the 1915 film "Birth of a Nation" highlighting Black men as

barbarians attempting to attack White women, and in such, reinforcing associations with criminalization while depicting the violence from the Ku Klux Klan from a heroic perspective. Additionally, negative connotations and use of terminology such as *thug* have been associated with Black men and linked to the exploitation of legal issues as well as misperceived attributes to justify their unlawful treatment and discriminatory legal judgements (Smiley & Fakunle, 2016).

Additionally, the effect of gender silence when men are raped is prevalent to this research. It is noted that themes held by male rape victims' are reflective of females' in that they may embody shame, self-blame, and inadequacy and limit self-disclosure, due in part to victim blaming, while rarely gaining assistance from support services such as legal, health, and mental healthcare (Riccardi, 2010; Sleath & Bull, 2010). The loss of manliness and subjected stigma from rape play roles in masculine identity, affecting immediate and long-term coping and survival following the rape and long-term with their experience of being raped (Riccardi, 2010; Sleath & Bull, 2010).

Summary

Chapter 2 offered a review of the literature that expresses the significance of educational training, presents data regarding its effectiveness, and highlights its role in aiding the further development of multicultural competence. This literature review highlighted research on the historical path and transfusion of both Title IX policies and multicultural competence into higher education. Relevant conceptual frameworks relating to transformative adult learning were considered. Overall, the research emphasized that higher education professionals faced imperative tasks in reforming procedures and redefining the service delivery and structure of their Title IX practices. This is initiated through the intentional self-discovery, development, and

evolvement in multicultural competence through open and active communication, social encounters, and professional development training.

An empirical study by Jones and McEwen (2000) establishes the importance of having the professional take the responsibility in incorporating his or her cultural considerations within the professional relationship and growing in their self-beliefs and confidence in his or her abilities over time. The Multicultural Counseling Competency Model (Sue, 2008) serves as beneficial as it adaptable to a variety of situations and service professions. Title IX Coordinators have access to utilize this framework to gain better understanding of cultural competence within their personal, organizational, and community practices. Additionally, the MCC Model may assess professionals' thought processes about ways in which they practice and apply cultural competence in relation to the collective body of higher education. The MCC Model also sustains the original three dimensions of cultural competence for professional practice to include awareness, knowledge, and skills (Sue et al., 1992).

Within the defined roles of Title IX Coordinators, self-awareness is a key component wherein they oversee the investigation process and empower a team of Title IX Investigators, students, faculty, and staff through this process. By knowing oneself, any subconscious or external visible forms of prejudice, bias, and/or discrimination toward a certain cultural group or student may be eliminated (Pope-Davis et al., 2003). Engaging in formal training, educational programming, and/or cultural interactions, knowledge in cultural competence can be enhanced. Cultural knowledge may define one's competence level during a given time frame or over an extended time period. Within the third component to the Multicultural Counseling Competency Model, skills are noted as those in direct relation to one's professional practice (Sue, 2001). For Title IX Coordinators, this may encompass varied soft skills such as observation, processing, and

communication as well as hard skills such as group safety, risk management and interpersonal interactions during professional practice. The skills related directly to cultural competence may be acquired through professional training and varied cultural experiences and interactions.

From the perspective of the multidimensional version of the original MCC Model by Sue (2001), it is noted that organizational systems affect professional practice by transferring the three aspects of cultural competence (awareness, knowledge, and skills) “from the bottom-up or the op-down, through the organizational, professional, or community systems in place” (Perez & Luquis, 2008, p. 48). This MCDD model permits diverse conversion and modifications into various professional practices serving the needs of its targeted populations (Sue, 2001). Lastly, the MCC and MCDD models serve as informative resources for Title IX Coordinators striving for enhanced cultural relations and associations with diverse populations and may be more enhanced with guidance from them.

Since Title IX’s inception, the legality and political components of this legislation have come more prevalent and taken a more serious tone in reference to removing gender discrimination from educational institutions and their practices. As this process continues to evolve, so do the issues that are being addressed in the scope and focus of Title IX legislation.

Although cultural competence may extend over the lifetime of work for Title IX Coordinators, developing awareness, knowledge, and skills serve as fundamental steps toward gaining cultural competence in professional practice. The literature review suggests that with the increasingly diverse student population and the increase of reported Title IX allegations, higher education institutions must continuously strive to meet the historical and emerging needs of society at large, including the improvements in the development and implementation of culturally competent practices.

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

Chapter 3 is designed as the roadmap of the research study and outlines the steps I plan to take for data collection. Despite our increasingly diverse culture and the importance of cultural competence at the forefront of higher education commentary, a review of the empirical literature offers limited research and context-specific studies on cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators. The existing literature makes an appeal for restorative justice which aligns with the need for cultural competence training (Karp & Sacks, 2014; Koss et al., 2014; Vail, 2019). This formal comparative study will examine professional development focused on cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators in higher education. Representatives from three training programs were interviewed to explore the initial development, implementation, evaluation process, and evolution of these programs.

Chapter 3 will also outline the researcher's data collection processes and limitations of this research. Lastly, the strategies utilized to address issues of credibility and trustworthiness is outlined. The findings will offer interpretive results to legitimize this current research study by revealing an existing gap between awareness, knowledge, and practices in multicultural competence.

Guiding Questions

The findings and subsequent data analysis contribute to further insight into this comparative study. Through a conceptual understanding of cultural competence training programs available through three professional organizations, the following overarching research question was established with the noted sub-questions: What are the similarities and differences in cultural competence training programs designed for Title IX Coordinators by the Association

of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), the College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)?

1. What steps are taken in the program development process?
2. What are the main factors contributing to training implementation?
3. What measures are considered when assessing and tracking performance and/or training effectiveness?
4. What factors have impacted the evolution of the training?

The noted questions remain the base from which this study is initiated. With the focus on professional development options for Title IX Coordinators, an in-depth understanding of the development, implementation, evaluation process, and evolution of cultural competence training programs is expected to be gained.

Inquiry Design and Rationale

This research study specifically aims to analyze the cultural competence professional development for Title IX Coordinators offered by three organizations. Additionally, this research study seeks to illustrate the value of the standardizing characteristics as a paradigm for characterizing, comparing, and contrasting varying cultural competence training models. Lastly, this research study intends to analyze and compare how factors, including historical, social, political, and economic conditions, have impacted the development and evolution of these cultural competence training programs. Although professional membership and/or cultural competence credentialing is not mandated for Title IX Coordinators, the selected organizations serve as resources to offer training and examine historical data, trends, and research in the field of professional development. Additionally, examining three organizations offers diverse perspectives and added value to the field of cultural competence training.

In order to examine the cultural competence training programs, this research study utilizes a qualitative comparative study approach in conjunction with document analysis for each training program. Bogdan and Biklen (2007) describe qualitative research as an “umbrella term” (p. 2) which encompasses varied research strategies yet includes distinct features, corroborating the existence of useful, relevant data. Yilmaz (2013) indicates that qualitative researchers interpret social phenomena as multifaceted and intertwined, and should not be reduced to remote variables, but rather to further expand upon the totality of the phenomenon. As noted by Bogdan and Biklen (2007), the use of qualitative methods offers the means to gain a wide-ranging, rich data collection supporting the noted phenomenon of multicultural competence. Staller (2010) describes qualitative research as less controlled than that of quantitative research.

Using qualitative methods offers insight into real experiences of professionals and serves as a gateway to freely tell stories from their perspectives. Bogdan and Biklen (2007) label the collection of qualitative data as “soft” (p. 2) in reference to the type of data collected and the limited control the researcher has with the evolving findings. Qualitative research is noted to provide exclusive features which do not apply to features within quantitative studies.

Method triangulation will be used in this qualitative study to support data collection through interviews, supporting documentation, and observation. As Polit and Beck (2012) note, method triangulation uses multiple data collection approaches to address a common phenomenon. Within qualitative research, triangulation has been perceived as a strategy to test validity through the merging of data from different sources (Patton, 1999). This method triangulation will enhance the quality of the qualitative analysis by engaging three collection techniques.

Creswell (2007) illustrates case studies as a qualitative method in which "the investigator explores a bounded system (a case) or multiple bounded systems (cases) over time, through detailed, in-depth data collection involving multiple sources of information and reports a case description and case-based themes" (p. 73). In later research, Creswell (2013) outlines the typical collection may include that of "extensive forms, such as documents, and records, interviews, observation, and physical artifacts for 1 to 4 cases" (p. 148). This current research study has selected three programs pertinent to Title IX Coordinators' training to further explore. Such collection will be supported by semi-structured interviews by representatives from the three programs, public documents, and website data.

In Creswell's exploration of qualitative inquiry and research design, he indicates that good research presents the "assumptions, paradigms, and frameworks explicit in the writing of a study and, at a minimum be aware they influence the conduct of inquiry" (Creswell, 2013, p. 15). Creswell examines four of these paradigms as follows: post positivism, social constructivism, advocacy/participatory, and pragmatism. According to the commentary of Norwich (2019), Guba delineates a paradigm as "the basic belief system or worldview that guides the investigator, not only in choices of method but in ontologically and epistemologically fundamental ways" (p. 243).

Guba and Lincoln (1994) notes there are four paradigms that have contended "…for acceptance as the paradigm of choice in informing and guiding inquiry, especially qualitative inquiry" (p. 105) and are as follows: positivism, post-positivism, critical theory, and constructivism. The worldview/paradigm that is most representative of my perspective is that of constructivism in which the goal is of understanding and reconstructing views based on new interpretations (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). Ultimately, these new viewpoints potentially lead to

improvement and/or enhancement. The criterion for progression is that over time, individuals gain more informed constructions and gain awareness of the content and meaning of competing constructions (Guba & Lincoln, 1994, p. 130).

Case Selection

In designing a qualitative comparative study, researchers must initially establish the element of comparison and the phenomena that will be researched and compared. According to Manzon (2007), a "meaningful comparative study should be able to identify the extent and the reasons for commonalities and differences between the units of comparison, examining the causes at work and the relationships between those causes" (p. 100). In this research study, the elements of comparison and contrast are that of the development process, implementation steps, evaluative measures, and evolution of cultural competence training for the selected three training programs. Similarly, Pallant (2007) describes this comparative research design in terms of the variances between groups without influencing them in any manner.

Structure for Comparative Analysis

The framework for the research study's comparative analysis is modified from the comparative inquiry structure outlined by Phillips and Schweisfurth (2006), which emphasizes Bereday's four-step process of comparative analysis comprised of description, interpretation, juxtaposition, and simultaneous comparison. The underlying purpose of comparative analysis is "to identify the extent and the reasons for commonalities and differences between the units of comparison examining the causes at work, and the relationships between those causes" (Manzon, 2007, p. 88). As noted by Creswell (2007), this research study incorporates a within-case and a cross-case analysis to examine and compare the three confined cases in which cultural competence training resides.

Ethical Considerations

Permission to conduct this qualitative comparative study was granted from the East Carolina University Institutional Review Board (IRB) following a detailed review of the research study proposal to ensure that compliance regarding human subjects was followed accordingly (see Appendix A). Copies of the "Consent to Participate" were sent to those individuals and professional requests to recruit participants were made (see Appendix C). The purpose of these forms was to provide a description of the purpose and study guidelines. Participants reviewed and provided consent via email prior to the interview session with me. Due to the ethical obligation of maintaining confidentiality, I informed the participants that a pseudonym would be utilized in the data to protect their identities.

Inquiry Procedures

The primary data collection tool for this qualitative case study was the semi-structured interview. Interviews create opportunities for conversations with the participants in studies (Lodico et al., 2010). Gagnon (2010) concludes interviews are among the most valuable sources of research information. Utilizing a semi-structured interview model offered the means to ask clarifying questions and probe further into their responses for more extensive data. Within an individualized semi-structured interview approach, the amount of freedom by the respondent was limited, but there was some leeway allowed for additional investigation by the interviewer (Gagnon, 2010).

Additionally, Baskarada (2014) notes a researcher's utilization of a semi-structured interview model allows for autonomy to reframe and/or prompt questions for clarification based on emerging information. Creswell (2012) notes that clarification also stems from interview questions which begin with open-ended responses by the respondents which are followed by

prompts to further explain these answers. All but one interview was conducted via Microsoft Teams which was a phone conversation.

Description of Participants and Recruitment Strategies

To offer a requisite variety of data and perspectives within this research study, I selected the following three programs to help shape training in cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators: the Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM). Three perspectives offer the means for me to make headway for making comparisons and exploring differentiation among various models. The programs offer requisite variety, but also may present varying elements that help shape training for Title IX Coordinators. Given my experience with all three organizations, via training opportunities and/or institutional memberships, I aim to use this familiarity to move beyond generalized gatekeeper information into the purview of insider knowledge to gain access to additional data for review. As alternatives to these primary organizations, the following organizations were set to receive requests to serve in this capacity, if the invitations to participate were declined or other issues that impacted participation: the ASCA Sexual Misconduct Institute and the National Coalition Building Institute (NCBI). Due to the lack of response from Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM), the National Coalition Building Institute (NCBI) was utilized in its stead.

Due to COVID-19 restrictions and safety precautions (as recommended by the Centers for Disease Control (CDC) and personal accountability for safety), each representative was interviewed individually via video conferencing using Microsoft Teams or telephone based on the participants' preferences and availability options versus in a private, designated area as anticipated prior to the COVID-19 restrictions and safety precautions being implemented. During

the semi-structured interviews, I utilized preset questions and sub-questions to provide consistency as well as open-endedness and flexibility to address the designated topics presented. Using elements identified in Chapter 2 by the Multicultural Counseling Competencies (MCCs) and Advocacy Competencies, I generated questions to reinforce the role of culture within the professional development process, awareness and understanding of clients' worldviews, as well as empowerment and advocacy approaches supporting cultural competence and professional development. Additional follow-up questions with each participant were presented as deemed warranted based on the participant's responses. Information gained from an online data review was also used in this research study. See Appendix B for the specific questions and sub-questions established for the program representatives.

Instrumentation

The use of a digital recording mechanism was incorporated into the interview process (both video recording and telephone interviewing) and transcripts were generated using the internal mechanisms with Microsoft Teams. Another source of interview data were handwritten notes taken to include nonverbal expressions inaudible by the audio recording. Lodico et al. (2010) suggests that journaling adds validity to the data collection. Creswell (2012) offers that notes taking during the interview serve as alternate resources if there are issues with failing recording devices. The handwritten notes taken during these interviews supplement the digital audio recordings with nonverbal expressions. Through these means of cross-referencing data, Merriam (2009) highlights such actions as "comparing and cross-checking [multiple sources of] data" (p. 216) for confirmation of reliability. All transcriptions, notes, and additional documents will be electronically stored as well as password protected. The information will be organized by its data type, date gathered, and by participant it is aligned with in this study.

Data Analysis

This section outlines the methods and procedures used to analyze the data to gain answers to the noted research questions. The Transformative Learning Theory serves as a guide to build upon the study's theoretical framework. Through an analysis of the various characteristics and factors outlined within this comparative study, fundamental changes and understanding of emerging processes will be gained via formal and informal learning experiences over time (Mezirow, 1978) which present cross-cultural learning and its effective application into practice (Lee & Greene, 2004). In analyzing the development and implementation of cultural competence training, reference to transformative learning offers a reference for evolution and change (Lange, 2004).

Inquiry Design Rigor

As noted in the following section, the methods and procedures used to analyze the data will promote the trustworthiness and credibility of the findings. Qualitative data from each participant will be included in the analysis, regardless of the demographics, characteristics, and other identifiers. It is recommended that an approach in a cyclic nature be considered when conducting qualitative research where data collection, analysis, and reevaluation of the findings are conducted (Merriam, 1998). Even though I have identified the principal problem and research question at the inception of the study, there may be unknowns of "what will be discovered, what or whom to concentrate on, or what the final analysis will be like" (Merriam, 1998, p. 162). Emerging themes will be identified, coded, and categorized.

This process was conducted after each interview and transcribed within two weeks of the interview to review and highlight key points. Significant points consisted of the responses to the posed interview questions and any additional supplemental questions. The key points from each

interview were compiled to highlight commonalities and contrasts of the themes. Both journal entries and notes taken during the analysis will be kept as part of the data collection which provided impressions of non-verbal language and other thoughts generated prior to, during, and after the interview sessions. These journal entries and notes will be compared to the identified themes generated during the interviews.

Summary

Chapter 3 provides the description of the data and research methodology and design that were utilized to explore cultural competence training programs designed for Title IX Coordinators. Theoretical schemes and existing literature will be used in the selection of programs and independent variables outlined in this research study. This study utilizes a qualitative comparative study approach involving cross-case analysis. The data collected via the semi-structured interviews will be analyzed using qualitative coding techniques. This analysis will be the primary mode to explore the noted research questions and sub-questions. A code book will be developed concurrently with the interview process and enhanced as themes occur during the coding process via the interview transcripts in collaboration with the themes presented in the interview protocol.

Three training programs were selected to allow for enhanced research and analysis. Conversely, the programs permit a richer analysis and comparison of the contextual factors affecting the cultural competence training. This research study primarily used secondary sources retrieved through electronic English language searches and databases. This study is categorized as a comparative study approach as all training programs are contextual and are within a bounded system of professional development.

Data analysis will be conducted by a thematic synthesis using normalizing characteristics as the standard for comparison. The limitation of transferability and the two delimitations of the use of only English language searches and exploration of three training programs, will impact the manner in which this study was conducted, and results rendered by this process. By viewing this data via the lens of transformative learning, the emergence of characteristics and evolution of the noted factors of each program will be revealed. The findings of the study will be presented in Chapter 4.

CHAPTER 4: DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS

Utilizing elements of both the Transformative Learning Theory and the Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity (DMIS), this study investigates ways in which cultural competence training programs for Title IX Coordinators in higher education develop and evolve. Three cultural competence training programs were examined in this qualitative comparative research study. This body of work seeks to promote the ultimate goal of inclusion for all stakeholders and offer insight into the avenues by which training programs and continuing education opportunities prepare and sustain cultural competence growth and development for Title IX Coordinators. All study participants were professionals employed by the three identified training programs.

The purpose of Chapter 4 is to organize and report the research findings as presented through the interviews conducted with designated professionals. This section will make a comparison and evaluation of three cultural competence training programs. Evidence related to cultural competence training and outcomes will be further discussed. Additionally, Chapter 4 reviews the data collection and analysis procedures and a summary of the study findings. The following overarching research question was applied with the noted sub questions: What are the similarities and differences in cultural competence training programs designed for Title IX Coordinators by the Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), the College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)?

1. What steps are taken in the program development process?
2. What are the main factors contributing to training implementation?

3. What measures are considered when assessing and tracking performance and/or training effectiveness?
4. What factors have impacted the evolution of the training?

Demographic Data

The purpose of this study was to investigate ways in which cultural competence training programs for Title IX Coordinators in higher education develop and evolve. Nine individuals were identified based on title and position listings on the websites of the three identified training programs. I invited these training developers and trainers to participate in the research study. An invitation email to participate was sent to twelve potential participants; however, not all responded to the inquiry or agreed to participate. After the initial contacts and six additional participant requests, there were no follow-up responses from SHRM based the selected directors and managers from the various departments including Educational Programs, Customer Experiences for Human Resource, Customer Experience for Human Resource Management, Training and Development, and Communications and Development. Email exchanges progressed with the Customer Experience department, leading to an email exchange with the Communications and Development Director for approval. No approval or next steps were granted after this point. As previously noted, these noted actions required the outreach to two alternate training programs, NCBI and ASCA. Over the course of the spring 2021 semester, several organizational leaders were contacted including the Founder/CEO, Lead Trainer, Senior Trainer/Coordinator, and Trainer, resulting in two interviews. ATIXA provided access to a number of program leaders; however, this outreach resulted in two interviews completed by the Executive Vice President for Training Operations and the Training Developer/Lead Trainer. Although there were contacts made with six leaders with CUPA-HR, these efforts resulted in one

interview over a four-month period. With the exception of the interviewed Senior Manager of Virtual Learning, all other contacts referred me to other colleagues for various reasons including not being qualified or confident to speak on behalf of the organization and/or limited knowledge of the Title IX training. In an effort to gain supplemental information to the noted organizations' responses, I attempted to connect with ASCA. In using the contact email and phone number offered on the program's website on four occurrences, there was no contact information available for any specific individual to access the next step. Out of the selected participants, consisting of ten training program professionals, five (50%) agreed to participate in my research study over the course of the spring 2021 semester.

The interviews averaged 75 minutes in length, with the longest lasting 90 minutes (about 1 and a half hours). At the onset of each interview, I asked questions to establish the length of time worked with their respective organization, their current roles, and general experiences with cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators. Table 1 provides a summary of participant demographics.

Training Content

Prior to 2020, the noted trainings offered by ATIXA, CUPA-HR, and NCBI were traditionally offered in a face-to-face format. At the time of this study's interviews in the spring of 2021, the looming effects of the COVID-19 pandemic was inclusive of heightened safety protocols, limited to no travel for many higher education institutions, and focus on work-life balance/integration. According to all study participants, these factors raised the need for organizations to offer their training opportunities and other programming virtually. All participants presented a varied training delivery inclusive of case studies and scenario

Table 1

Participant Profile Summary

Participant Identifier	Length of Time Employed by Training Program	Position
Woodson	10 years	Senior Training Coordinator/Trainer
Cross	6 months	Training Developer/Trainer
Hall	25 years	Senior Trainer
Soar	30 years	Training Developer/Senior Trainer
DuBois	7 years	Training Consultant/Trainer

discussions that aligned with my personal training experiences. The forthcoming information details the content of each of the three training programs.

ATIXA's training was titled as *Title IX Coordinator Five: Bias and Cultural Competencies*. The training materials and registration portal noted that there were no prerequisites required; however, it built upon the skills and content of the Coordinator One module, considered to be the foundational course for all of the organization's Title IX Coordinator-based trainings. As noted on their webpage as well as in alignment with my experience, this training was offered as a live, interactive two-day course using ZOOM software platform. As outlined in Table 2, the targeted audience for this training was comprised of Title IX Hearing Officers Conduct Officers, Human Resource Specialists, General Counsel, and Law Enforcement.

The training was segmented into the following modules:

1. Identification of types of biases that can affect Title IX processes
2. Evaluation of personal cultural competency and evaluation of one's institution's stage of cultural competency
3. Identification of training needs and bias-reduction efforts
4. Recognition and reduction of microaggressions in the Title IX processes and systems
5. Development of cultural competency skills and recognition of opportunities to utilize such skills within their Title IX system
6. Understanding of the tensions presented by free speech and academic freedom in bias mitigation work
7. Insight into the concept of privilege and how it intersects with cultural competency

Table 2

Training Program Description

Organization	Training Titles	Targeted Audience
ATIXA	Bias and Cultural Competencies	Title IX Hearing Officers, Student Conduct Officers, Human Resources Specialists, General Counsel, and Law Enforcement
CUPA-HR	Oneness Lab: Deeper than Diversity	Higher Education Human Resources Administrators and Title IX Administrators and Professionals
NCBI	The Leadership for Diversity Institute	College and K-12 Administrators, Title IX Administrators, Community Organizers, Administrators, Community Organizers, Government Officials, Law Government Officials, and Law Enforcement

At the completion of this training, participants obtained certification from ATIXA for 14 general credit hours. As noted in the training materials, certification referred to participants' attendance through the duration of the training course and "cannot speak to individual attendees' knowledge, expertise, or command of the material."

CUPA-HR's training was titled as the *Oneness Lab: Deeper than Diversity*. As noted on their webpage, this training was offered as a live, interactive four-part series using ZOOM software platform. There were no prerequisites noted on the training materials or the organization's website. As outlined in Table 2, the targeted audience for this training was comprised of Higher Education Human Resources Administrators and Title IX Administrators and Professionals.

The training was segmented into the following modules and were in alignment with my lived experiences:

1. Re-tool your learning journey with key facts, trends, and U.S. History you might never have been taught, along with exposure to key authors and media, rich wisdom traditions, and faith practices which have emerged from diverse cultures over thousands of years.
2. Sharpen the language you use to facilitate dialogue around your equity work by increasing your understanding of the ever-evolving social justice and racial equity lexicon.
3. Build an active understanding of the five elements of building real relationships from the oneness lab model: frequency, proximity, reciprocity, knowledge, and imagination to impact the culture of your institution and enhance your leadership abilities.

4. Learn how to nurture empathy and psychological safety to honor diverse temperaments and perspectives and encourage honest discussion and breakthroughs in understanding.

At the completion of this training, participants obtained certification from CUPA-HR as confirmed by the HR Certification Institute and the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM) with 6.5 general credit hours.

NCBI's training was titled as *The Leadership for Diversity Institute*. It was noted on their website and registration portal that the training was open to "representatives of various professional backgrounds world-wide" and no prerequisites were listed. As noted on their website, this training was offered as a live, interactive three-day course using ZOOM software platform. My 2019 personal training experience with NCBI differed in that was offered in a face-to-face format. As outlined in Table 2, the targeted audience for this training was comprised of College and K-12 Administrators, Title IX Administrators, Community Organizers, Administrators, Community Organizers, Government Officials, Law Government Officials, and Law Enforcement.

The training was segmented into the following modules and were in alignment with my lived experiences:

1. How to integrate a powerful set of diversity skills into your leadership
    a. Valuing and welcoming similarities and differences among group members
    b. Examining the misinformation and unconscious bias that impacts our behavior toward others
    c. Understanding the role identity plays in leadership
    d. Identifying the harmful effects of oppression on one's own group

    e. Preventing and interrupting bigoted remarks and behaviors
    f. Learning how to be an ally to all groups
2. How to gain greater support for your leadership on diversity issues
    a. Leading effective meetings that include everyone's voice
    b. Building a team of support for one's own leadership
    c. Structuring effective, respectful conversations about difference and
    d. Increasing cultural competency
3. How to listen to concerns underneath controversial issues
    a. Learning skills to move hotly contested issues forward and reframe the conversation in a way that builds bridges.
4. How to partner with NCBI to build a local community, campus or organizational affiliate to institutionalize the skills

Additionally, NCBI operated on several core principles that were outlined in their training syllabus and website, and emphasized during my training experience as follows:

1. Building hopeful environments to welcome diversity.
2. Healing ourselves to change the world.
3. Becoming effective allies.
4. Empowering leaders to lead!
5. Changing hearts through stories.
6. Skills training leads to institutional change.
7. Sustaining the work requires on-going support.
8. Leaders deserve to be treated well.

As noted in the training materials and via the organization's webpage, the *Leadership for Diversity Institute* was approved by the National Association of Social Workers for 25.5 continuing education contact hours. Upon completion of the Institute, NCBI issued participants a certificate of completion.

Data Collection Process

Data collection began after receiving approval for exempt certification from the East Carolina University Institutional Review Board (IRB) on 3/10/2021. The selected study research design was a qualitative comparative study approach involving cross-case analysis. Data were collected via semi-structured interviews and analyzed using qualitative coding techniques, follow-up email correspondence with the study participants, and document analysis as provided by the participants and through training I personally completed with each training program. The data were analyzed using qualitative coding techniques. After each interview, the interview data were coded manually and reviewed for emerging themes.

As proposed by Miles and Huberman (1994), the analysis process utilized in this study consisted of three phases as follows: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification. During the data reduction phase, categorization, condensing, and converting the data from the interview transcripts and documentation reviews was required. In doing so, I identified the information offered by each participant in conjunction with the prominence and frequency relevant to the issues addressed. Thereafter, I condensed the data for a manageable, systematic approach to compare themes to the phenomenon.

The Coding Process

The coding process began immediately following the completed transcriptions were provided from the Microsoft Teams recordings. Next, the data were organized by each interview

question with all responses to a given question being grouped together. As the initial step in the reduction of the data, I utilized the process of within-case analysis to outline the specifics of each case and examine each case for specific themes (Creswell, 2012). From this point, I conducted open coding with each interview transcript which involved the allocation of labels to sections of data which align conceptually (Mertens, 2010). By thoroughly reading each transcript, I familiarized myself with the data to accurately assign an initial set of codes. The ten preliminary codes were as follows: (1) industry standards and practices, (2) societal influence, (3) advances in computer technologies, (4) aspects of diversity, equity, and inclusion, (5) trends in training development, (6) competition with other training programs, (7) partnerships with higher education institutions, (8) historical references, (9) collaborative relationships with community partners, and (10) influence of the content creator(s). To streamline this list, I devised secondary codes to encompass the first five preliminary codes noted above. These codes presented the most frequency and references throughout the interviews.

Next, the data from each interview transcript was compiled to pinpoint which data should be highlighted, minimalized or reserved for later access in order for scaled summarization to facilitate conclusions (Miles & Huberman, 1994). In analyzing the generated codes, I performed a categorical aggregation in which “the larger categories derived during case study data analysis” (Creswell 2012, p. 294). Additionally, patterns were identified among thematic categories to strategically reduce the quantity of initial groupings (Creswell, 2012, p. 199). During the formal coding phase, Saldaña (2016) notes thematic categories are identified by reading and reviewing the data; this process was conducted and repeated for each case.

As emphasized by Miles and Huberman (1994), I was involved in drawing conclusions based on the perceptions of the participants and data sources reviewed as well as verifying

information by assigning meaning to the data. In doing so, I was able to gain understanding of how the data addressed the study's research questions. As outlined by Glaser and Strauss (1967), the constant comparison method was utilized to revisit the data and reexamine the previously identified themes and patterns to corroborate my conclusions during this verification process. From this point, I produced a broadened description of the collective cases to further evaluate how the presented findings responded to the research questions of my study (Creswell, 2012).

Use of a thematic analysis was applied to the interview transcripts generated from the interviews. I closely examined the data to identify the common themes, inclusive of repetitive patterns, ideas, and subject matter. The approach was utilized to explore the participant's values, views, and experiences from a set of qualitative data based on interview transcripts.

I utilized a deductive approach in coming to the data with preconceived themes that I expected to be reflected, based on this study's literature review and existing theoretical framework centered on the Transformational Learning Theory. These themes initially included the following:

1. Cultural competence training is formulated through the lens of racial and gender-based stigma and discrimination.
2. Practical application beyond the training process offers insight into its overall effectiveness and responsiveness.
3. Training takeaways serve as gateways to enhanced delivery and development of services, policies, and procedures for trainees.
4. The evolution of training is dictated by the state of the societal climate and headline news.

As the interviews progressed, more of an inductive approach was incorporated which allowed the data to determine my themes. Also, a latent approach was integrated to read into the subtext and assumptions underlying the data. Beyond the statements of the participants, this technique gleaned on what their statements revealed about their assumptions and social context.

In conducting this analysis, I utilized pattern-level analytic techniques to identify patterns presented throughout the interviews (LeCompte & Schensul, 1999). This method attempts to explore the sets of coded narrative data presented by the study participants to understand their relation. These patterns potentially emerged in varied ways to include the following:

1. the explicit affirmation that a specific theme exists
2. the frequency in with which the theme emerges
3. the exclusion of an anticipated theme
4. the alignment of a theme with previous research
5. the sequential revelation of themes, and/or (6) through the co-occurrence of several themes (LeCompte & Schensul, 1999).

This process provided another layer of reliability for my research study.

Additionally, I sought to identify divergent data through conflicts which exist within and across the study participants' narratives. I tagged conflicting information with Microsoft Word comment memos revealed in the interviews. The code *contradiction* labeled research memos which identified conflicting discourses. Once the patterns and conflicts were identified, wide-ranging theoretical concepts were developed to show a multidimensional picture of training development and implementation factors relevant to the sample of programs. At the conclusion of each interview, I wrote reflective notes on the study participant and the interview process. The notes were inclusive of summaries of the salient ideas, thoughts regarding omitted and

conflicting information presented by the study participants, and reflections on how the study participants' themes correspond to the others.

In maintaining notes for the interview, only the initials of the study participants were included on all electronic files with a master key in a password protected Google Drive for my exclusive access. My reflections were documented through both field notes and research memos. The field notes were based on my observations and analytical concepts and written during and immediately after each interview. In contrast, the research memos were written during the coding process and/or consequent exploration of data. All data and identifiable data were destroyed at the conclusion of this study. The original interview protocol and the subsequent interview question changes through the course of the study are provided in Appendix B.

Creswell (2013) outlines that the typical collection may include "extensive forms, such as documents, and records, interviews, observation, and physical artifacts for 1 to 4 cases" (p. 148). In following suit to Creswell's notations, I selected three training programs pertinent to Title IX Coordinators' training to further explore. Study participants were selected to represent each program to gain varied experiences during the interview sessions. A total of five participants completed the interviews between March 31, 2021 and July 16, 2021. The following organizations participated in this study: the Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), the College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and the alternate program, National Coalition Building Institute (NCBI). The following training programs did not participate in this study: the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM) and the alternate training program, the ASCA Sexual Misconduct Institute. Table 3 provides a profile summary of the selected training programs and the number of interviews conducted.

Table 3

Training Program Profile Summary

Organization	Acronym	# Interviews
The Association of Title IX Administrators	ATIXA	2
The College and University Professional Association	CUPA-HR	1
The Society for Human Resource Management	SHRM	0
National Coalition Building Institute	NCBI	2
ASCA Sexual Misconduct Institute	ASCA	0

With the exception of CUPA-HR, which was represented by one study participant, ATIXA and NCBI were represented by two participants each in this research study. After the participants were identified, I collected data from the interviews with these selected professionals, email correspondence from the individuals who recommended the participants, and each training program's website. At the time of the data collection, the study participants included training content developers and trainers. To accommodate participants' schedules and account for COVID-19 restrictions, interviews were conducted via videoconferencing technology using Microsoft Teams or via telephone. My original study design outlined face-to-face interviews; however, it became necessary to conduct the interviews virtually, primarily via videoconferencing, while one was conducted via telephone, in order that participants could complete the study. Although telephone interviews are not considered common in qualitative research, Creswell (2007) notes that gaining access to hard-to-reach respondents is a common issue in interviewing research. Similarly, Tausig and Freeman (1988) suggest that telephone interviewing may present the means to obtain data when the research experiences difficulty in accessing participants in person. In proceeding with data collection from multiple sources, I had an opportunity to substantiate my data (Yin, 2009) and assess the credibility and/or validity of claims rendered by the qualitative data (Booth et al., 2013; Denzin & Lincoln, 2011; Miles & Huberman, 1994). Comparing the organizations' training materials, inclusive of course descriptions, objectives, activities, as well as website information, offered the means to support the data collected. As a past trainee with each organization, I also was able to discern where the reported accounts aligned or diverged from my actual training experiences.

At the time of the interviews, training was conducted virtually by ATIXA, NCBI, and CUPA-HR via the ZOOM platform. Cultural competence was the all-encompassing training

topic; however, there were specific training modules offered as noted in Table 2. Each module was considered a requirement of the training and could not be completed separately. Although training for Title IX Coordinators was the focus of this research study, each organization also offered their cultural competence training to professionals in adjacent fields of work to include Human Resource Specialists, General Counsel, and Law Enforcement Officers as identified in Table 2.

After the conclusion of the analysis, there were a few conflicting statements obtained from the study participants. For example, study participants were asked who was deemed responsible in developing and implementing the cultural competence training with their respective programs. Each of the two participants from ATIXA and NCBI offered different responses – from a team of faculty and/or trainers to an individual training developer. I approached these dilemmas by revealing the known discrepancies to the study participants as a means to gain clarity. I did not discount any contradictions as a sign of falsity or invalidation of their narratives. On one hand, these conflicts offered diversity in perspectives and on the other hand, they revealed complexities in how these training programs managed and/or interpreted their internal training protocols.

Creswell (2013) offers a detailed description on interview protocols in which the researcher must initially select the type of interview which is most appropriate for the study. In proceeding through the outlined study protocols, I conducted one-on-one interviews via Microsoft Teams technology and a telephone interview with one of the study participants. As needed, I had the opportunity to seek clarification through the use of probing questions with each interview method. Interviews were conducted adhering to the interview protocol, recorded, and transcribed

via Microsoft Teams technology. The interview protocol was comprised of four primary questions and probing questions were asked as needed.

Identifiers for the study participants were assigned using a pseudonym as follows: Woodson, Cross, Hall, Wing, and DuBois. As part of my own professional development in the field of cultural competence, I outlined the connection of each pseudonym to a pioneer in the field as revealed through the research for this study below.

1. *Woodson*: Dr. Carter G. Woodson, the creator of the Society for the study of Negro Culture and Life and instituted Negro History Week.
2. *Cross*: Terry L. Cross, an influential researcher in early cultural competence exploration.
3. *Hall*: Edward T. Hall, an early initiator of intercultural communication research.
4. *Soar*: Derald Wing Sue, a psychologist and trailblazing researcher in multicultural counseling.
5. *DuBois*: W. E. B. DuBois, sociologist and civil rights activist, credited with conducting the first Critical Whiteness Studies analysis in his 1920 essay "The Souls of White Folk"

As previously noted, the data collection methods were comprised of semi-structured interviews, follow-up correspondence via email with the participants, and document analysis provided by the participants and through trainings I completed with each organization. In this chapter, I will provide a description of the findings gained from the data collection and interviews with the training developers and trainers. Due to the nature of open-ended questions, I offered participants the opportunity to provide as much information as they deemed necessary in their responses. In some instances, probing questions were asked to gain further clarification as well as a deeper

understanding of their thoughts and experiences. Based on this interview structure, these interviews were classified as semi-structured. Mertens (2010) describes semi-structured interviews as a process in which “the researcher develops an interview guide with topics, issues, or questions that they intend to cover during the interview. The researcher is open to following leads form the respondent to determine the ordering of questions and the use of probes to further explore relevant points” (Mertens, 2010, p. 371).

Within the next step of the data collection process, the location of the interviews was selected (Creswell, 2013). In adhering to COVID-19 restrictions and safety precautions while maximizing participation, the interviews were conducted via Microsoft Teams or via telephone. Microsoft Teams was utilized to support all videoconferencing allowing for real-time, two-way video dialogs. During the interviews, I had immediate access to the recording and transcription features. All transcriptions were saved to a flash drive. As a backup to the Microsoft Teams recordings, I utilized the voice memo feature on my iPhone as a another means for data collection. During the initial interview, Creswell (2012) highlights that the researcher should supply the participant with consent information and explanation of the study’s purpose. In advance of the interviews, all participants were sent an email requesting their consent and provided detailed information regarding the purpose and expectations of their participation in the study. I informed all participants that proceeding with the study was solely on a voluntary basis and that they may elect to decline participation at any point of the study without any associated repercussions.

As a final step within the interview process, Creswell (2012) emphasizes that the researcher should utilize good interview etiquette by keeping the agreed upon time and interview protocol for each interview at the forefront. I ensured each participant that each session would last no more than 90 minutes; however, they were provided the opportunity to share to the extent desired. Additionally, during the interviews, I made observational field notes comprised of verbal (tone, diction, etc.) and non-verbal (facial, body, etc.) expressions. After retrieving transcriptions from each interview, I reviewed them for accuracy and found minor corrections for parts of sentences that were inaudible on the file utilizing my notes and reviewing the audio recordings.

To further validate my data, I offered a copy of the personal transcripts of each participant for another review over the course of the following week. If there was not a response, it was agreed upon during the interview that I would proceed with the next step of the data review process. All documents offered by participants and/or accessible via websites were also reviewed and listed as additional data sources. For the purpose of this research study, I examined the training programs' websites, paying close attention to information provided on training offerings, training objectives, and any information on current or proposed training initiatives to gain a deeper understanding of the training development and evolution with each training program. To securely store the study's data, I maintained a master list detailing the collected information. All electronic files were saved on an external hard drive located in a secure location in my home office. When not in use, the external hard drives and transcripts were stored in a locked file cabinet.

Findings

This chapter explores the prominent themes which answer the study's following overarching research question with the noted four sub questions: What are the similarities and differences in cultural competence training programs designed for Title IX Coordinators by the Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), the College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)? What steps are taken in the program development process? What are the main factors contributing to training implementation? What measures are considered when assessing and tracking performance and/or training effectiveness? What factors have impacted the evolution of the training?

In utilizing within-case analyses, the data collected from the semi-structured interviews with the participants as well as the documentation gained from the training programs identified significant details. For example, I was able to gain insight into the perceptions of Title IX training development and organizational priorities as they relate to the individual training's sustainability and evolution. Additionally, findings from the interviews revealed training development and delivery were centered on the pulse of society. In this instance, the pulse of society is related to the state of the cultural climate inclusive of perceptions, ideas, and opinions of the targeted population, in this case Title IX Coordinators, as well as shared values and beliefs within a specific moment in time. These analyses generated three themes and six related subthemes (see Table 4). The three salient themes pertained to all interview participants and their experiences within Title IX training, and they are as follows: (1) the prevalence of the roundabout of Title IX training with diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) informed the training experience; (2) innovation in teaching and learning practices produced positive

Table 4

Themes, Subthemes, Research Questions, and Descriptors

Theme	Subthemes	Research Question Addressed	Brief Descriptor of Subthemes
1. Connectivity	1A. Impact of diversity, equity, and inclusion initiatives	RQ1, RQ2	• Connection to cultural climate • Responsive to societal needs
	1B. Influence of external resources	RQ1, RQ2, RQ4	• Alignment with DEI resources • "All things DEI right now"
2. Innovation in teaching and learning	2A. Progression in the touchstones	RQ1, RQ2	• Targeted learning outcomes
	2B. Adaptation to instructional planning	RQ1, RQ4	• Meeting demands of competitive training industry • Pivoting training mode and delivery in pandemic
3. Influence of an evaluative process	3A. Challenges in the data collection	RQ3, RQ4	• Limitations in returned responses
	3B. Activation of teaching and learning measures	RQ3, RQ4	• Limited post training follow-up • Action-oriented engagement • "Beyond the walls of training"

outcomes; and (3) the evaluative process informed the training's immediate outcomes, long-term impact, and overall implementation.

The first major theme, the prevalence of the connectivity of Title IX training with diversity, equity, and inclusion related societal issues, addresses the means by which training is in tune to societal issues. These notions revealed the following two subthemes: (1) diversity, equity, and inclusion initiatives influence the direction of training development and implementation and (2) the utilization of external resources impact the richness of the training. Within the context of this theme, participants also highlighted how their training centered on racial equity concepts which connected to the heart of culture.

The second major theme, innovation in teaching and learning practices, supports the need to address the following two subthemes: (1) progression in the touchstones positively impacted the learning continuum and (2) the adaptation to instructional planning addressed the evolving needs within society. Within the context of this theme, participants outlined how instruction aligned with societal trends and the voice of its constituents at the forefront of training development and delivery.

The third major theme, the influence of an evaluative process, supports the following two subthemes: (1) challenges were presented in the data collection and (2) the activation of teaching and learning measures led to enriched experiences. Within the context of this theme, participants supported collection and utilization of qualitative and quantitative data to advance its instruction methods beyond traditional measures to evoke participant engagement and active learning.

A detailed description of each noted theme and their associated subthemes is outlined in Table 4. In the subsequent segments of this current chapter, the themes and subthemes will be examined through the notation of first-person responses from the participants' interviews.

The Connectivity of Cultural Competence Training with DEI

The prevalence of the connectivity of Title IX training with diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) informed the training experience. Within the context of this first theme, it is highlighted that several co-occurring individual characteristics or social constructs (such as gender, ethnicity, race, and class) overlap and present distinctive collective experiences. The study participants reported that their cultural competence training was inherently interconnected with the societal climate in comparison to years past wherein this connection was loosely tied. They described the societal climate during the pandemic from similar perspectives reflective of addressing systemic racism and police violence as well exploring how racial inequities have been exacerbated during this time in history. The study participants also highlighted the notions of awareness, advocacy, and assessment of systemic racism, police violence, and racial inequities support the need to further explore the following two emerging themes: (1) diversity, equity, and inclusion initiatives influence the direction of training development and implementation and (2) the utilization of external resources impact the richness of the training. All study participants revealed the need to pivot during the pandemic to not only continue servicing their clientele efficiently, but also an active state of the cultural climate and voices of the Title IX Coordinators, students, and higher education impacted by their training in which racial reckoning was at the forefront of many pivotal conversations. Also, the participants noted their volume of requests for training services also peaked over the past 1-½ years. To provide context around the state of racial reckoning during this moment in time, Inside Higher Ed pinpoints it as one in which many white Americans are waking up to the realities of racial injustice and inequities in the United States" (Knight, 2020). Similarly, the Lumina Foundation emphasizes that "we have struggled as a nation to face the ugly truth about America's shameful history of racist violence"

(Humphreys, 2021). Additionally, it was noted that data from a 2020 Pew Research Center "showed that more than three-quarters of Americans believe the increased focus on racial inequities sparked by the George Floyd killing represents a change in the way most of us think about these issues" (Humphreys, 2021). The need to extend deeper from theory to action-oriented engagement is presented.

All study participants provided varied module outlines and planning guides reflective of the incorporation of DEI elements within the cultural competence training as well as a next step beyond the standard training. For example, Cross provided a module outline that revealed the following:

This course offered a practical roadmap to develop an inclusive, bias-free office and resolution processes, while gathering skills to assess the causes and solutions of inequity to ensure a Title IX/non-discrimination program that offers a true level playing field. Additionally, based on the course syllabus presented by Cross, the training offered the following DEI-focused objectives:

1. Identify types of biases that can affect Title IX processes
2. Evaluate their own personal cultural competency and evaluate their institution's stage of cultural competence
3. Identify campus needs for training and bias-reduction efforts
4. Recognize and reduce microaggressions in the Title IX processes and systems
5. Develop cultural competency skills and recognize opportunities to utilize such skills within their Title IX system
6. Understand the tensions presented by free speech and academic freedom in bias mitigation work

7. Gain insight into the concept of privilege and how that intersects with cultural competency

A train-the-trainer model was outlined as a practical next step for application of the lessons learned during the training.

Woodson emphasized the development and insight of the organization's internal DEI Community of Practice working group developed out of the need to activate a collective voice and means for support for enhanced understanding for professionals focused on the previously noted COVID-19 pandemic and 2020 racial inequities. The need to meet professionals where they were in their varied levels of experiences, self-awareness, and knowledge surrounding these issues was viewed as critical. As noted by Woodson and the organization's membership portal, the Community of Practice workgroup was established as a means for the organization's members to contribute their expertise or participate in a volunteer program to gain increased awareness and insight, obtain new connections, develop new skills, and have a direct impact on the association and the higher ed HR profession. The options to participate as offered by this group served as actionable next steps beyond the training. This group has promoted ongoing DEI-focused conversations which reflect both the internal and external needs of its targeted training population of Title IX Coordinators within secondary and post-secondary education. It was noted by Woodson that the workgroup was instrumental in bringing forth the collective voices of the constituents, which in turn, revamped their training structure and content. The brings to light the power of collaborative partnerships and how it holds great influence in training development and implementation. Woodson also highlighted the following:

> Racial equity has been brought to the forefront throughout these discussions with our DEI Community of Practice working group and impacted the revisions of its recent cultural

> competence training. Applicable ways in which Title IX Coordinators can take an actionable next step to address racial inequities within practice was highlighted as part of the restructured cultural competence training. Teaching tools must be reflective of DEI elements that integrate the perspectives of people from varied backgrounds into the conversation that supports foundational self-awareness and understanding the concepts and the terminology and how they affect people's experiences within the realms of the working environment and the populations they serve. The intersectionality of cultural competence and DEI within training development and delivery is considered imperative, particularly when advancing the work of Title IX Coordinators.

Cross acknowledged that the state of cultural competence training is "all things DEI right now." The following was also recognized by Cross:

> I had to take a look at what's transpired in our world over the last decade or so. In really kind of trying to piece together what will be the best content in the best way to teach the content and systematically (to Title IX Coordinators), I knew that we had to spend a great deal of knowledge of getting people to understand what cultural competence actually means. Right? Because cultural competency is actually… Intersectionality you have to have a foundational piece and so that was really where my brain went in terms of how we need to structure this (cultural competence) course in what my thought process was behind that.

The connectivity to constituents' training desires and interests was emphasized by Cross via the following:

> Also, there's the need to stay connected to the field and tuned into the needs of institutions across the country as well as kind of the hurdles and obstacles that many

> practitioners were facing with trying to accomplish DEI initiatives. In restructuring our cultural competence course to address these needs, we focus on utilizing the components of that information and infusing it with the real work of Title IX Coordinators and what that needs to look like in terms of from a Title IX Coordinator standpoint. The need to connect with DEI resources and services, such as the National Association for Chief Diversity Officers, is vital to support the structuring of DEI related initiatives and the framework from which our cultural competence training stems. Specifically, the challenges institutions are facing on their campuses and even within the courts with respect to just equal opportunity and free speech represent several layers of DEI intersectionality within the training content and its context.

Challenges noted by the participant included institutions allowing time and providing space – virtual and physical – to support students in exercising freedom of speech without imposing sanctions and/or limitations on these voices. Additionally, access to limited financial resources to support DEI initiatives was presented as a challenge.

Additionally, Cross presented the following thoughts regarding connectivity:

> The importance of the intersection of cultural competence training with civil rights and advocacy and how DEI work is important to ensuring that people's basic civil rights are not being violated. We use theories like Critical Race Theory and kind of developing some of the ideas we're looking at intersectionality and developing those ideas were looking at the work that is done around organizational cultural competency, which is which dates back to the 1980s. These theories, including CRT, are the kind of foundational pieces that we use in developing our courses in terms of framework. They offer endless content which support rich dialog and interactive activities that evoke

> learning and base for our trainees to build upon regarding intersectionality and advocacy. It all goes hand in hand, and the foundation remains solid even with infusing varied models of thought and theory.

Interestingly enough, even though Cross highlighted that DEI elements were embedded in their cultural competence courses. It was noted that the courses "were not designed with the mindset of attempting to change people, but more on how trainees can understand the meaning of this training in a contextual way." In this instance, it was noted that contextual learning embeds knowledge that organically flows within one's daily work practices which, in turn, allows for deeper retention and application of the concepts learned. In this understanding, the goal is to "support the trainees' perspective on how they practically infuse this training into their worlds and how they can begin to make an impact upon their campuses." It was noted this training was not only applicable for people of color, but for all the multitude of identities that support sense of belonging, how they determine their own sense of belonging, and how they can contribute to DEI work on their respective campuses.

Hall emphasized that aspects of DEI work are considered continual in the evolution of cultural competence training. It was noted by Hall:

> The organization reportedly leans on the value that DEI brings forth to build upon its welcoming environment for all the identities that are present in the training. In one of our training segments, addressing racial inequities and fighting against racism in other types of oppression is a critical component. There is some emphasis placed on race, but then viewing diversity and inclusion in a broad sense to recognize a number of different groups to tie those identities to the notion of leadership. In order to do this work of cultural competence training, with DEI at the core, it requires leadership (of the trainees

> and their respective organizations) to move the agenda forward. The impact of identity and its impact upon leadership are brought to the forefront to explore strengths and challenges to serve others in the working environment and beyond.

Soar emphasized the role that DEI-related issues play in aligning with the mission of their cultural competence training. It was emphasized by Soar:

> Even prior to social justice and racial equity issues raised during the recent pandemic, the premise of the training focused on bridging and strengthening the relationships between African Americans and Jews was at the forefront to address the significant strain among the two groups. In doing so, DEI elements reportedly ran parallel to advancing dialog and influencing thought processes and engagement practices through storytelling and group debriefing. With the skill building components of this training, a shift in trainees' attitude and/or the creation of dialog around racial identities and their impact upon decision-making and interaction with those being served in their respective working environments is promoted.

With the notion of strengthening relationships among African American and Jews, Soar provided a description of the principles involved in the "speak out" practice. The premise reportedly was noted as the following:

> Helping every leader to identify and to heal the sources of their own mistreatment is the most effective intervention strategy. The most effective communication of the impact of racism is through the sharing of personal stories. People can debate the merit of analytical data concerning the continuing existence of racism; they cannot as easily discount the personal experiences of oppression. Often the listener is stirred to recall parallel experiences that elicit a strong identification with the storyteller.

This “speak out” format was considered optional and applied to hearing personal stories of discrimination or mistreatment and its impact on those sharing their stories. As noted in the training guide I received during the training,

> A number of leaders are personally invited to “speak-out” to the entire group about a specific incident of oppression. The request is always made privately in order to respect the individual’s right to consider the request thoughtfully, to ask any clarifying questions about the process, and to accept or decline the invitation freely. The speak-out format allows the group to focus on institutionalized oppression, such as racism, sexism, anti-Jewish oppression.

Similarly, DuBois placed emphasis on the tragic events involving racial inequity in the United States and how it dictated the training’s forthcoming content and context. Specifically, the 2020 cases regarding police brutality and civil rights investigations referencing George Floyd and Breonna Taylor were identified as well as the 2021insurrection of the U.S. Capitol and violent attacks upon the law enforcement officers. With these cases at the forefront of media, making direct connections within the training was viewed as a seamless approach to maintaining relevancy in the field and presenting validity in the messaging. Making the connection was very thoughtful. It was noted by DuBois:

> Our training was revised to support college campuses in becoming more mindful and have more racially equity-driven practices accessible and under consideration. The training modeled DEI-focused resources and trainings that offered relevant articles, videos, and websites by external partners, including higher education institutions. Through this resource building, relevant themes were generated which, in turn, brought enhanced awareness of the societal climate. We are tuned into where our society is.

Upon further inquiry, DuBois stated that examples of these resources and trainings have included those offered via the training program's Knowledge Resource Center. Upon review of this online tool, the following DEI-focused resources were accessible:

1. Events and programs (examples: 21-Day Racial Equity Habit Building Challenge for Higher Ed Leaders, 21-Day Racial Equity Habit Building Challenge: Black, Hispanic and Latinx, and Partners in Justice)
2. Peer reviewed articles and publications (examples: Embedding Racial Equity into Higher Ed HR Practices, How HR Can Help Eliminate Racial Microaggressions in the Workplace, Become a Better Champion for DEI, Lean Into the Uncomfortable)
3. Resources and tools (examples: 6 Habits to Promote Racial Equity, Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) Maturity Index, and Creating Inclusive Communities Project)
4. What Other Institutions are Doing (example: Creative Partnerships: A Path to an Inclusive Campus)

Additionally, the organization's online Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Toolkit offered "key resources" on racial equity, training and education inclusive of "courageous conversations" and unconscious bias, and higher education institutional Title IX and non-discrimination policies.

Innovation in Teaching and Learning Practices

Innovation in teaching and learning practices produced positive outcomes. Within the context of this second theme, study participants outlined how their organization's instruction aligned their training with societal trends and the voice of its constituents at the forefront of training development and delivery. Cross and Woodson noted that societal trends included the cancellation of in-person instruction, increased access to remote learning opportunities, and the expectation of remote learning becoming the dominant educational approach long-term. Other

trends were mentioned by Soar to include the attraction of remote learning's flexibility to balance education with other obligations while Dubois emphasized the rise in partnerships with businesses, community colleges, and online educational platforms at reduced costs.

These notions support the need to explore the following two subthemes: (1) progression in the touchstones positively impacted the learning continuum and (2) the adaptation to instructional planning addressed the evolving needs within society. All participants indicated that the methods in instructional design and teaching pivoted from in-person instruction to online training within the past 1½ years. The content reportedly changed along with the modality, primarily due to the increased requests for DEI infused subject matter. The transition from an in-person to an online delivery was viewed by all participants, as stated by Woodson, as a "necessary pivot" to maintain connectivity and sustain the engagement with their student base. Also, the participants emphasized that the shift to online training was a critical component to thriving amongst other competing training organizations. Within this "buyer's market" for training, Hall emphasized the need for innovation in content and delivery, noting that "the standard quo is not suitable anymore. The lack thereof could be detrimental to the organization's longevity and ultimate existence."

Although all participants offered some elements of online delivery, the pandemic presented the opportunity to expand these services to meet these demands of the training industry. As noted by Hall, opportunities for the training organizations to increase their creativity and resourcefulness were viewed as "bonus remnants and by-products of forced transitions during COVID-19. Although we were thrown into an unfamiliar position, we were able to gain footing on a deeper, richer level that extended beyond what we ever imagined." Service delivery

was viewed as a major undertaking during the pandemic; however, all participants reflected on the overall value and potential sustainability of the restructured training.

Hall and Soar revealed instructional designs that consist of interactive modes of learning to include the adoption of storytelling and role playing reflective of the exploration of racial identities. Soar stated:

> Although a focus had been geared toward learning activities involving the exploration of racial identities and racial equity over the years, societal discourse has played a major role in dictating this segment of training in recent years. Within the storytelling training segment, trainees get to speak out on issues they had experienced as an individual and/or as part of a group of individuals who encounter difficult situations in which voices may be lost.

Upon clarification, these difficult situations were inclusive of experiences faced by participants including racial and/or gender discrimination, incidents of repetitive implicit bias, and loss of educational and work opportunities due to these noted experiences.

> Our facilitators guide the trainees through a process of regaining their voices through the "speak out" segment. The group is asked to remember the person's story and to make an increased commitment to fight against what issue was identified. The trainees are given an opportunity just to express what resonated for them. This activity reportedly sets forth progressive learning touchpoints to gain perspectives of various racial groups beyond the textbook teachings. Also, the training involves stepping beyond traditional role plays into personalized roles of cultural discrimination from the perspectives of the individual making questionable comments and the individual responding to the comments. These

modules offer the opportunity to teach all points around defensiveness, tone of voice among other factors as well as practice in responding effectively.

As evidenced by my personal experience with Soar's training and its training materials outlining "Shifting Attitudes and Role Plays," this segment of the workshop presents the key principles of community organizing and empowerment training to evoke behavioral change. It is noted that "providing staff with practical skills that give them a sense of control over their environment is the first step toward achieving greater institutional changes", and ultimately, leads to "a better position to minimize resistance to delivering equitable services." Through this process, the goal is for leaders to increase effectiveness in resolution facilitation.

Woodson emphasized that the organization's training is very responsive to the needs of their clientele. These needs were identified through open-ended post training questions inclusive of expanded time for self-reflection, open expression, and exchange of information with other trainees in terms of the impact of the 2020 pandemic upon their practices and their delivery of services. Additionally, the need for gaining resources beyond the scope of training was revealed to support participants' action steps within DEI-related initiatives. The content was reportedly structured around the established learning outcomes, supplemental materials and interactive activities. This content can be verified via the training materials personally received through these training sessions. The training syllabus outlined the following DEI-related topics as follows:

1. Notice similarities, embrace differences and celebrate both.
2. Clarify why a diversity initiative is crucial to the success of the organization.
3. Recognize and work through the misinformation and unconscious bias.
4. Understand the impact of internalized oppression.

5. Learn to listen to concerns underneath controversial issues.
6. Move hotly contested issues forward and reframe the conversation in a way that builds bridges.

In reference to curriculum development, Woodson noted that:

> Curricular development is thoughtful, intentional and designed by thought leaders who can draw from all this relevant experience from working on campuses at schools with clients. Our trainers and facilitators bring so much of that experience and gravitas to giving examples and talking through case studies to having different perspectives to address societal concerns in varied ways. Training has evolved in some ways to a conversational approach to allow trainees a more intimate approach to connect with the facilitators and larger training community. This allows the opportunity to address societal concerns and/or personal issues impacting their engagement and productivity. Participants also are challenged to understand the perspectives of others and apply lessons learned with the populations they serve.

Cross stated that societal trends in expressing support for diversity and inclusivity influenced the content and context of the organization's cultural competence training to include making public DEI statements to inform the community where the organization stands and shifting and/or allotting resources (finances and focus) to visibly support DEI initiatives. It was noted by Cross:

> Nationally trending concepts of cancel culture, freedom of speech, and privilege resonated as discussion points and were ultimately incorporated into the training modules. This training was designed for supervisors to be able to navigate cancel culture

to develop a better understanding of what that means and how it can be intertwined in the work that they are engaged in.

It was noted by Cross that cancel culture stemmed from being "called out" for presenting unacceptable information or taking unfavorable actions, subjecting the individual or organization to ostracism and/or being shunned through various acts including boycotting. Also, it was noted that freedom of speech leans on expressing opinions freely without censorship and/or governmental influence or oversight. Lastly, privilege reportedly stemmed from various advantages that are imposed by specific groups at the detriment to other groups, inclusive of male privilege and white privilege. It was mentioned that the organization strives to avoid teaching practices that leave trainees feeling bad for how they were born or how they identify. This has been viewed as counter intuitive to the intended teachings within cultural competence and bias and revised to address accordingly.

The training objectives for Hall's organization similarly made note that participants will learn how to bring the most self-aware version of themselves to this work, ensure a team-approach to equity, and leave with effective tools to mitigate bias incidents. This course offers a practical roadmap develop an inclusive, bias-free office and resolution processes, while gathering skills to assess the causes and solutions of inequity to ensure a Title IX/non-discrimination program that offers a true level playing field.

DuBois highlighted that the organization had a "good pulse" on what has been happening on college campuses and what has been trending in the news headlines regarding the needs within cultural competence training. Upon further clarification, it was noted that college campuses were trending towards amplifying the voices of their students, faculty, and staff in regard to First Amendment rights and populations that may have had limited knowledge and/or

access to resources and services, such as first-generation college students and African American males. The news headlines that resonated within this training included the impact of the pandemic on low-income, minority students, the deaths of George Floyd and Breonna Taylor, the insurrection of the U.S. Capitol, and the local, national, and international civil rights protests stemming from these incidents. Dubois also noted the following:

Through this awareness, we have been able to gain a better idea of how things are evolving on campus. A few questions influence our instructional planning efforts as follows: What practices are changing? What positions are being created? Are there new strategic initiatives being implemented in new projects? What new groups have been established on campus? Additionally, infusing success stories focused on racial equity into the instructional training reportedly supported points of practical application and learning for the trainees. Such actions have led to the creation of a resource that addresses and educates on racial equity that did not previously exist but are perceived to be reflective of the societal climate. Our revised cultural competence training led to the incorporation of interactive town hall meetings with our trainees and practitioners in higher education. The training is considered a tool to guide the next steps of dialog and engagement beyond textbook learning. The voices of our organization's targeted training population signified the influence of DEI elements within its scope and delivery.

The Influence of an Evaluative Process

The evaluative process informed the training's immediate outcomes, long-term impact, and overall implementation. With an emphasis on the value of qualitative and quantitative feedback from trainees, long-term evaluative and follow-up processes were highlighted within the third theme. All training programs retrieved post training data and utilized these data points in various ways. The following two subthemes emerged from the data: (1) challenges were

presented in the data collection and (2) the activation of teaching and learning measures led to enriched experiences.

Woodson indicated that the post training surveys have served as the means to gain a sense of how the material was conveyed to their trainees. It was noted:

> The following questions were typically addressed in the evaluative process: Did the training match its description? Did the training meet the trainees' needs? Did the faculty present in a way that was accessible to the trainees? Are there areas in which the organization hasn't grown to yet? This data is considered satisfaction-based and did not speak to the command of the material. By gaining these responses over the past couple of years, a deep dive, rework reorganization strengthening has been occurring for the most recent offerings of the training courses to support a more normalized evaluation that offers greater objectivity.
>
> Although not currently available in the post survey questions, the following questions are forthcoming in a post training assessment of knowledge: Were the learning outcomes met? Was the information absorbed and retained to impact work experiences and promote engagement? With these real time responses, there are intentional curriculum updates projected to the cultural competency training course for Title IX Coordinators. Additionally, through our listserv, a community of practice is readily available to provide ongoing training feedback. This feedback is not only focused on the aforementioned qualitative aspects of the training but also on addressing the integration of DEI-related concepts within the training and their application to next steps beyond the training.

Similar to Woodson's responses, Hall revealed that post training evaluations were utilized to gain feedback from the trainees regarding the structure of the course as well as its content. It was also reported:

> We present the opportunity for trainees to share perspectives on areas of improvement as well as areas that were beneficial and presented well. Through the collection of this qualitative and quantitative data, the cultural competence courses were adjusted to meet the expectations and needs of its constituents.

For example, it was noted that the modules reflected current news stories on civil rights investigations, specifically those involving George Floyd and Breonna Taylor, and movements and counter movements that were identified as supporting either end of these investigations, such as Black Lives Matters and Blue Lives Matters.

> In turn, additional training opportunities to address these issues, within a DEI context, have expanded. It's all about whether or not the participants build. Within this expansion, the capacity for participants to build and equip themselves with tools to support their work sets the stage for successful outcomes with our training. Additionally, due to participants' feedback, a remarketing campaign has been instituted to advance the intentionality of DEI themes within the cultural competence framework.

After further clarification, it was noted that the remarketing campaign consisted of reframing verbiage used in the titles and descriptions with DEI focused content and context. Promotion to organizations outside of the program's traditional higher education clientele, specifically private and public secondary education institutions and community organizations, has also been an outreach expansion. Also, the necessity of this training due to transitions in societal events was emphasized in this remarketing campaign. Within the course, the participants gained information

on how they can measure themselves and initiate training and engagements on their own campuses.

> According to Hall, these measurements specifically related to the professionals' level of engagement of DEI focused initiatives, the incorporation of DEI elements into daily practice, policies, and procedures, and the rating of cultural bias. These aspects serve as the true assessment of the training's impact; however, it would require longitudinal studies to gain long-term impressions of the training.

Hall also noted that their post training surveys were comprised of qualitative and qualitative questions which influence how elements of their training would be delivered and evaluated long-term. It was noted by Hall:

> These surveys elicit responses that are utilized in our train-the-trainer model of instruction with college campus organizations. Data from a particular college has an influence on how the training is presented with that college's participants. Ultimately, this model has been influenced by the qualitative feedback which reflects how the training has impacted the participants' work experiences long-term. This feedback has been linked to further exploration of racial identity and racial equity through infusion into education outside of the traditional training in settings such as retreats and other professional development activities. There is a takeaway to incorporate into every training experience.

DuBois indicated the program utilized a post survey to gain the initial reactions of the trainees inclusive of various aspects of the training, the anticipated impact upon their jobs, and how they could utilize the lessons for future training. It was noted:

SurveyMonkey and Survey Gizmo have been utilized to present a Likert scale and open-ended questions to gage responses reflective of the overall training value. There typically was an option to provide additional feedback as well. The post training follow-up has occurred over several months to gain insight on the long-term impact on changes within our training practices and campus engagement. Success stories set the stage from which further resources have been built upon with the enhancement of live trainings to the creation of on-demand videos. These videos have been readily available for members and offer contact information to gain further insight upon their journeys and impact upon their college communities.

It has been a challenge to collect this data from success stories and other journeys due to the limited response rate. Even so, this data helped to inform the program on instructional supports that may have greater impacts upon learning outcomes. We modeled these resources and trainings after an existing 21-day challenge. It presented the opportunity to present one resource daily for 21 business days. These resources consisted of a variety of resources that were articles, videos, websites and they weren't necessarily our resources. The emphasis was placed on effective practices within organizations which resonated through various themes. The town halls were another end result of how these instructional designs led to interactive learning and engagement.

My personal experiences with the online surveys for each training program mirrored the accounts presented by the participants. With the exception of Hall and Soar's organization, it was accurate that no additional follow-up was received outside of general announcements that were forwarded to the entire member body or association. The optional post training experiences varied. The train-the-trainer model, as noted by Hall, was considered, but not incorporated due to

premature infrastructure of the institution's DEI training and support for advanced training options. In contrast, the 21-Day Challenge and the town halls, as stated by DuBois, were incorporated as follow-up actionable steps as a means to build community, engage in social justice dialog with a collective voice, and gain insight from other Title IX and human resources professionals.

Summary

Understanding the perspectives Title IX training professionals have upon their organization's cultural competence training is an integral component in the evolution and successful outcomes of their training with Title IX Coordinators. This chapter presented three prominent themes and six subthemes from the interviews conducted with five individuals across three training programs. The three major themes were: (1) The prevalence of the connectivity of Title IX training with diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) informed the training experience. (2) Innovation in teaching and learning practices produced positive outcomes. (3) The evaluative process informed the training's immediate outcomes, long-term impact, and overall implementation. The study findings present a model for development, implementation, and sustainability of cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators. It is suggested that successful implementation of such training is inherently shaped by various factors as presented.

Study participants expressed the importance of utilizing formalized processes to create and implement training. Amid presenting societal interests and needs, these processes have pivoted over time to address these elements accordingly. Even so, the processes were considered vital components of next steps leading to successful student learning outcomes. In maintaining formalized processes, all study participants reportedly have undergone internal reviews of training content, options, and evaluation. To extend the scope of review and support beyond the

walls of the training programs, the study participants identified allies, organizations, and coalitions that helped guide their training development and implementation processes. For example, one study participant noted that the elements derived from the National Association for Chief Diversity Officers training served as the platform to structure DEI related segments and lean on the most appropriate framework to fulfill the mission of the training. Another study participant indicated that strong ties with the American Jewish Committee presented relevant training elements in support of strengthening relations and building bridges with African Americans and Jewish Americans.

All study participants highlighted how trends with technology and virtual learning have impacted the evolution of their training, service delivery, and evaluative processes. The transition to virtual learning over the course of the recent COVID-19 pandemic presented drawbacks in familiarity and comfort levels in each of these modes; however, this incorporation of varied tools and technology have broadened their range in service delivery and connections to Title IX Coordinators across the globe. For example, one study participant noted that due to the transitions during the COVID-19 pandemic, the doors have opened to always have elements of virtual training and resources at the table, bringing brought forth affordability and availability and ultimately expanding the training audience. Another study participant recognized the importance of meeting the demands of limited attention spans by having a good mix of online content inclusive of video content and short-term e-Learning course delivery versus strictly in-person, long-term training over the course of a full workday or several days. All study participants shared a common belief that advocacy for e-Learning can be deemed as a strategic measure affecting expansion of active engagement in the Title IX field. On the contrasting side

of this eLearning advocacy was the recognition of preparing trainers to create and deliver quality training through both internal and external pedagogical and technology training.

It is important to note that all of the noted training programs presented a next step of successful outcomes with offering certificates of completion and industry certification credentials for Title IX Coordinators. Study participants stressed the need to offer third party credentials and recognition to trainees as a means to stay relevant and competitive in the training industry. To further diversify this credentialing, two of the three training programs offered advanced levels of these training opportunities to differentiate individuals, practitioners, and experts in this profession. With such reputations at stake, it was noted that who you are as an upright and innovative organization supports the sale of the content, regardless of what the content is.

Although many similarities existed, this research study revealed several significant differences across the training programs. It is important to note that the cultural competency training programs were established by ATIXA, CUPA-HR, and NCBI within the past two years, within the current decade, and over the course of 30 years, respectively. A striking difference was that the ATIXA organization relied on one main content developer to guide the direction and context of the training while the other two training programs incorporated several perspectives into this process. It was noted by Cross that due to her DEI expertise, she “brings the added layer of the eye to the firm and how we're now putting work together to really infuse our content towards preparing Title IX professionals to really think about the one component. With respect to how it intersects with their work at Title IX Coordinators or other members of the Title IX.” Next, it was also noted that “we need to build our bench” to bring other practitioners to the table to influence this process. Ultimately, all study participants indicated their final training content

underwent an internal review process prior to delivery to the trainees. Cross also offered training segments in which participants explored their own identities, shared their stories, and gained positive reinforcement from the trainers and other participants while the other two training programs were limited to self-reflective activities that were optional to share. On another note, the Cross reported limitations in service delivery and implementation have been due to funding. The other organizations did not present financial concerns; however, they spoke to being in competition with other organizations offering similar training opportunities. Lastly, a contrasting finding was that ATIXA and NCBI offered detailed qualitative and quantitative surveys to gain trainees' feedback while CUPA-HR presented a Likert rating scale in this process. Within this process, success was determined differently across the board based on the number of evaluations completed, rating scale responses, participants' reflective feedback, and/or the incorporation of the training in the participants' day-to-day work.

In Chapter 5, I will discuss the research findings in relation to the current body of literature. Also, I will provide practical implications and recommendations for future research in reference to the development, delivery, implementation, and evolution of Title IX training for Title IX Coordinators. The recommendations in this study are of particular interest for Title IX Coordinators working in higher education institutions and the institutions and other organizations which employ them and lean on them for knowledge and oversight of the Title IX Policy.

CHAPTER 5: SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Although non-discriminatory practices are defined in federal Title IX regulations, there is limited exploration of data regarding cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators whose responsibilities include the review, implementation, and enforcement of these regulations and practices in higher education. The existing literature urges for restorative justice measures to be considered in decision-making, directly appealing to the need for cultural competence training (Karp & Sacks, 2014; Koss et al., 2014; Vail, 2019). Evolving as a concept during the era of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 to federal legislation in 1972, cultural competence has been at the forefront of equity driven dialog in higher education, specifically in the allocation of funds for educational programming. As enforced by United States policy and the Civil Rights Act of 1964, federally assisted programs addressed the significance of cultural competence on the basis of race, color, or national origin. In making the connection to professional development training, research has emphasized the need for cultural competencies to be explicit and intentional (Pope & Pope, 2014). Cultural competence is considered a necessity for all professionals, including those in the Title IX field, due to ever changing demographics and the increased awareness of the significance of culturally responsive professional practices. In managing cases involving wide-ranging clientele, the core of cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators may result in challenges in the full conceptualization and application of theoretical models to actual practice. With the intersection of diverse identities and group affiliations, the perpetuation of stereotypes and blanketed standards may hinder progression (Johnson & Munch, 2009; Yan & Wong, 2005). As highlighted by Sander et al. (2016), it is of utmost importance for practitioners to gain understanding of cultural competence and build upon their past experiences in order to develop

sustaining processes which positively impact services to culturally diverse and minoritized populations.

The purpose of this study was to investigate ways in which cultural competence training programs, specifically designed for Title IX Coordinators in higher education, develop and evolve. Revelation of the noted areas may offer insight into underlining issues faced by Title IX Coordinators in their duties and responsibilities. These findings seek to clarify concerns by training participants at a systemic level, potentially leading to enhanced development of services, policies, and procedures.

As previously noted, the following overarching question served as the base for this study with the noted sub-questions: What are the similarities and differences in cultural competence training programs designed for Title IX Coordinators by the Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), the College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)?

1. What steps are taken in the program development process?
2. What are the main factors contributing to training implementation?
3. What measures are considered when assessing and tracking performance and/or training effectiveness?
4. What factors have impacted the evolution of the training?

Findings of this study generated the following salient themes which facilitated understanding participants' experiences and knowledge within Title IX training development and implementation:

1. The prevalence of the connectivity of Title IX training with diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) driven data and experiences informed the training experiences.

2. Innovation in teaching and learning practices produced impactful outcomes.
3. The evaluative processes informed the trainings' immediate outcomes, long-term impact, and overall implementation.

Based on the findings represented by these themes, I present the following discussion, conclusions, and recommendations pertaining to a rich understanding of the training development, implementation, evaluation, and evolution of cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators.

Chapter 1 introduced the concepts of cultural competence over the past sixty years. It also made the case for the significance of this study and its objectives as well as conceptualized the study. Chapter 2 offered a literature review of scholarly bodies of work which synthesized findings across studies. It revealed aligned and varied research outcomes and perspectives by cultural theorists and resources. The theoretical framework, centered on Transformative Learning Theory, examined the association among concepts and ideas that supported the comparison of three cultural competence training programs. Chapter 3 served as the roadmap of the research study and outlined the steps taken for data collection. This chapter also outlined the data collection process and the limitations of this research. Chapter 4 organized and reported the research findings as presented through the interviews conducted with the participants. This section also compared and evaluated the three cultural competence training programs, reviewed the data collection and analysis procedures, and summarized the study findings. Chapter 5, this current and final chapter of the study, is organized into six major sections. It initiated with the overview of the study approach followed by a summary of the study findings and its prominent results. The chapter's third and fourth sections present the study's delimitations and limitations as well as its implications and recommendations for future research. The chapter's final two sections

discuss the study's implications and recommendations as associated with higher education and theory and the concluding analyses.

Study Approach

Although the goals of this research study sought to address the fundamental elements of cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators, reaching the ceiling in regard to the creation of practical frameworks for building and maintaining inclusive college communities was essential. Due to the varied structures of higher education institutions, professionals in the Title IX field have varied levels of expertise, knowledge, and educational and training backgrounds (Dungy, 2003). Unlike a traditional design of standalone services, the current Title IX operation model has embraced addressing students' needs holistically to be inclusive of support services, student activities, and campus protection and safety (Kuk & Banning, 2009). As a result, Title IX Coordinators may be excluded from gaining the opportunity to expand their learning potential and evolution in cultural competence as professionals and with other populations they serve. Despite these noted limitations that may exist, Title IX Coordinators hold crucial responsibilities for executing compliance measures at their respective institutions to support their entire college communities. In efforts to bridge this gap, varied professional development opportunities have promoted growth and development in cultural competence to this targeted audience. Discovering how training organizations have been able to develop, implement, and evaluate cultural competence training could provide higher education with the opportunity to gain greater understanding of the factors with impact informed decision-making and the enforcement of culturally responsive practices within the profession. Additionally, this study could provide an opportunity for training organizations to view their standing procedures and policies from a different lens to ensure the foundation for growth and development in this area is robust.

Furthermore, this study could serve as a means to bridge the dialog between training organizations and their targeted audiences with regard to training effectiveness and fulfillment of their needs and interests.

This study utilized qualitative methods to examine and to illustrate different perspectives on how the three cultural competence training programs advanced their stages of development, implementation, evaluation, and evolution. It is of significance to note that method triangulation was used to support data collection through three mechanisms - interviews, supporting documentation, and observation. As noted by Polit and Beck (2012), method triangulation utilizes numerous data collection approaches to address a common phenomenon and has been recognized as a strategy to test validity through the integration of data from different sources (Patton, 1999). Use of method triangulation enhanced the quality of this study's qualitative analysis by engaging the noted three collection techniques. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with five study participants employed by three organizations. The interview process was framed by a 13-question interview protocol. This interview protocol was specifically developed to obtain descriptive data related to the study participants' knowledge and experiences with training programs developed and implemented by their respective organizations (see Appendix B). These areas of inquiry were inclusive of the following:

- action steps taken in the program development process;
- conceptual framework utilized and themes explored when designing training;
- principal factors contributing to training implementation;
- specialized programs and/or resources used to support implementation;
- definitions and perceptions of success;
- ways in which evaluation results are incorporated into future programming;

- factors that have impacted the evolution of the training;
- expansion of training;
- trends which influence the training's content, context, and delivery;
- experienced and anticipated challenges with regard to program development, delivery, implementation, and evaluation.

All but one interview was conducted via video conferencing through the Microsoft Teams software platform. Although the exception was held via a telephone conversation, it was audio-recorded and transcribed through Microsoft Teams. The interviews were approximately 75 minutes to 90 minutes in length. All study participants were provided the opportunity to openly share their knowledge and experiences to the extent they desired.

Study Sites

The selection of the following three training programs helped to shape training in cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators: The Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA), College and University Professional Association (CUPA-HR), and the National Coalition Building Institute (NCBI). *It is important to note that due to* the lack of response from the *Society for Human Resource Management* (*SHRM), NCBI* served as a viable replacement. Although ATIXA, CUPA-HR, and NCBI presented similar training topics in cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators and other related professions, there were also varying elements presented. These three perspectives presented the means for me to explore both comparisons and differentiations among various models. As noted, I have had experience with each of these organizations through numerous training opportunities and/or institutional memberships. They are all considered premiere training programs in higher education, and specifically in the field of Title IX. This rationale supports the perception that these organizations are caliber in terms of presenting

nationally recognized training comprised of quality content. Through this familiarity, the goal was to move beyond gatekeeper knowledge into the purview of insider information to access additional and/or undisclosed data for review. This was the case with two out of the three organizations in which I received updated training guides and descriptions considered “hot off the press” or unpublished. Even though transparency was presented in my affiliation with one organization, the participant seemed quite guarded in providing any additional information beyond what was available to the general public on their website.

Study Participants

All study participants were professionals employed by the three identified training organizations, ATIXA, CUPA-HR, and NCBI. The desired requisites to participating in this study were their professional identification as training content developers, trainers, and/or related role and their experiences with developing, implementing, and/or training for Title IX Coordinators focused specifically on cultural competence. Over the course of communication exchanges with the potential participants, three additional professionals were referred to me based on their alignment to the noted requisites. This process yielded interviews with five professionals. The participants’ roles and the length of time employed with their respective organizations, ranging from a few months to three decades, are listed in Chapter 4, Table 1.

Results of the Study

The study participants shared their knowledge, experiences, and insight related to cultural competence training initiatives and the organizational context in which these concepts were c to their targeted audiences inclusive of Title IX Coordinators. The resulting study findings illustrated participants’ perceptions of the current state of cultural competence training development, implementation, evaluation, and requirements geared toward sustainability and evolution.

Through utilization of the method triangulation, these perceptions aligned with supporting documentation and direct observation.

The Connectivity of Cultural Competence Training with DEI

The study participants all highlighted significance points in how their cultural competence training was more interconnected with the societal climate than ever before. Wherein years past these elements were loosely aligned, being faced with the COVID-19 pandemic and the exacerbation of racial inequities during this point in history have deepened this connection. DEI initiatives influenced the direction of training development and implementation. The study participants emphasized that their request volumes were at all-time highs over the past 1-½ years and presented the need to pivot their service offerings and infuse the voices of their trainees into their training. As noted by data from the Pew Research Center, more than 75% of Americans thought that the heightened emphasis on racial inequities was representative of a societal mindset change in how these issues were perceived (Humphreys, 2021). The need was presented to extend beyond a theory-based focus to action-oriented engagement. As noted by participants Cross and Woodson, the restructuring and evolution of their training emerged out of the collective voices of professionals as activated by the previously noted COVID-19 pandemic and 2020 racial and social justice cases. It was a consensus that there was a need to remain closely connected to the field of cultural competence training and the perspectives of higher education institutions across the country. Through exposure to varied models of thought and theory, the participants highlighted that alignment with external DEI resources and services was considered essential in supporting the structure of their DEI related initiatives and frameworks. As emphasized by participant Hall, aspects of DEI work were continuously considered in the evolution of their cultural competence training while participants Soar and DuBois revealed that these aspects

directly aligned with the mission, content, and context of their existing cultural competence training.

Innovation in Teaching and Learning Practices

The study's findings presented the notion that innovation in teaching and learning practices produced positive outcomes for the trainees as well as the organizations. There were numerous societal trends identified by the participants which reportedly affected their training delivery and implementation inclusive of the following: (1) increased access and attraction to remote learning opportunities; (2) expanded partnerships with educational institutions; and (3) training offered to organizations at a cost reduction. Participants articulated that their challenges in remote teaching and learning demystified the perception that online training modalities were subordinate to other critical areas related to in-person instruction, strategic planning, and evaluative processes (as noted in the interviews.) Additionally, the progression in the training touchstones positively influenced the learning continuum. This progression also contributed to the adjustment to instructional planning focused on the evolution of societal needs. Since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, the participants noted that the methods in instructional design and teaching pivoted from in-person instruction to remote training. Simultaneously, their training content leaned toward DEI focused subject matter. To great extent, this was due to the increased requests by their training audiences and the need to sustain connectivity and engagement with their trainee base. Also, participant Hall considered the current state of training to be a "buyer's market" with numerous options for consideration for trainees to commit their time and money. All participants placed emphasis on thriving in a competitive industry and the need for innovative training content and delivery. Such a vigorous market has ignited creativity and reflection on the overall value and sustainability of the training for each organization.

The Influence of an Evaluative Process

The study's findings revealed that each organization's evaluative process informed the training's short and long-term impact as well as implementation. With all programs actively attempting to gain post training data, it was noted that there were challenges across the board in retrieving the data. Both participants Woodson and Hall revealed that post training evaluations were utilized to gain feedback regarding the structure and content of their courses. These surveys were offered via online platforms featuring a Likert scale and open-ended questions. Participants Hall and Cross noted that their organizations conducted post training outreach over the course of several months in hopes of gaining success stories and testimonies on effective practices. All participants reported that there had been traditionally a low rate of response from trainees, considering it a daunting task in their attempts to collect them. The limited data collected were ultimately used to inform the training programs' instructional supports and positively impact the learning outcomes. It was also noted by all participants that marketing campaigns were necessary to reframe verbiage and promote training to audiences outside of those traditionally working in higher education. This advertising approach was established to forward the intentionality of DEI focused themes within cultural competence frameworks. It was important to note that within the training courses, the participants gained information on how self-evaluation was beneficial in initiating training and engagements on their own campuses. As noted by Hall, feedback has been linked to further examination of both racial identity and racial equity within their training to meet the expectations and needs of their trainees.

Currently, there are gaps in the literature regarding the examination of the cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators in higher education. The existing literature broadly addressed the cultural competence of Student Affairs professionals and the training mechanisms

involved to support these professionals. In an attempt to gain deeper understanding of the training organizations' roles in bridging these gaps, participants were asked a series of questions regarding their development process, training implementation, evaluative methods, training effectiveness, and the evolution of their organizations' cultural competence training.

Strategic Planning

The data from this study emphasized the importance of organizations to strategically plan for the sustainability of cultural competence training. Study participants acknowledged connections to action planning based on evaluative processes but did not reveal long-term strategic directions. It is noted that developing sustainable, impactful engagement in higher education requires leadership and vision that are interconnected to strategies which are responsive to emerging priorities within the organization (Hatzipanagos & Russell, 2014). Training programs must take heed to this responsiveness and incorporate viable plans of action accordingly.

Competition

Based on the participants' responses, industry competition influences training development and implementation. This perception, in part, is noted as ambiguous in its direction as it is determined by distinctive circumstances of an industry at a particular moment in time. It was noted that two years of pivoting during the COVID-19 pandemic presented opportunities for decision makers to scan the industry's training options. As noted by participant DuBois, this drive to sustain vitality and visibility has opened the gateway for the organizations to embrace varied modes of technologies, teaching, and learning practices. The challenge continuously exists in delivering relevant training at the right time and at the point of need in today's "on-demand" age. As noted by Hall, societal demands drive competition. Organizations must tune into these demands to sustain their vigor and maximize their reach with their targeted audiences. The

participants all referenced the need to maintain longevity in the industry. In doing so, they noted that their respective organizations must respond swiftly to address knowledge gaps and offer the means to access and apply learning in immediate and practical ways.

Limitations of the Study

As practitioners connect this research study's findings to a larger context, it is essential to recognize the various limitations of this study. Through diligent and persistent outreach methods, I secured interviews with five professionals (n=5) to participate in my study. As previously noted, nine individuals were initially identified as prospective participants based on their work titles and position listings on their organizations' websites. After making contact with these individuals, six additional participant requests were sent via email and telephone. These efforts resulted in five participants representing ATIXA, NCBI, and CUPA-HR. Several connections were made with leads from each organization; however, most of those attempts were unsuccessful. The remainder of the requests yielded disinterest or no response. These experiences culminated into daunting, time-consuming tasks which presented many moments for me to step away from the recruitment process completely. This offered moments to refocus and regain momentum. In juggling my own work and life transitions during the COVID-19 pandemic, I could relate to the frustrations and struggles presented by the professionals in regard to pivoting and sustaining their vitality in the workplace. The desire was for a greater number of study participants. I was humbled by these interactions and grateful to have made these solid five connections after many moments of uncertainty.

In considering these dilemmas, the inclusion of three training organizations narrowed the scope of this study. Although a larger sample size may have offered greater diversity in thought and practice, this smaller sample size allotted additional time to examine the responses. Although

there was only one participant from CUPA-HR, I thought it was essential to maintain this information-rich informant due to his/her position, long-standing history with the organization, and years of professional experience in training development.

Another issue that emerged from the execution of the study was the challenge of gaining responses to requests for participation during transitional periods of the COVID-19 pandemic and noted racial and social justice cases in 2020. These circumstances presented unforeseen limitations due to work closures and modified working schedules. Also, the training organizations indicated they were inundated with requests for support and guidance from their trainee base. Balancing these requests and revamping training modules to meet the needs of these audiences was deemed as priority tasks. Based on the limited and/or direct feedback, my requests were considered secondary for some individuals and/or organizations. It was noted that the timing of the interviews conflicted with their scheduled training sessions and/or management of their requested training. I could relate to these timing dilemmas in my role as a Title IX Coordinator. My time and commitments were stretched with executing the newest Title IX federal regulations issued in 2020 within the 2021 virtual world. There was an uptick in Title IX cases centered on domestic violence concerns as our college communities learned and worked from the confines of their homes. The availability of concentrated time was limited and mirrored the experiences of my study participants. Also, limited staffing did not offer the lead way to delegate and/or balance such requests for some organizations. The challenges in obtaining responses resulted in the small sample of five participants representative of three training organizations. These results may lead to the findings being valuable to a lesser extent to other researchers interested in cultural competence training development and implementation for Title IX Coordinators.

In addition to the aforesaid limitations and for the sake of transparency, it is important to acknowledge that I served as the primary investigator for this research study as well as a Title IX Coordinator in higher education throughout the duration of this study. In these noted roles, I have participated in each of the identified cultural competency training programs at some point over the course of eight years. My institution maintained paid memberships associated with ATIXA and CUPA-HR and afforded me the opportunity to participate in training with NCBI. Additionally, I had direct oversight of the Title IX compliance at my institution. As these factors can be considered a limitation of researcher bias, the inclusion of training materials and website information enhanced this study as well as and brought forth consistencies and/or variances of my lived experiences. Applying these perspectives presented a richer overall research experience.

In addition to the previously mentioned limitations, some study participants offered responses with limited insight as determined by the brevity of their responses. Probing questions were asked throughout the interviews to gain more clarity and perspective. Although interviews were ultimately conducted, it was reported by participants Woodson, Hall, and Cross that the timing of this study was during an inopportune timeframe for their organizations' participation. They noted that this period conflicted with other demands inclusive of training requests and limitations in delegating such requests to other qualified colleagues. Participants Dubois and Soar indicated that the study was timely, was considerate of their availability, and offered the means for them to contribute to the field.

Implications for Higher Education

The findings of this current research study presented significant implications for future research in reference to the development, implementation, evaluation, and evolution of cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators. As previously presented, recommendations in this

study serve to benefit Title IX Coordinators working in higher education and the institutions and other organizations which rely on them for expertise knowledge and oversight of the Title IX Policy. The results from this study serve to aid training organizations in preparing and sustaining the cultural competence growth and development of Title IX Coordinators in higher education. Training developers and practitioners can also utilize these findings to enhance Title IX Coordinators' and other Title IX associated professionals' training experiences. It is worth the consideration to expand the scope of this research to a wide-ranging audience. This may be achieved through use of a quantitative method to alleviate scheduling and time constraints associated with the noted qualitative method.

Implications for Theory

In attempts to reveal the roles that training organizations play in the growth and development of cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators, this study was framed using the Transformational Learning Theory and supplemented by elements of the Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity (DMIS). The focus on the lifetime of the continuum of experiences and the frameworks of these widely used theoretical models within assessment and training expose considerations for the developmental process (Deardorff & Arasaratnam-Smith, 2017). The findings of this research suggest that the Transformational Learning Theory supports the continual growth and evolution of cultural competence through several overarching perspectives inclusive of demographic data, gender-based stereotypes, and racial stigmas. Training programs can enhance this progression by intensifying exploration of practical application of training modules which impact the development and execution of Title IX policies and procedures. Additionally, the findings suggest that training organizations may improve their intent and context of training, apply a comprehensive theoretical model to guide action steps, and outline a developmental process (Bennett, 2017).

Recommendations for Future Research

This current study focused exclusively on the development, implementation, evaluation, and evolution of cultural competency training for Title IX Coordinators. The findings from this study present a framework for additional research relating to structuring sustainable models for development and implementation. I acknowledge that the limited study sample size may not be descriptive of all related training organizations.

Subsequently, I recommend that future research investigates cultural competence training initiatives offered by other professional organizations in addition to those which target Title IX Coordinators in secondary education. This expansion presents the opportunity to enrich this area of interest with viewpoints from administrators in diverse learning environments.

Another recommendation is to recognize the control of a single training developer in reference to the perspective and direction of training content and its context. Three participants in this study indicated their cultural competence training was created by a team of developers; however, two participants revealed that such training was solely created by one content developer. As the solo content creator, he/she received the "blessing" of the other organizational leaders to implement training from his/her perspective. In considering the varied skills, knowledge, and training experiences of content creators, it is important to consider how these experiences and developmental approaches impact the overall training framework and training effectiveness. Additionally, a valid consideration is that content creators must tune into attracting the target audience, driving engagement, and reaching the desired goals of both their trainees and organizations. It is also significant to further explore the work experiences and transferable work skills of each participant as well as the length of time worked with their respective organizations.

These factors may also impact the perspective of the content development and the succession of delivery and evaluation.

Next, it is important for training organizations to consider the development of a benchmarking strategy for evaluating progression towards their goals. In doing so, tracking the appropriate training metrics comes into play. These metrics must be reflective in providing the complete picture of training quality and effectiveness. Additionally, by identifying solid key performance indicators, the organization can benefit from the following actions: (1) bringing forth objective evidence of progression leading to desired outcomes; (2) offering comparisons to examine performance outcomes over time; and (3) track key factors such as efficiency, resource utilization, and effectiveness. As all participants in this study identified simplistic evaluation strategies, time must be taken to regularly monitor, analyze, and review training goals. In doing so, the organization is positioned to become more agile and in a place to shift their strategies as needed.

The participants did not report the existence of a strategic plan to outline the long-term direction of their organizations' cultural competence training. In addition to applying a strategic direction to their developmental process, a thorough training needs analysis is recommended to gain greater understanding of not only who to train but identifying the most feasible times for the training within a professionals' career and points that tap into trending topics and transitional periods in society. Additionally, it is essential to also consider how to effectively deliver the training to maximize the participants' experiences. In identifying the needs of both the organization and its trainees, time must be reflected in understanding historical precedence, present viewpoints, and future direction.

The planning process should be inclusive of feedback gained from the organizations' constituents comprised of higher education institutions and Title IX Coordinators. Additionally, this plan should serve as an evolving process that offers a continuous feedback loop. This process supports the ever-changing needs of cultural competence training. Basic aims of this planning should ideally include the following:

- Vision for training development and implementation
    - Specify the alignment of the plan with the organization's overall mission and goals
    - Examine ways in which the organization will experience change upon effective implementation
    - Identify opportunities for modifications to the organizational framework
- Rationale for cultural competence training
    - Justify how cultural competence training promotes the organizational plans and projections for future training
    - Communicate the ways that cultural competence training can offer both access and flexibility for trainees
    - Illustrate how innovative training options and structure can enhance learning and application practices
- Core principles
    - Communicate the advantages of cultural competence in Title IX programming
    - Clarify how cultural competence training promotes ongoing and valuable professional development
- Strategic direction

    - Examine what the organization desires to accomplish through cultural competence training initiatives
- Measurable outcomes associated with the goals
    - Create a quality assurance scorecard to assess achievement of the stated aims
    - Construct an instructional design which promotes ascending course development
    - Explore ways in which the organization can create a system of support services for the trainee
    - Evaluate which technology platforms can be utilized to enhance the overall learning experience
    - Investigate options for trainee progression and development
- Specific actions to accomplish outcomes
    - Formulate a checklist to achieve the specified outcomes
    - Identify and establish a plan to collaborate with institutional and community partners

The findings of this study suggest the need to build community to make a deeper connection with the training beyond its conclusion. In doing so, I recommend that organizations consider the development of learning communities which could pair Title IX Coordinators in varied ways including those newer in their roles with those considered seasoned. As noted by Owen (2014), learning communities offer a reflective and collaborative flow of information which presents the opportunity for professionals to connect over extended periods of time to share their experiences and effective practices. In considering the context of these learning communities, seasoned Title IX Coordinators could provide individualized guidance and

experiences on navigating through varied scenarios and dilemmas regarding pertinent issues inclusive of decision-making and sanctioning processes.

In recognizing the need for action steps beyond the training process, I recommend that researchers further investigate the impact of training on participants. The feedback gained directly from these participants is essential to amplifying their voices to the overall training development that may impact the vision of their profession as decision-makers and compliance officers for years to come. Beyond gaining simplistic participant feedback, the contribution of data from longitudinal studies could add value to the effectiveness and usefulness of the training. For example, metrics may be inclusive of the following:

- the percentage of participants utilizing the training strategies and methods in their daily professional practices;
- defined ways in which participants have specifically incorporated these lessons learned into actionable steps;
- how the follow-up materials and check-ins by the organizations impact their continued learning and development in cultural competence.

Lastly, it must be recognized that the learning process extends beyond the training. Training reinforcement must be considered a standard to support the core concepts and skills presented during the training. With offering a series of applicable takeaways following the conclusion of the training courses, trainees are more likely to not only remember more of what was initially presented, but also apply this knowledge to their everyday work. Opportunities to strengthen this connection may be supplemented by social learning. The premise is that trainees connect to their fellow learners and trainers through mechanisms such as virtual meetings, forums, and chat groups. Such interaction brings forth opportunities to share experiences and

build upon effective practices. Additionally, other supplemental action steps to consider include the following:

1. Provide refresher courses to share trainees' success stories as well as challenging moments.
2. Arrange post-training follow-up sessions as moments of reflection, supplementary lessons, and/or skills practice.
3. Create the space to practice newly acquired skills learned from the training. Without such opportunity, the trainees may be hindered when applying their knowledge to on-the-job experiences.

The noted training reinforcement not only serves to solidify learning experiences, but it also brings forth elements of empowerment and motivation for the trainees. Ideally, this training reinforcement leads to increased learning retention and facilitation of the seamless transition of knowledge to application.

Lastly, the scope of this dissertation was grounded in the Transformational Learning Theory and supplemented by elements of the Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity (DMIS). Existent literature regarding training development acknowledges that organizations should rethink their purpose and apply a theoretical method to address next steps and describe a developmental process within intercultural training programs (Bennett, 2017). Each study participant presented varied models from which their training was developed. Further exploration of these theoretical models and other methods utilized in the development process would add benefit the body of this research. In doing so, it may also benefit researchers to extract the themes which guide the development, implementation, evaluation, and progression of cultural competence training programs inclusive of the noted three organizations in this study.

Conclusion

As revealed throughout the literature review, researchers reiterate the notion of the rise in diversity-related issues has driven the development of multicultural competence for Title IX Coordinators and must advance with intentionality through professional development training (Pope & Pope, 2014). Similarly, Sander et al. (2016) reverberates that evolving issues influence services to culturally diverse and minoritized populations, and in as such, practitioners must take active roles in building upon past experiences to develop culturally relevant perspectives and processes which effectively address future impact.

Title IX Coordinators are challenged to recognize the components of diversity within a culturally competent framework. These elements are inclusive of the following cross-cultural references in this study: dimensions of race and ethnicity, gender and sexual orientation, religion, abilities/disabilities, age, and socioeconomic status (Kohli et al., 2010). In considering the roles of Title IX Coordinators, they hold responsibilities in integrating culturally relevant strategies into their decision-making processes and compliance measures which lean on acquiring awareness, gaining knowledge, and integrating skills among people of varied experiences, backgrounds, and perspectives (Castellanos & Gloria, 2007). Limitations in this work reveal challenges in the following: (1) the exposure of professionals' biases and stereotypes; (2) recognition of the time restrictions to address reported concerns due to other responsibilities and/or policy expectations; and (3) acknowledgment of the limited knowledge acquired in supporting diverse populations (Calvillo et al., 2009). With these noted dilemmas influencing service delivery and decision-making, the opportunity is presented for Title IX Coordinators to effectively impact their institutions through a culturally competent lens.

The thematic approach utilized in this study supported the identification, coding, and categorization of emergent themes and provided a visual representation of how factors identified within the study paralleled theory (Grant & Osanloo, 2014). Three prominent themes were revealed by the participants regarding their Title IX training experiences and are as follows:

1. The connectivity of Title IX training with diversity, equity, and inclusion elements and data informed the training experience.
2. Innovation in teaching and learning produced positive outcomes.
3. The evaluation process informed the trainings' immediate outcomes, long-term impact, and the overall implementation.

The findings revealed how participants' perceptions of their training were centered on racial equity concepts and in tune to the cultural climate. Next, participants delineated instruction alignment with societal trends and emphasized the voices of their targeted audiences. Lastly, participants' training organizations valued and engaged in the collection and utilization of qualitative and quantitative data to advance their instructional delivery and to increase trainees' learning and engagement.

Building allyships are essential. It was noted by the study participants that varied organizations and coalitions helped direct their training development and implementation processes. It is important to consider the position of higher education in these next steps. How can the senior leadership at colleges and universities take an active role in supporting related training and professional learning outcomes for their Title IX professionals? Support from senior leadership may serve as a driver to strengthening the relationships between higher education and the noted training organizations as well as bring forth the conversations regarding the impact of DEI-related issues in Title IX. Title IX Coordinators can support their senior leadership in gaining

clarity on these issues by infusing college-wide professional development within other avenues of professional learning that are DEI-based such as listening sessions, summits, safe space training, and convocation activities.

As previously noted, the recommendations outlined in this research study are of specific interest to Title IX Coordinators employed as higher education employees and the institutions and other organizations that employ them to oversee their organizations' Title IX compliance. It was a consensus by the study participants that the COVID-19 pandemic and noted racial and social justice cases and movements in 2020 directly dictated the development, implementation, evaluation, and evolution of their organizations' cultural competence training. The voices of their targeted training audiences were positioned to be heard and amplified more than ever; their demands for culturally relevant training were being recognized and fulfilled.

Numerous action-oriented recommendations were derived from the findings as follows:

1. Build upon a larger sample size to derive generalizations.
2. Explore training programs which support Title IX Coordinators in secondary education.
3. Recognize the control of a single training developer it as relates to direction of the training content and its context.
4. Explore the work experiences of each participant and the length of time worked with their respective organizations.
5. Devise a benchmarking strategy to evaluate other training institutions' perspectives on metrics and performance indicators.
6. Incorporate strategic planning to support long-term direction.

7. Support Title IX Coordinators in building community and making connections with fellow professionals.
8. Investigate the long-term impact of training on trainees.
9. Reinforce training to support trainees' core concepts and skills beyond the training through refresher courses, post-training follow-up sessions, and creation of opportunities to practice newly acquired skills learned from the training.
10. Further explore theoretical models, strategies, and themes guiding the delivery, implementation, and progression of cultural competence training programs.
11. Build allyships with senior leadership at higher education institutions.

In conclusion, this is my modest attempt to make a contribution to the field of cultural competence training. This study adds value and perspective to elements of my professional role as a Title IX Coordinator at a higher education institution. It is important to recognize that my research study has not solved the many complexities and issues that exist in cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators in its entirety and for all time. Recommendations have been presented to extend research beyond the scope of this study.

REFERENCES

Alexander v. Yale University**,** 459 F. Supp. 1 (1977).

Ali, R. (2011). Dear Colleague Letter. https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/letters/colleague-201104.pdf

American College Personnel Association & National Association of Student Personnel Administrators. (2010). *Professional competency areas for student affairs practitioners. Task force on professional competencies and standards.* https://www.naspa.org/images/uploads/main/ACPA_NASPA_Professional_Competencies_FINAL.pdf.

American College Personnel Association & National Association of Student Personnel Administrators. (2015). *Professional competency areas for student affairs educators.* https://www.naspa.org/images/uploads/main/ACPA_NASPA_Professional_Competencies_FINAL.pdf

American Counseling Association. (2014). *2014 ACA code of ethics.* https://www.counseling.org/Resources/aca-code-of-ethics.pdf

American Psychological Association. (2020). *APA dictionary of psychology.* https://dictionary.apa.org/

American Sociology Association. (2018). *Culture*. https://www.asanet.org/topics/culture

Anderson, G. (2020, March 7). U.S. publishes new regulations on campus sexual assault. *Inside Higher Education.* https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2020/05/07/education-department-releases-final-title-ix-regulations

Anderson, J. R., Holland, E., Heldreth, C., & Johnson, S. P. (2018). Revisiting the jezebel stereotype: The impact of target race on sexual objectification. *Psychology of Women Quarterly, 42*(4), 461-476. https://doi.org/10.1177/0361684318791543

Arredondo, P., Toporek, R., Brown, S., Jones, J., Locke, D., Sanchez, J., & Stadler, H. (1996). Operationalization of the multicultural counseling competencies. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 24*, 42-78. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-1912.1996.tb00288.x

Association of Title IX Administrators (ATIXA). (2017). *Statement on September 22, 2017 dear colleague letter rescission and interim guidance.* https://atixa.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/2017-ATIXA-Public-Statement-on-DCL-Recission.pdf

At Health. (2013). *Why is there a compelling need for cultural competence?* https://athealth.com/topics/why-is-there-a-compelling-need-for-cultural-competence/

Azzopardi, C., & McNeill, T. (2016). From cultural competence to cultural consciousness: Transitioning to a critical approach to working across differences in social work. *Journal of Ethnic & Cultural Diversity in Social Work, 25*(4), 282-299. https://doi:10.1080/15313204.2016.1206494

Baldwin, J. (1963). *The fire next time.*

Baskarada, S. (2014). Qualitative case study guidelines. *The Qualitative Report, 19*(40), 1-18. https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol19/iss40/3

Bastian, B., Denson, T. F., & Haslam, N. (2013). The roles of dehumanization and moral outrage in retributive justice. *PLoS ONE, 8*(4), e61842. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0061842

Battle, S., & Wheeler, T. (2017). *Dear colleague letter: Federal guidance letter on transgender students.* http://ago.wv.gov/Documents/2017.02.24%20Trans%20letter.PDF

Bauer-Wolf, J. (2020). *Ed dept rescinds Clery Act guidelines.* https://www.highereddive.com/news/ed-dept-rescinds-clery-act-guidelines/586849/

Bennett, J. M. (1993). Cultural marginality: Identity issues in intercultural training. In R. M. Paige (Ed.), *Education for the intercultural experience* (pp. 109–135).

Bennett, M. (2014). *The developmental model of intercultural sensitivity.* https://www.idrinstitute.org/dmis/

Bennett, M. (2017). Development model of intercultural sensitivity. In Y. Kim (Ed), *International encyclopedia of intercultural communication.* https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318430742_Developmental_Model_of_Intercultural_Sensitivity

Betancourt, J. R., Green, A. R., & Carrillo, J. E. (2002). *Cultural competence in health care: Emerging frameworks and practical approaches.* The Commonwealth Fund. http://www.cmwf.org/programs/minority/betancourt_culturalcompetence_576.pdf

Bhawuk, D. P. & Brislin, R. (1992). The measurement of intercultural sensitivity using the concepts of individualism and collectivism. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, *16*(4), 413-436.

Block M. S. (2017a). *Trends in student affairs job postings.* https://www.higheredjobs.com/articles/articleDisplay.cfm?ID=646

Block M. S. (2017b). *The pros and cons of being a Title IX coordinator.* https://www.higheredjobs.com/articles/articleDisplay.cfm?ID=646

Bogdan, R., & Biklen, S. (2007). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theories and methods* (5th ed.). Allyn & Bacon.

Bonilla-Silva, E. (2006). *Racism without racists: Color-blind racism and the persistence of racial inequality in the United States* (2nd ed.).

Booth, A., Carroll, C., Ilott, I., Low, L. L., & Cooper, K. (2013). Desperately seeking dissonance: Identifying the disconfirming case in qualitative evidence synthesis. *Qualitative Health Research, 23,* 126–41.

Bordin, E. S. (1979). The generalizability of the psychoanalytic concept of the working alliance. *Psychotherapy Theory, Research, and Practice, 16,* 252-260. https://doi: 10.1037/h0085885

Bowleg, L. (2012). The problem with the phrase women and minorities: Intersectionality-an important theoretical framework for public health. *American Journal of Public Health, 102,* 1267–1273. htpps://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2012.300750

Bradford, L., Allen, M., & Beisser, K. R. (2000). An evaluation and meta- analysis of intercultural communication competence research. *World Communication, 29*(1), 28-51.

Briton, D. (1996). *The modern practice of adult education: A postmodern critique.* State University of New York Press.

Bresciani, M. (2008). Global competencies in student affairs/services professionals: A literature synthesis. *College Student Journal, 42*(3), 906.

Bronfenbrenner, U. (1981). *The ecology of human development: Experiments by nature and design.* Harvard University Press.

Brown, C. L. (1991). Campus diversity: Reeducating the student affairs professional for the multicultural academic environment. *College Student Affairs Journal, 10*(3), 18-25.

Brown, J. M., & Schmidt, N. A. (2016). Service-learning in undergraduate nursing education: Where is the reflection? *Journal of Professional Nursing, 32*(1), 48–53. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.profnurs.2015.05.001

Brown, M., Boateng, E. A., & Evans, C. (2016). Should I stay or should I go? A systematic review of factors that influence healthcare students' decisions around study abroad programmes. *Nurse Education Today, 39*, 63–71. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2015.12.024

Cabrera, N. L., Franklin, J. D., & Watson, J. S. (2017). *Whiteness in higher education: the invisible missing link in diversity and racial analyses*. https://doi.org/10.1002/aehe.20116

Calvillo, E., Clark, L., Ballantyne, J. E., Pacquiao, D., Purnell, L. D., & Villarruel, A. M. (2009). Cultural competency in baccalaureate nursing education. *Journal of Transcultural Nursing, 20*(2), 137-145.

Campinha-Bacote J. (2001). A model of practice to address cultural competence in rehabilitation nursing. *Rehabilitation Nursing, 26*(1), 8–11. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2048-7940.2001.tb02201.x

Castellanos, J., & Gloria, A. M. (2007). Research considerations and theoretical application for best practices in higher education: Latina/os achieving success. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 6*(4), 378-396. http://doi:10.1177/1538192707305347

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. (2020). *Preventing sexual violence.* https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/sexualviolence/fastfact.html

Christie, M., Carey, M., Robertson, A., & Grainger, P. (2015). Putting transformative learning theory into practice. *Australian Journal of Adult Learning, 55*(1), 9-30. https://search.proquest.com/docview/1675860133?accountid=10639

Clark, M. C., & Wilson, A. L. (1991). Context and rationality in Mezirow's theory of transformational learning. *Adult Education Quarterly, 41*(2), 75–91. https://doi.org/10.1177/0001848191041002002

Clery Center. (2020). *Summary of the Violence Against Women Act.* https://clerycenter.org/policy-resources/vawa/

Cohen, O., & Heinecke, A. (2018). Dialogue exhibitions: Putting transformative learning theory into practice. *The Museum Journal, 61*(2). https://doi.org/10.1111/cura.12254

Colby, S. L., & Ortman, J. M. (2015). Projections of the size and composition of the U.S. population: 2014 to 2060: population estimates and projections. file:///C:/Users/WTCCUS~1/AppData/Local/Temp/p25-1143.pdf

Constantine, M. G., Hage, S. M., Kindaichi, M. M., & Bryant, R. M. (2007). Social justice and multicultural issues: Implications for the practice and training of counselors and counseling psychologists. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 85*(1), 24-29. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6678.2007.tb00440.x

Cowan, G., & Campbell, R. R. (1994). Racism and sexism in interracial pornography. *Psychology of Women Quarterly, 18*, 323–338. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.1994.tb00459.x

Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). Sage Publications, Inc.

Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research.* (Laureate custom ed.). Pearson Education, Inc.

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage Publications, Inc.

Cross, T., Bazron, B., Dennis, K., & Isaacs, M. (1989). *Toward a culturally competent system of care* (Vol. 1). Georgetown University Center for Child and Human Development, CASSP Technical Assistance Center.

CUPA-HR. (2017). *Title IX and sexual harassment.* https://www.cupahr.org/knowledge-center/toolkits/title-ix/#toc-higher-ed-hr-perspective

Davenport, R. (2010). *From college counselor to "risk manager": The evolving nature of college counseling on today's campuses* (pp. 181-183). https://doi.org/10.1080/07448480903221244

Davis, E. (2020). *It's time to reform the Clery Act.* https://www.insidehighered.com/views/2020/05/15/clery-act-does-little-improve-campus-safety-even-during-pandemic-opinion.

Davis v. Monroe County Board of Education, 526 U.S. 629 (1999).

Deardorff, D. K., & Arasaratnam-Smith, L. A. (2017). *Intercultural competence in higher education: International approaches, assessment, and application.* http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&AuthType=ip,shib&db=nlebk&AN=1560736&site=ehost-live&custid=s5822723&ebv=EB&ppid=pp_iii

DelVecchio-Good, M., Willen, S. S., Hannah, S. D., Vickery, K., & Park, L. T. (2011). *Shattering culture: American medicine responds to cultural diversity*. Russell Sage Foundation. http://doi.org/10.7758/9781610447522

Denboba, D., & U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Health Services and Resources Administration. (1993). *MCHB/DSCSHCN guidance for competitive applications, maternal and child health improvement projects for children with special health care needs.*

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2011). *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Dickson, G. L., Chun, H., & Fernandez, I. T. (2016). The development and initial validation of the student measure of culturally responsive teaching. *Assessment for Effective Intervention, 41*(3), 141-154. https://doi.org/10.1177/1534508415604879

Dungy, G. J. (2003). Organization and functions of student affairs. In S. R. Komives, D. B. Woodward, & Associates (eds.), *Student services: A handbook for the profession* (4th ed., pp. 339-357). Jossey-Bass.

Duntley-Matos, R. (2014). Transformative complicity and cultural humility: De- and re-constructing higher education mentorship for under-represented groups. *Qualitative Sociology, 37*(4), 443-466. https://doi:10.1007/s11133-014-9289-5

Ebbers, L. H., & Henry, S. L. (1990). Cultural competence: A new challenge to student affairs professionals. *NASPA Journal*, *27*(4), 319-323.

Eells, G. T. & Rockland-Miller, H. S. (2011). Assessing and responding to disturbed and disturbing Students: Understanding the role of administrative teams in institutions of higher education. *Journal of College Student Psychotherapy, 25*(1), 8-23. https://doi.org10.1080/87568225.2011.532470

Erickson, C., & Orloff, L.E. (2014). *VAWA self-petitioner victim benefits under the Affordable Care Act (ACA)*. https://niwaplibrary.wcl.american.edu/wp-content/uploads/2015/PB-Qref-VAWAACA6.18.14.pdf

Ettling, D. (2006). Ethical demands of transformative learning. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, 2006*, 59–67. https://doi.org/10.1002/ace.208

Evans, E., & Chamberlain, P. (2015) Critical waves: Exploring feminist identity, discourse and praxis in western feminism. *Social Movement Studies, 14*(4), 396-409. https://doi.org/10.1080/14742837.2014.964199

Fay, L. L., & Kim, E. Y. (2017). Transformative design pedagogy: A place-based and studio-based exploration of culture. *Journal of Learning Spaces, 6*(2), 28-38. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1152772

Federal Register. (2014). *Violence Against Women Act.* https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2014/10/20/2014-24284/violence-against-women-act

Federal Register. (2020). *Rules and regulations.* https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/FR-2020-05-19/pdf/2020-10512.pdf

Foste, Z., & Irwin, L. (2020). Applying critical whiteness studies in college student development theory and research. *Journal of College Student Development, 61*(4), 439-455. https://doi.org/10.1353/csd.2020.0050

Frawley J., Russell G., & Sherwood J. (2020) Cultural competence and the higher education sector: A journey in the academy. In J. Frawley, G. Russell, & J. Sherwood (Eds.), *Cultural competence and the higher education sector.* https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-5362-2_1

Frisby, C. L., & O'Donohue, W. T. (2018). *Cultural competence in applied psychology: An evaluation of current status and future directions.* https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-78997-2

Gagnon, Y. C. (2010). *The case study as research method: A practical handbook.*

Garneau, A. B. (2016). Critical reflection in cultural competence development: A framework for undergraduate nursing education. *Journal of Nursing Education, 55*(3), 125-132. https://doi.org/10.3928/01484834-20160216-02

Gay, G. (2010). *Culturally responsive teaching: theory, research, and practice.* http://www.cwu.edu/teaching-learning/sites/cts.cwu.edu.teaching-learning/files/documents/CulturallyResponsiveTeaching_TheoryResearchandPractice,%20Geneva%20Gay.PDF

George, W. H., & Martinez, L. J. (2002). *Victim blaming in rape: effects of victim and perpetrator race, type of rape, and participant racism* https://doi.org/10.1111/1471-6402.00049

Georgetown University. (2005). *Cultural competence in health care: Is it important for people with chronic conditions?* Health Policy Institute. https://hpi.georgetown.edu/cultural/

Gervais, S. J., Holland, A. M., & Dodd, M. D. (2013). My eyes are up here: The nature of the objectifying gaze toward women. *Sex Roles, 69*, 557–570. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-013-0316-x

Gies, E. A. (2010). *A case study of cultural competency: The transformation of individuals and collective perception and practice.* https://search.proquest.com/docview/828353768?accountid=10639

Glaser, B., & Strauss, A. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory*. Chicago, IL: Aldine.

Goff, P. A., Eberhardt, J. L., Williams, M. J., & Jackson, M. C. (2008). Not yet human: Implicit knowledge, historical dehumanization, and contemporary consequences. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 94*, 292–306. https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-3514.94.2.292

Grant, C., & Osanloo, A. (2014). Understanding, selecting, and integrating a theoretical framework in dissertation research: creating the blueprint for your "house". *Administrative Issues Journal*, *4*(2), 4. https://dc.swosu.edu/aij/vol4/iss2/4

Gray, M., & Boddy, J. (2010). Making sense of the waves: Wipeout or still riding high? *Affilia, 25*(4), 368-389. https://doi.org/10.1177/0886109910384069

Greenholtz, J. (2000). Assessing cross-cultural competence in transnational education: The intercultural development inventory. *Higher Education in Europe, 25*(3), 411- 416. https://doi.org/10.1080/713669273

Guarnaccia, P. J., & Rodriguez, O. (1996). Concepts of culture and their role in the development of culturally competent mental health services. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 18*(4), 419–443. https://doi.org/10.1177/07399863960184001

Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). Competing paradigms in qualitative research. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, *2*(163-194), 105.

Hafferty, F. W., & Franks, R. (1994). The hidden curriculum, ethics teaching, and the structure of medical education. *Academic Medicine: Journal of the Association of American Medical Colleges, 69*(11), 861-71. https://doi.org/10.1097/00001888-199411000-00001

Hammer, M. R., Bennett, M. J., & Wiseman, R. (2003). Measuring intercultural sensitivity: The intercultural development inventory. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 27*(4), 421-443. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0147-1767(03)00032-4

Harper, S. R. (2012). Race without racism: How higher education researchers minimize racist institutional norms. *Review of Higher Education, 36*(1), 9-29. https://doi.org/10.1353/rhe.2012.0047

Hatzipanagos, S., & Russell, M. (2014). Developing an institutional strategic plan for open, distance and eLearning. ICT Leadership in Higher Education: Selected Readings. Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 License (international): http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/ by CEMCA, p. 38-43

Hays, D. G. (2020). Multicultural and social justice counseling competency research: Opportunities for innovation. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 98*(3), 331-344. https://doi.org/10.1002/jcad.12327

Hazelrigg, N. (2019). *Slow going on faculty diversity.* https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2019/07/02/little-progress-diversifying-faculty-ranks-study-finds-particularly-research

Holland, E., & Haslam, N. (2013). Worth the weight: The objectification of overweight versus thin targets. *Psychology of Women Quarterly, 37*, 462–468. https://doi.org/10.1177/0361684312474800

Holmes, M. (2000). Second wave feminism and the politics of relationships. *Women's Studies International Journal, 23*(1), 235–246. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-5395(00)00072-8

Hollinger, D. A. (1995). *Post ethnic America: Beyond multiculturalism*. Basic Books.

Hook, J. N., Davis, D. E., Owen, J., Worthington, E. L., Jr., & Utsey, S. O. (2013). Cultural humility: Measuring openness to culturally diverse clients. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 60*, 353–366. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0032595

Humphreys, D. (2021). *A moment of reckoning.* https://www.insidehighered.com/views/2021/06/21/academe-must-respond-backlash-against-critical-race-theory-opinion#.YgyyTN9sqhI.link

Johnson, Y. M., & Munch, S. (2009). Fundamental contradictions in cultural competence. *Social Work*, *54*(3), 220-31. http://search.proquest.com.jproxy.lib.ecu.edu/docview/215269546?accountid=10639

Jones, S. R., & McEwen, M. K. (2000). A conceptual model of multiple dimensions of identity. *Journal of College Student Development*, *41*, 405-414.

June, A. (2014). Overseeing sexual assault cases is now a full-time job. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, *61*(10), 13. http://chronicle.com/ issue/archive/?cid=UCHENAV2

Karp, D., & Sacks, C. (2014). *Student conduct, restorative justice, and student development: Findings from the STARR Project (Student Accountability and Restorative Research Project).* https://doi.org/10.1080/10282580.2014.915140

Keller, E. W., Hughes, S., & Hertz, G. (2011). A model for assessment and mitigation of threats on the college campus. *Journal of Educational Administration*, *49*(1), 76-94.

Kelly v. Yale University, CIVIL ACTION NO. 3:01-CV-1591 (United States District Court, D. Connecticut, 2003).

Kesselman, A., McNair, L. D., & Schniedewind, N. (Eds.) (2012). *Women: Images and realities. A multicultural anthology* (5th ed.).

Kirmayer, L. J. (2012). Rethinking cultural competence. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, *49*(2), 149–164. http://doi.org/10.1177/1363461512444673

Knight, J. S. (2020). *An education in the racial history of college and community*. https://www.insidehighered.com/advice/2020/12/01/place-based-faculty-development-about-racial-history-and-present-inequities#.Ygyw3LF5sS0.link

Know Your IX. (2020). *Title IX*. https://www.knowyourix.org/college-resources/title-ix/

Kohli, H. K., Huber, R. & Faul, A. C. (2010). Historical and theoretical development of culturally competent social work practice. *Journal of Teaching in Social Work, 30*(3), 252-271. https://doi.org/10.1080/08841233.2010.499091

Koss, M. P., Wilgus, J. K., & Williamsen, K. M. (2014). *Campus sexual misconduct: Restorative justice approaches to enhance compliance with Title IX guidance.* https://doi.org/10.1177/1524838014521500

Kuh, G. D. (2003). Organizational theory. In S. R. Komives, D. B. Woodard Jr. & Associates (Eds.), *Student services, a handbook for the profession* (4th ed., pp. 269-296). Jossey-Bass.

Kuk, L., & Banning, J. (2009). Student affairs preparation programs: A competency-based approach to assessment and outcomes. *College Student Journal*, *43*(2), 492.

Lange, E. (2004). Transformative and restorative learning: A vital dialectic for sustainable societies. *Adult Education Quarterly*, *54*, 121–139.

LeCompte, M. D., & Schensul, J. J. (1999). *Analyzing and interpreting ethnographic data.* Walnut Creek, California: AltaMira Press.

Lee, C. C. (2012). *Multicultural issues in counseling: New approaches to diversity* (4th ed.).

Lee, M. Y., & Greene, G. J. (2004). A teaching framework for transformative multicultural social work education. *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Diversity in Social Work*, *12*(3), 1-28. https://doi:10.1300/J051v12n03_01

Leung, K., Ang, S., & Tan, M. L. (2014). Intercultural competence. *Annual Review of Organizational Psychology and Organizational Behavior*, *1*(1), 489–519. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-orgpsych-031413-091229

Lewis, J., & Arnold, M. S. (1998). From multiculturalism to social action. In C. C. Lee & G. R. Walz (Eds.). *Social action: A mandate for counselors* (pp. 51-65). American Counseling Association.

Lhamon, C. (2014). *Questions and answers on Title IX and sexual violence.* https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/docs/qa-201404-title-ix.pdf

Lhamon, C., & Gupta, V. (2016). *Dear colleague letter on transgender students.* https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/letters/colleague-201605-title-ix-transgender.pdf

Lodico, M., Spaulding, D., & Voegtle, K. (2010). *Methods in educational research: From theory to practice* (2nd ed.). Jossey-Bass. https://doi.org/10.33524/cjar.v14i3.103

Love, P. (2003). *Considering a career in student affairs*. http://acpa. nche.edu/c12/career.htm

Major, T. E., & Mangope, B. (2014). Multicultural competence in student affairs: The case of the university of Botswana. *Journal of Student Affairs in Africa, 2*(1), 23. https://doi:10.14426/jsaa.v2i1.61

Manzon M. (2007) Comparing places. In M. Bray, B. Adamson, & M. Mason (Eds.). *Comparative education research.* CERC Studies in Comparative Education. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-6189-9_4

Martin, C. (2015). Sexual violence training is not a one-size-fits-all approach: Culturally sensitive prevention programming for international students. *The Journal of Campus Title IX Compliance and Best Practices, 1*, 4-10. https://doi:10.17732/CAMPUSIX2015/2.

Martin, M., & Vaughn, B. (2007). Cultural competence: The nuts and bolts of diversity & inclusion. *The Diverse Officer Magazine*. https://diversityofficermagazine.com/cultural-competence/cultural-competence-the-nuts-bolts-of-diversity-inclusion-2/

McCarthy, C. (2017). Review strategies, lessons learned for launching, nurturing title IX office. *Student Affairs Today, 20*(5), 1-3. https://doi:10.1002/say.30362

McEwen, M. K., & Roper, L. D. (1994). Incorporating multiculturalism into student affairs preparation programs: Suggestions from the literature. *Journal of College Student Development, 35*(1), 46-53.

Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education*. Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. B. (2004). The role of cognitive development in transformational learning theory. *Adult Education Quarterly, 55*(1), 60–68. https://doi.org/10.1177/0741713604268891

Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. B., Caffarella, R. S., & Baumgartner, L. M. (2007). *Learning in adulthood.* Jossey-Bass.

Mertens, D. M. (2010). *Research and evaluation in education and psychology: Integrating diversity with quantitative, qualitative, and mixed methods* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Mezirow, J. (1978). *Education for perspective transformation: Women's re-entry programs in community colleges.* Teachers College, Columbia University.

Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformative dimensions of adult learning.* Jossey-Bass.

Mezirow, J. (1996). Contemporary paradigms of learning. *Adult Education Quarterly, 46,* 158–172. https://doi.org/10.1177/074171369604600303

Mezirow, J. (2000). Learning to think like an adult. In J. Mezirow (Eds.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress* (pp. 3-34). Jossey-Bass.

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Modood, T. (2007). *Multiculturalism.* John Wiley & Sons, Ltd. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781405165518.wbeosm129.pub2

Moore, K. (2000). Successful and effective professional development. *Early Childhood Today, 15*(3), 14-17.

Moswela, E., & Mukhopadhyay, S. (2011). Asking for too much? The voices of students with disabilities in Botswana. *Disability & Society, 26*(3), 307–319.

Mueller, J. A., & Pope, R. L. (2001). The relationship between multicultural competence and white racial consciousness among student affairs practitioners. *Journal of College Student Development, 42*(2), 133.

Nassar-McMillan, S. C. (2014). A framework for cultural competence, advocacy, and social justice: Applications for global multiculturalism and diversity. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Guidance, 14*, 103–118. doi:10.1007/s10775- 014-9265-3

National Association of Student Personnel Administrators. (2018). *About student affairs.* https://www.naspa.org/about/about-student-affairs/about-student-affairs
disabilities in Botswana. *Disability & Society, 26*(3), 307–319.
National Center for Cultural Competence. (2010). *The compelling need for cultural and linguistic competence.* https://nccc.georgetown.edu/foundations/need.php

National Center for Educational Statistics. (2020a). *The condition of education: Undergraduate enrollment.* https://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/indicator_cha.asp

National Center for Educational Statistics. (2020b). *The condition of education: Characteristics of postsecondary faculty.* https://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/indicator_csc.asp

National Education Association. (2007). *C.A.R.E. strategies for closing the achievement gaps.* http://www.nea.org/assets/docs/mf_CAREbook0804.pdf

National Education Association. (2022). *ESP professional growth continuum.* www.nea.org/professional-excellence/professional-learning/esps/continuum

National Sexual Violence Center. (2012). *Core competencies for sexual violence prevention practitioners.* https://www.nsvrc.org/sites/default/files/Publications_NSVRC_Core-competencies-sexual-violence-prevention-practitioners.pdf

Neelakantan, S. (2020, May 6). *New Department of Education sexual assault investigation rules speak controversy*. https://diverseeducation.com/article/176590/

Newport, F. (2016). *Five key findings on religion in the U.S.* https://news.gallup.com/poll/232223/religious-regions.aspx

Newport, F. (2018). *In US, estimate of LGBT population rises to 4.5%.* https://news.gallup.com/poll/234863/estimate-lgbt-population-rises.aspx

Norwich, B. (2019). *Thinking about the nature of educational research: Going beyond superficial theoretical scripts.* https://doi.org/10.1002/rev3.3182

Norman, J. (2018). *The religious regions of the U.S.* https://news.gallup.com/poll/232223/religious-regions.aspx

Okoro, C. A., Hollis, N. D., Cyrus, A. C., & Griffin-Blake, S. (2016). Prevalence of disabilities and healthcare access by disability status and type among adults -United States, 2016. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report, 67*, 882–887. http://dx.doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm6732a3external icon

Owen, L. (2016). *Emerging from physiotherapy practice, masters-level education and returning to practice: A critical reflection based on Mezirow's Transformative Learning Theory.* https://doi.org/10.19043/ipdj.62.011

Owen, S. (2014, July). Teacher professional learning communities: Going beyond contrived collegiality toward challenging debate and collegial learning and professional growth. *Journal of Adult Learning, 54*(2), 55-76.

Pallant, J. (2007). *SPSS survival manual: A step by step guide to data analysis using SPSS for windows* (3rd ed.). McGaw-Hill-Open University Press.

Palmer, J., & Carter, J. (2014). Working in the border zone: Developing cultural competence in higher education for a globalized world. *Knowledge Cultures, 2*(4), 25–48. https://eprints.usq.edu.au/28142/1/Palmer_Carter.pdf

Passeggi, T. (2002). *Title IX and gender equity in intercollegiate athletics: Is it time for a change?* http://www.law.uoregon.edu/faculty/cforell/docs/titleix.pdf

Patton M. Q. (1999). Enhancing the quality and credibility of qualitative analysis. *Health Services Research, 34*(5 Pt 2), 1189–1208. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1089059/

Paul, C. P. (2016). *Title IX coordinators in dual roles: Challenges, experiences, and sources of support.* https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/ba08/e2ee1c1d6f136dfac03543e3e102c7c8b19d.pdf

Pecci, A., Frawley J., & Nguyen T. (2020). On the critical, morally driven, self-reflective agents of change and transformation: A literature review on culturally competent leadership in higher education. In J. Frawley, G. Russell, & J. Sherwood (Eds.) *Cultural competence and the higher education sector*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-5362-2_5

Pederson, P. B. (1988). *A handbook for developing multicultural awareness.* American Association for Counseling and Development.

Pedersen, P. B. (1991). Multiculturalism as a generic approach to counseling. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 70*(1), 6. http://search.proquest.com.jproxy.lib.ecu.edu/docview/219115320?accountid=10639

Perez, J., & Quilantan, B. (2020, March 3). How the new DeVos rules on sexual assault will shock schools and students. *Politico*. https://www.politico.com/news/2020/03/06/betsy-devos-school-sexual-assault-rules-122401

Perez, M., & Luquis, R. (2008). *Cultural competence in health education and health promotion* (1st ed.). Jossey-Bass.

Pew Research Center. (2017). *Religious landscape study.* https://www.pewforum.org/religious-landscape-study/

Phillips, D., & Schweisfurth, M. (2006). *Comparative and international education: An introduction to theory, method and practice*. https://doi:10.1016/j.ijedudev.2008.08.004

Polit, D. F., & Beck, C. T. (2012). *Nursing research: Generating and assessing evidence for nursing practice.* Lippincott Williams and Wilkins.

Ponterotto, J. G., Casas J. M., Suzuki, L. A., & Alexander, C. M. (Eds.). (2010). *Handbook of multicultural counseling* (3rd ed.). Sage Publications.

Pope, R. L., & Reynolds, A. L. (1997). Student affairs core competencies: Integrating multicultural awareness, knowledge, and skills. *Journal of College Student Development, 38*(3), 266. http://search.proquest.com.jproxy.lib.ecu.edu/docview/195177997?accountid=10639

Pope, R. L., & Pope, R. L. (2014). *Creating multicultural change on campus* (1st ed.). Jossey-Bass.

Pope-Davis, D., Coleman, H., Liu, W., & Toporek, R. (2003). *Handbook of multicultural competencies: In counseling & psychology* (pp. 591–606). Sage Publications, Inc. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781452231693.n37

Pruitt, S. (2016). Why we're suing over Obama's transgender power play? *The Wall Street Journal.* https://www.wsj.com/articles/why-were-suing-over-obamas-transgender-power-play-1464734185

Ratts, M. J. (2009). Social justice counseling: Toward the development of a "fifth force" among counseling paradigms. *Journal of Humanistic Counseling, Education, and Development, 48*, 160-172.

Ratts, M. J., D'Andrea, M., & Arredondo, P. (2004). Social justice counseling: Fifth "force" in the field. *Counseling Today*, *47*(1), 28-30.

Ratts, M. J., DeKruyf, L., & Chen-Hayes, S. F. (2007). The ACA advocacy competencies: A social justice advocacy framework for professional school counselors. *Professional School Counseling*, *11*, 90-97.

Ratts, M. J., Singh, A.A., Butler, S. K., Nassar-McMillan, S. & McCullough, J. R. (2016a). Multicultural and social justice counseling competencies: Guidelines for the counseling profession. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development.* https://doi.org/10.1002/jmcd.12035

Ratts, M. J., Singh, A.A., Butler, S. K., Nassar-McMillan, S., & McCullough, J. R. (2016b). Multicultural and social justice counseling competencies: Practical applications in counseling. *Counseling Today.* https://ct.counseling.org/2016/01/multicultural-and-social-justice-counseling-competencies-practical-applications-in-counseling/

Reynolds, C. L., Leininger, M. M., & Leininger, M. M. (1993). *Madeleine Leininger: Cultural care diversity and universality theory*. Sage Publications.

Riccardi, P. (2010). Male rape: the silent victim and the gender of the listener. *Primary care Companion to the Journal of Clinical Psychiatry*, *12*(6), PCC.10l00993. https://doi.org/10.4088/PCC.10l00993whi

Royce, T. (2020). Unrapeable?: Rape myths and fat women. In G. C. Becker & A. T. Dionne (Eds.), *RAPE CULTURE 101: Programming change* (pp.191-204). Demeter Press. https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv12sdxdg.14

Roysircar, G., Sandhu, D. S., & Bibbons, V. E. (2003). *Multicultural competencies: A guidebook of practices.* Association for Multicultural Counseling & Development. Ringgold Inc.

Rubel, D., & Ratts, M. (2007). Diversity and social justice issues in counseling and psychotherapy. In D. Capuzzi & D. R. Gross (eds.). *Counseling and psychotherapy: Theories and interventions* (4th ed.), pp. 47-67. Pearson Education.

Safran, J. D., & Muran, J. C. (2000). *Negotiating the therapeutic alliance.* Guilford Press.

Sage. (2020). *Counting LGBT communities SAGE and the 2020 census.* https://www.sageusa.org/counting-lgbt-communities-sage-and-the-2020-census/

Saldaña, J. (2016). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. London; Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.

Sander, J. B., Hernández Finch, M. E., & Newell, M. (2016). Introduction to special issue on multicultural competence in consultation. *Journal of Educational and Psychological Consultation, 26*(3). https://doi.org/10.1080/10474412.2015.1089777

Sapp, M., Farrell, W. C., Johnson, J. H., & Hitchcock, K. (1999). Attitudes toward rape among African American male and female college students. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 77*, 204–208.

Schubert-Madsen, C., & Schubert, G. (1991). Gender discrimination in athletics. *North Dakota Law Review, 67*(2).

Schuck, P. H. (2016). A bathroom of one's own? *The New York Times*. http://www.nytimes.com/2016/05/18/opinion/a-bathroom-of-ones-own.html?_r=0

Schuster, J. (2017). Why the personal remained political: Comparing second and third wave perspectives on everyday feminism. *Social Movement Studies, 16*(6), 647-659. https://doi.org/10.1080/14742837.2017.1285223

Sieben, L. (2011). Education Dept. Issues New Guidance for Sexual-Assault Investigations. *The Chronicle of Higher Education.* https://www.chronicle.com/article/education-dept-issues-new-guidance-for-sexual-assault-investigations/

Singh, A. A., & Salazar, C. F. (2010). Six considerations for social justice group work. *The Journal for Specialists in Group Work, 35*, 308–319. https://doi.org/10.1080/01933922.2010.492908

Sleath, E., & Bull, R. (2010). Male rape victim and perpetrator blaming. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, *25*(6), 969–988. https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260509340534

Smialek, J. (2020). *Poor Americans hit hardest by job losses amid lockdowns, fed says.* https://www.nytimes.com/2020/05/14/business/economy/coronavirus-jobless-unemployment.html

Smialek, J., Kliff, S., & Rappeport, A. (2020). *U.S. poverty hit a record low before the pandemic recession.* https://www.nytimes.com/2020/09/15/business/economy/poverty-record-low-prior-to-pandemic.html

Smiley, C., & Fakunle, D. (2016). From "brute" to "thug:" the demonization and criminalization of unarmed Black male victims in America. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment*, *26*(3-4), 350–366. https://doi.org/10.1080/10911359.2015.1129256

Smith, R. A. (2011). Title IX and governmental reform in women's athletics. In B. G. Rader & R. Roberts (Eds.), *Pay for play a history of big-time college athletic reform* (pp. 141-150). University of Illinois Press.

Spanierman, L. B., Oh, E., Heppner, P. P., Neville, H. A., Mobley, M., Wright, C. V., Frank, R. D., & Navarro, R. (2011). *The multicultural teaching competency scale: Development and initial validation.* https://doi.org/10.1177/0042085910377442

Srivastava, K., Chaudhury, S., Bhat, P. S., & Sahu, S. (2017). Misogyny, feminism, and sexual harassment. *Industrial Psychology Journal*, *26*(2), 111–113. https://doi.org/10.4103/ipj.ipj_32_18

Staller, K. (2010). Qualitative research. In N. Salkind (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of research design* (pp. 1,159-1,164). SAGE Publications, Inc.

Strange, C. C. (2003). Dynamics of campus environments. In S. R. Komives & D. B. Woodard, *Student services: A handbook for the profession* (4th ed.), pp. 297-316. Jossey-Bass.

Sue, D. W. (2001). Multidimensional facets of cultural competence. *The Counseling Psychologist, 29*(6), 790–821. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000001296002

Sue, D. W., Arredondo, P., & McDavis, R. J. (1992). Multicultural counseling competencies and standards: A call to the profession. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 70*, 477-486. https://doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1992.tb01642.x

Sue, D. W., Bernier, J. E., Durran, A., Feinberg, L., Pedersen, P., Smith, E. J., & Vasquez-Nuttall, E. (1982). Position paper: Cross-cultural counseling competencies. *The Counseling Psychologist, 10,* 45-52. https://doi.org/

Sue, D. W., & Sue, D. (2008). Counseling the culturally diverse: Theory and practice (5th ed.). John Wiley & Sons.

Tausig, J. E., & Freeman, E. W. (1988). The next best thing to being there: Conducting the clinical research interview by telephone. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry, 58*(3), 418–27.

Taylor, E. W. (2007). An update of transformative learning theory: A critical review of the empirical research (1999-2005). *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 26*, 173–191. https://doi.org/10.1080/02601370701219475

Taylor, E. W. (2008). Transformative learning theory. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 2008, 5–15. https://doi.org/10.1002/ace.301

Taylor, U. (1998). The historical evolution of black feminist theory and praxis. *Journal of Black Studies, 29*(2), 234. http://www.jstor.org/stable/2668091

The National Association of Social Workers. (2015). *Standards and indicators of cultural competence in social work practice.* https://www.socialworkers.org/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=PonPTDEBrn4%3D&portalid=0

The National Sexual Violence Center. (2012). *Core competencies for sexual violence prevention practitioners.* https://www.nsvrc.org/sites/default/files/2012-07/Publications_NSVRC_Core-competencies-sexual-violence-prevention-practitioners.pdf

The NCHERM Group. (2014). *An open letter to higher education about sexual violence from Brett Sokolow, Esq. and the NCHERM Group Partners.* https://cdn.atixa.org/website-media/atixa.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/12194135/An-Open-Letter-from-The-The NCHERM-Group-copy.pdf

The Office of Postsecondary Education. (2020). *Campus safety and security.* https://ope.ed.gov/campussafety/

Tillman, D., Hof, D., Chasek, C., & Dinsmore, J. (2014). *Title IX and the Clery Act: What counselor educators must know.* https://www.counseling.org/docs/default-source/vistas/article_26.pdf?sfvrsn=a4a17c2c_10

Toporek, R. L., Gerstein, L. H., Fouad, N. A., Roysircar, G., & Israel, T. (2006). *Handbook for social justice in counseling psychology: Leadership, vision, and action.* Sage Publications.

Tortumluoglu, G. (2006). *The implications of transcultural nursing models in the provision of culturally competent care.* http://docshare04.docshare.tips/files/23405/234059868.pdf

Turner, J. S. (2011). Sex and the spectacle of music videos: An examination of the portrayal of race and sexuality in music videos. *Sex Roles, 64*, 173-191. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-010-9766-6

United Nations General Assembly. (1948). *Universal declaration of human rights.* http://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/

Unzueta, M. M., & Lowery, B. S. (2008). Defining racism safely: The role of self-image maintenance on White Americans' conceptions of racism. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology, 44*(6), 1491-1497. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jesp.2008.07.011

U. S. Census Bureau. (2019). *Income, poverty and health insurance coverage in the United States: 2019.* https://www.census.gov/newsroom/press-releases/2020/income-poverty.html

U. S. Census Bureau. (2020). *Anniversary of Americans With Disabilities Act: July 26, 2020.* https://data.census.gov/cedsci/table?t=Disability&tid=ACSST1Y2018.S1810&hidePreview=true

U. S. Department of Education. (2017a). *Department of education issues new interim guidance on campus sexual misconduct.* https://www.ed.gov/news/press-releases/department-education-issues-new-interim-guidance-campus-sexual-misconduct

U. S. Department of Education. (2017b). *Dear colleague letter on campus sexual misconduct.* https://content.govdelivery.com/accounts/USED/bulletins/1b8ba66

U. S. Department of Education. (2018). *Secretary DeVos: Proposed Title IX Rule Provides Clarity for Schools, Support for Survivors, and Due Process Rights for All.* https://www.ed.gov/news/press-releases/secretary-devos-proposed-title-ix-rule-provides-clarity-schools-support-survivors-and-due-process-rights-all

U. S. Department of Education. (2019). *Secretary Devos levies largest-ever Clery fine against Michigan State University, requires major corrective action following systemic failure to address sexual abuse.* https://www.ed.gov/news/press-releases/secretary-devos-levies-largest-ever-clery-fine-against-michigan-state-university-requires-major-corrective-action-following-systemic-failure-address-sexual-abuse

U. S. Department of Education. (2020a). *Secretary DeVos takes historic action to strengthen Title IX protections for all students.* https://www.ed.gov/news/press-releases/secretary-devos-takes-historic-action-strengthen-title-ix-protections-all-students

U. S. Department of Education. (2020b). *Title IX and sex discrimination.* https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/docs/tix_dis.html

U. S. Department of Education. (2020c). *Questions and answers regarding the department's final Title IX rule*. https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/docs/qa-titleix-20200904.pdf

U. S. Department of Education. (2020d). *Schools must post important information regarding Title IX on school websites under the new Title IX rule.* https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/blog/20200518.html

U. S. Department of Education. (2020e). *The definition of sexual harassment under the Title IX rule provides clarity to schools.* https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/blog/index.html

U. S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (2020). *Discrimination by type.* https://www.eeoc.gov/

Vail, K. (2019). The failings of Title IX for survivors of sexual violence: Utilizing restorative justice on college campuses. *Washington Law Review, 94*(4), 2,085-2,118. https://search.proquest.com/docview/2355874217?accountid=10639

Vera, E. M., & Speight, S. L. (2003). Multicultural competence, social justice, and counseling psychology: Expanding our roles. *The Counseling Psychologist, 31*, 253-272. https://doi:10.1177/0011000003031003001

Vespa, J., Medina, L., & Armstrong, D. (2020). *Demographic turning points for the United States: Population projections for 2020 to 2060 population estimates and projections current population reports.* https://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/library/publications/2020/demo/p25-1144.pdf

Viki, G. T., Fullerton, I., Raggett, H., Tait, F., & Wiltshire, S. (2012). The role of dehumanization in attitudes toward the social exclusion and rehabilitation of sex offenders. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology, 42*, 2349–2367. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1559-1816. 2012.00944.x

Wade-Gravett, N. (1996). *Perceptions of California community college presidents, athletic directors and head coaches regarding compliance with Title IX of the Education Amendments Act of 1972.* http://scholarworks.uno.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2795&context=td

White, A. M., Strube, M. J., & Fisher, S. (1998). A black feminist model of rape myth acceptance: Implications for research and antirape advocacy in black communities. *Psychology of Women Quarterly, 22*(2), 157-175. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.1998.tb00148.x

White, R. T., & Sharpley-Whiting, T.D. (1997). *Spoils of war: Women of color, cultures, and revolutions.*

Wilson, R. (2014). Why colleges are on the hook for sexual assault. *Chronicle of Higher Education.* http://chronicle.com/ article/Why-Colleges-Are-on-the-Hook/146943

Yan, M. C., & Wong, Y. R. (2005). Rethinking self-awareness in cultural competence: Toward a dialogic self in cross-cultural social work. *Families in Society, 86*(2), 181-188.

Yilmaz, K. (2013). Comparison of quantitative and qualitative research traditions: Epistemological, theoretical, and methodological differences. *European Journal of Education, 48*(2), 311-325. https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12014

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Zanchetta, M. S., Bailey, A., Kolisnyk, O., Baku, L., Schwind, J., Osino, E., Aksenchuk-Metersky, K., Mehari, N., Babalola, O., Christopher, J., Hassan, A., Leong, N., Mohamed, M., Nemhbard-Wedderbrun, P., Rodrigues, A., Sales, R., Salvador-Watts, L., Santiago, L., Sizto, T., & Yu, L. (2017). Mentors' and mentees' intellectual-partnership through the lens of the Transformative Learning Theory. *Nurse Education in Practice*, *25*, 111-120. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nepr.2017.05.009

APPENDIX A: INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD APPROVAL

EAST CAROLINA UNIVERSITY
University & Medical Center Institutional Review Board
4N-64 Brody Medical Sciences Building· Mail Stop 682
600 Moye Boulevard · Greenville, NC 27834
Office **252-744-2914** · Fax **252-744-2284** · **rede.ecu.edu/umcirb/**

Notification of Exempt Certification

From: Social/Behavioral IRB

To: Laura Bethea

CC: David Siegel

Date: 3/11/2021

Re: UMCIRB 21-000311
Change Agents in a Multicultural World

I am pleased to inform you that your research submission has been certified as exempt on 3/10/2021. This study is eligible for Exempt Certification under category # 2ab.

It is your responsibility to ensure that this research is conducted in the manner reported in your application and/or protocol, as well as being consistent with the ethical principles of the Belmont Report and your profession.

This research study does not require any additional interaction with the UMCIRB unless there are proposed changes to this study. Any change, prior to implementing that change, must be submitted to the UMCIRB for review and approval. The UMCIRB will determine if the change impacts the eligibility of the research for exempt status. If more substantive review is required, you will be notified within five business days.

Document	Description
Consent Form (0.02)	Consent Forms
Dissertation Proposal (0.01)	Study Protocol or Grant Application
Draft Script/Questions (0.01)	Interview/Focus Group Scripts/Questions
Draft Script/Questions (0.01)	Recruitment Documents/Scripts
Email for Participation Request & Consent (0.01)	Recruitment Documents/Scripts
Full Consent Form (0.01)	Recruitment Documents/Scripts

For research studies where a waiver or alteration of HIPAA Authorization has been approved, the IRB states that each of the waiver criteria in 45 CFR 164.512(i)(1)(i)(A) and (2)(i) through (v) have been met. Additionally, the elements of PHI to be collected as described in items 1 and 2 of the Application for Waiver of Authorization have been determined to be the minimal necessary for the specified research.
The Chairperson (or designee) does not have a potential for conflict of interest on this study.

IRB00000705 East Carolina U IRB #1 (Biomedical) IORG0000418
IRB00003781 East Carolina U IRB #2 (Behavioral/SS) IORG0000418

APPENDIX B: INTERVIEW PROTOCOL

EAST CAROLINA UNIVERSITY, GREENVILLE
Interview Protocol

Comparative Study on Cultural Competence Training for Title IX Coordinators

Video Conferencing: Microsoft Teams
Audio Recording Devices: iPhone and/or IPad (voice memo)

I. Researcher introductions

   a. Express gratitude for participant's time and participation.

   b. Review the study's overview to include the purpose, design, informed consent, ethical considerations, confidentiality, and follow-up review of interview transcript.

   c. Discuss reminders to turn off/mute devices, including cell phones and office phones, offer anecdotal, descriptive responses, and ask for clarification as needed.

   d. Ask if clarification is needed or if there are any questions.

II. Participant's introductions

   a. Background

   b. Demographics

III. Interview questions and prompts

   A. Although you offer an array of training for Title IX Coordinators, the forthcoming questions specifically target your cultural competency training. Walk me through the steps taken in the program development process.

      a. Ask the following questions, if not addressed by the interviewee:

         i. What conceptual framework was used when designing this training?

         ii. What were the specific themes explored?

B. What are the main factors contributing to training implementation?

a. Ask the following questions, if not addressed by the interviewee:

i. What specialized programs and/or resources were used to support implementation?

C. By what means do you evaluate the level of impact of your training?

a. Ask the following questions, if not addressed by the interviewee:

i. What specific tools and/or resources do you use for evaluation?

ii. How do you define successful outcomes?

1. How do you incorporate these results into your programming?

D. What factors have impacted the evolution of the training?

a. Ask the following questions, if not addressed by the interviewee:

i. How do you envision your training expanding?

ii. What trends influence your training's content, context, and delivery?

iii. What experienced and anticipated challenges does your organization face with regards to program development, delivery, and implementation?

IX. Closing

1. Offer gratitude for participation.
2. Inform of the transcript review request during a one-week period. No response indicates an automatic acceptance.
3. Answer any questions.
4. Conclude the interview session.

APPENDIX C: STUDY INFORMATION GUIDE FOR INTERVIEWS

EAST CAROLINA UNIVERSITY, GREENVILLE
Study Information Guide for Interviews

Comparative Study on Cultural Competence Training for Title IX Coordinators

Principal Investigator: Laura Bethea, a doctoral student in the Educational Leadership Program at East Carolina University, Greenville, NC, is conducting a research study.

Dissertation Chairperson: Dr. David Siegel, Professor, Department of Educational Leadership, East Carolina University

Your participation in this research study is strictly voluntary. You were selected as a potential participant because of this study's following eligibility criteria as a knowledgeable representative of your professional development/training program.

Purpose of the study
The purpose of this research study is to explore ways in which cultural competence training programs for Title IX Coordinators in higher education develop and evolve. Three cultural competence training programs will be explored in this qualitative comparative research study. This body of work serves to promote the ultimate goal of inclusion and respect for all stakeholders in this process. Data gathered in this research study may offer insight into the means by which training programs and continuing education opportunities prepare and sustain cultural competence for Title IX Coordinators.

Process
If you agree to participate in this study, your participation would consist of an individualized interview for an estimated 60-90 minutes. The private location, such as an office or conference room, via videoconferencing would be preferable for you to ensure privacy, the prevention of potential interruptions, and confidentiality with your work with clientele and employer. Additionally, requests for a secure, offsite location away from your place of employment will be considered.

Audio Recordings
Your interview will be audio recorded and then transcribed verbatim. You will be able to review for accuracy within two weeks of the interview and allowed the opportunity to elaborate and/or clarify any information within a one-week period.

Confidentiality
As a participant in this study, any identifiable information will be kept confidential. In maintaining notes for the interview, only your initials will be included on all electronic files with a master key in a password protected Google Drive for my exclusive access. All data and identifiable data will be destroyed at the conclusion of this study. When sharing anecdotes in reference to clientele, colleagues, and or place of employment, participants are requested to not use any names to maintain privacy and confidentiality.

Benefits to participation
By participating in this research study, you contribute towards the literature as well as assist in reformation of cultural competence training for Title IX Coordinators.

Rights as a participant
You may choose to decline answering any question asked during the interview and still remain in the study with no penalties. Also, you may choose to withdraw your consent and withdraw participation at time.

Questions
If you have any questions, concerns, or comments about this research study, you can contact me directly at betheal03@students.ecu.edu or 919-599-7796. You may also contact my dissertation chairperson, David Siegel at siegeld@ecu.edu or 252-328-2828 and East Carolina University's IRB at umcirb@ecu.edu or 252-744-2914.